

Contribution to the Focus chapter of the Fundamental Rights Report 2022: Social rights and equality in light of the recovery from the COVID-19 pandemic.

Croatia
January 2022

Centre for Peace Studies, BaBe, Human Rights House Zagreb

Authors: Klara Horvat, Sara Lalić, Anja Mihajlović

DISCLAIMER: This document was commissioned under contract as background material for comparative analysis by the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA) for the project 'Social rights and equality in light of the recovery from the COVID-19 pandemic'. The information and views contained in the document do not necessarily reflect the views or the official position of the FRA. The document is made publicly available for transparency and information purposes only and does not constitute legal advice or legal opinion.

Contents

1	Measures implemented to foster social rights and equal treatment in the recovery from the	
pan	demic	3
2	Tools or mechanisms to monitor the effectiveness of national schemes to foster social rights	
and	equal treatment in the recovery from the pandemic	12



1 Measures implemented to foster social rights and equal treatment in the recovery from the pandemic

Name of the measure in English	C3.1 R1-I2: Construction, upgrading, reconstruction and equipping of primary schools for single shift and full-day teaching
Name of the measure in the national language(s)	C3.1. R1-I2 Izgradnja, dogradnja, rekonstrukcija i opremanje osnovnih škola za potrebe jednosmjenskog rada i cjelodnevne nastave
Reference document for the measure	Croatia, Government of the Republic of Croatia (Vlada Republike Hrvatske), National Recovery and Resilience Plan 2021 - 2026 (Nacionalni plan oporavka i otpornosti 2021 2026.)
Include an url, where available	
Social rights covered by the measure	 right to education (Article 14) the rights of the child (Article 24)
Delete as appropriate	
Multiple answers possible, but preference should be given to measures that apply to one discrete right	
Population group(s) covered by	- Children and youth
the measure	- Individuals from disadvantaged socio-economic backgrounds (especially persons in risk
Delete as appropriate	of poverty and social exclusion, recipients of minimum income benefits, marginalised Roma communities, persons living in rural areas etc.)
Multiple answers possible, but preference should be given to measures that apply to discrete population groups	

Summary description of how the measure applies to the population group(s)

This measure envisages an investment in infrastructure (construction of new primary schools and upgrading, reconstruction and equipping of existing schools) of primary schools in order to introduce single shift organization of primary education and full day teaching. Currently, majority (60%) of primary school pupils attend schools in two shifts, which in practice means that half of a school's pupils attend school in the morning and half in the afternoon, interchangeably. The aim of the measure is providing better conditions for learning and teaching, and in this way, it is aimed at solving the problems such as low level of literacy, especially for the pupils of weaker socio-economic status.¹

This applies to the group of children and youth, as they are the ones that attend primary education and will benefit from introduction of single shift and full day teaching. This will particularly benefit pupils of lower socio-economic status (including Roma population) and pupils with difficulties in learning, as they will have an opportunity to fulfil their school obligations (homework, studying etc.) and extracurricular activities in the school with the support of competent school staff and using school equipment.

This measure also applies to their parents, especially individuals from disadvantaged socio-economic backgrounds (especially persons in risk of poverty and social exclusion, recipients of minimum income benefits, marginalised Roma communities, persons living in rural areas etc.), as their children will receive the needed support in school and they will have more time for quality time with their children.

Summary description of how the measure will impact (positively or negatively) social rights and equal treatment in the recovery

The measure will positively affect the right to education and equal treatment in the recovery. According to the National Recovery and Resilience Plan, the outcomes of education, such as the level of mathematical literacy and reading literacy, are in correlation with socio-economic status of pupils.² At the same, time, pupils in Croatia spend significantly less hours in primary schools, and 57% of primary school pupils attend two shifts, while about 3% of pupils attend three shifts and only 40% of pupils attend single shift learning.³ Investment in school infrastructure would therefore allow more schools to organize single shift learning and full-day teaching, as, according to the National Recovery and Resilience Plan, international research has shown that the pupils of weaker socio-economic status benefit the most from longer hours in school. This will also affect equal treatment, as not all students have adequate additional

¹ Croatia, Government of the Republic of Croatia (Vlada Republike Hrvatske), National Recovery and Resilience Plan 2021 - 2026 (Nacionalni plan oporavka i otpornosti 2021. - 2026.)

² Croatia, Government of the Republic of Croatia (Vlada Republike Hrvatske), National Recovery and Resilience Plan 2021-2026 (Nacionalni plan oporavka i otpornosti 2021. - 2026.)

³ Croatia, Government of the Republic of Croatia (*Vlada Republike Hrvatske*), National Recovery and Resilience Plan 2021-2026 (*Nacionalni plan oporavka i otpornosti 2021. - 2026.*) and and Croatia, Ministry of Science and Education (*Ministarstvo znanosti i obrazovanja*), Strategic Framework for Introduction of Full Day Teaching (*Strateški okvir za uvođenje cjelodnevne nastave*)

	support in learning from their parents or access to private instructions and in introduction of full days learning this would significantly change. The National Recovery and Resilience Plan explicitly mentions Roma children as beneficiaries of this measure, as full day learning could overcome lack of appropriate housing conditions and necessary equipment. Children with disabilities are also mentioned as possible beneficiaries of this measure, as the upgrading and construction of schools should consider architectural accessibility.
Summary description of the extent to which the measure foresees the provision of enabling social services	Not applicable
Entity or organisation responsible to implement the measure	Ministry of Science and Education
Duration of the measure	July 2021 - August 2026
Budget allocated to implement the measure	HRK 2,280,000,000 (EUR 303,147,146)
Summary description of how any foreseen impact assessment of the measure will be carried out	Full-day teaching will be piloted in a number of schools, during which experimental curricula envisaged by the Full-day teaching model will be monitored through comparative evaluation of the schools that participate in the experiment and schools with similar characteristics that are not included in the experiment. This will be carried out by the National Centre for External Evaluation of Education. ⁴

⁴ Croatia, Government of the Republic of Croatia (*Vlada Republike Hrvatske*), National Recovery and Resilience Plan 2021-2026 (*Nacionalni plan oporavka i otpornosti 2021. - 2026.*)

Name of the measure in English	C4.3. R1: Transparency and adequacy of social benefits as part of the social protection system
Name of the measure in the national language(s)	C4.3. R1: Transparentnost i adekvatnost socijalnih naknada u sustavu socijalne zaštite
Reference document for the measure	Croatia, Government of the Republic of Croatia (Vlada Republike Hrvatske), National Recovery and Resilience Plan 2021-2026 (Nacionalni plan oporavka i otpornosti 20212026.)
Include an url, where available	
Social rights covered by the measure	- right to social security and social assistance (Article 34)
Delete as appropriate	
Multiple answers possible, but preference should be given to measures that apply to one discrete right	
Population group(s) covered by the measure	- Children - Homeless people
Delete as appropriate	 Individuals from disadvantaged socio-economic backgrounds - recipients of minimum income benefits
Multiple answers possible, but preference should be given to measures that apply to discrete population groups	- Persons with disabilities
Summary description of how the measure applies to the population group(s)	The Ministry of Labour, Pension System, Family and Social Policy will undertake activities to consolidate social benefits and reduce administration work in order to ensure the minimum living standards and meet specific needs of socially vulnerable groups of people.

With the implementation of the new Social Welfare Act, which should be adopted in January 2022, housing costs and heating costs will be combined, and the guaranteed minimum benefit should be addressed in a better manner in relation to families with children. It is also planned to increase the basis for exercising the right to a guaranteed minimum benefit by 25%, from the current HRK 800.00 (EUR 106.00) to HRK 1,000.00 (EUR 133.00) as an initial phase of the implementation of this measure. In order to reduce poverty and meet the needs of minor children more adequately, the amount of the guaranteed minimum benefit for households will be increased from the current 100% to a maximum of 150% of the gross minimum wage of the Republic of Croatia.⁵

This measure foresees the right of homeless people accommodated in shelters to acquire 50% of the guaranteed minimum benefit provided by state legislation.⁶

The Social Welfare Act prescribes several benefits that serve to meet similar needs or protect people with disabilities from similar risks (employment benefits, allowance for assistance and personal care, personal disability benefits, co-financing of costs of electricity, compensation for transportation costs). By combining benefits that have same or similar purposes and reducing their total number, simplification and transparency of benefits will be realized..⁷

Summary description of how the measure will impact (positively or negatively) social rights and equal treatment in the recovery

This measure initially aims to increase the adequacy of main social benefits for vulnerable groups of people and to reduce inequality, provide administrative relief and ensure transparency of the social welfare system itself, as well as provide a faster and more efficient actualization of benefits by consolidating existing social benefits intended to reduce poverty into one benefit, and also to consolidate the existing social benefits intended for persons with disabilities into one benefit, with the introduction of indexation as a standard benefit feature. In addition, this measure aims to achieve better coverage of beneficiaries, as well as equality and adequacy in the exercise of rights.⁸

In the Croatian legal system, there is a large number of social benefits that serve to meet similar needs or protect people from similar risks. In addition, they are prescribed by several

⁵ Croatia, Government of the Republic of Croatia (Vlada Republike Hrvatske), National Recovery and Resilience Plan 2021-2026 (Nacionalni plan oporavka i otpornosti 2021. - 2026.)

⁶ Croatia, Government of the Republic of Croatia (Vlada Republike Hrvatske), National Recovery and Resilience Plan 2021-2026 (Nacionalni plan oporavka i otpornosti 2021. - 2026.)

⁷ Croatia, Government of the Republic of Croatia (Vlada Republike Hrvatske), National Recovery and Resilience Plan 2021-2026 (Nacionalni plan oporavka i otpornosti 2021. - 2026.)

⁸ Croatia, Government of the Republic of Croatia (Vlada Republike Hrvatske), National Recovery and Resilience Plan 2021-2026 (Nacionalni plan oporavka i otpornosti 2021. - 2026.)

	acts. By reducing their total number, simplification and transparency of benefits will be realized. ⁹ By combining the benefits that have the same or similar purpose, but are paid from different sources, uniformity in the general sense of exercising rights would be attained. Ultimately, increasing adequacy and achieving the goal of consolidating benefits intended to reduce poverty into one benefit would primarily ensure the reduction of inequalities in society, as well combating poverty and social exclusion. ¹⁰
Summary description of the extent to which the measure foresees the provision of enabling social services	Not applicable
Entity or organisation responsible to implement the measure	Ministry of Labour, Pension System, Family and Social Policy
Duration of the measure	January 2022 – December 2024
Budget allocated to implement the measure	HRK 500,000.00 (EUR 66,515.00)
Summary description of how any foreseen impact assessment of the measure will be carried out	To increase transparency and provide better insight into available social benefits, a web application for citizens with information regarding all existing social benefits in the social welfare system at national level will be created.

⁹ Croatia, Government of the Republic of Croatia (*Vlada Republike Hrvatske*), National Recovery and Resilience Plan 2021-2026 (*Nacionalni plan oporavka i otpornosti 2021. - 2026.*)

¹⁰ Croatia, Government of the Republic of Croatia (*Vlada Republike Hrvatske*), National Recovery and Resilience Plan 2021-2026 (*Nacionalni plan oporavka i otpornosti 2021. - 2026.*)

Name of the measure in English Name of the measure in the national language(s) Reference document for the measure Include an url, where available	C4.3. R3-I4 Construction and equipping of centres for the elderly (non-institutional and institutional services) C4.3. R1: Transparentnost i adekvatnost socijalnih naknada u sustavu socijalne zaštite Croatia, Government of the Republic of Croatia (Vlada Republike Hrvatske), National Recovery and Resilience Plan 2021-2026 (Nacionalni plan oporavka i otpornosti 20212026.)
Social rights covered by the measure Delete as appropriate Multiple answers possible, but preference should be given to measures that apply to one discrete right	 the rights of the elderly (Article 25) right to social security and social assistance (Article 34)
Population group(s) covered by the measure Delete as appropriate Multiple answers possible, but preference should be given to measures that apply to discrete population groups	 Older people People in need of care Individuals from disadvantaged socio-economic backgrounds Persons with disabilities
Summary description of how the measure applies to the population group(s)	This measure foresees improving the availability of integrated comprehensive care for the elderly through improving the infrastructure by building and equipping centres for the elderly. Based on the analysis made at the county level in which several variables related to the

situation of the elderly were analysed (number of elderly persons, accommodation capacities in relation to number of elderly persons, available labour force in relation to nurses and caregivers), this measure foresees the need to ensure provision of accommodation in eight additional centres for 800 users who need long-term care which is not possible to be provided at the community level.

The National RRP states that investment in infrastructure is also coherent with the European Pillar of Social Rights, in particular Principles 15 and 18, which state that all older people have the right to resources that enable them to live in dignity.

The construction of infrastructure (centres for the elderly) would create the preconditions for providing comprehensive care to the elderly, primarily by providing non-institutional services to the elderly living at home, and exceptionally accommodation services for the elderly who cannot meet long-term care needs through non-institutional services.

Summary description of how the measure will impact (positively or negatively) social rights and equal treatment in the recovery

The measure will have a positive impact through setting preconditions for provision of social care services to a larger number of elderly persons in need of institutional and non-institutional support. It will also positively reflect to some other groups connected to provision of care for the elderly, such as caregivers or household/family members of the elderly.

The centres for the elderly would provide local elderly people living at home with meal delivery, home assistance, organized daily activities, accompaniment to medical examinations, delivery of medicines, improvement of digital skills, recreational activities and education (for experts and formal and informal caregivers) etc. Centres for the elderly would also provide care for the elderly during non-availability of the caregivers as well as training of caregivers. In addition, integrated care would be provided in the centres for the elderly through functional connection of primary health care institutions with centres for the elderly. Hence, health care at the primary level would be provided in centres for the elderly together with social care. The integration of health and social care would also be visible in the model of palliative care and care for persons who are completely dependent on help and care of others (persons with disabilities).

The centres would also provide accommodation services for persons who are functionally completely dependent on help from others, in cases when their needs cannot be met by services in the community.

The construction of centres for the elderly would also contribute to solving other problems, such as the lack of accommodation capacity for the elderly, the unavailability of all services to the elderly and the workload of household and family members of the elderly.

Summary description of the extent to which the measure foresees the provision of enabling social services	The measure foresees provision of social and health care services as described above as well as training of caregivers and other persons providing social services. The RRP notes that work in the long-term care sector has a great potential for job creation. It also states that, in cooperation with the Croatian Employment Service, measures and programs for retraining the workforce to work on all aspects of care for the elderly will be encouraged and implemented. The RRP also notes that the quality of social service provision will be improved by redefining the criteria for starting service provision through normative documents as well as by prescribing mandatory training for social service providers. Regarding prices and payment for services, there are ongoing initiatives, which aim to establish a uniform methodology as well as drafting of an ordinance for determining prices in the same way for all service providers.
Entity or organisation responsible to implement the measure	Ministry of Labour, Pension System, Family and Social Policy
Duration of the measure	January 2022 – December 2024
Budget allocated to implement the measure	HRK 370,000,000 (EUR 49,195,570)
Summary description of how any foreseen impact assessment of the measure will be carried out	Qualitative indicator for this measure as listed among the key points of the implementation of reform and investments is the following: by the 2 nd quarter of 2026, 8 centres for the elderly will be built and equipped.

Tools or mechanisms to monitor the effectiveness of national schemes to foster social rights and equal treatment in the recovery from the pandemic

Name of the monitoring tool or mechanism in English	Institutional framework of the management system and monitoring of the implementation of activities within the National Recovery and Resilience Plan in the Republic of Croatia
Name of the monitoring tool or mechanism in the national language(s)	Institucionalni okvir sustava upravljanja i praćenja provedbe aktivnosti u okviru Nacionalnog plana oporavka i otpornosti u Republici Hrvatskoj
Reference document for the monitoring tool or mechanism Include an url, where available	Decision on the management system and monitoring of the implementation of activities within the National Recovery and Resilience Plan 2021-2026 (Odluka o sustavu upravljanja i praćenju provedbe aktivnosti u okviru Nacionalnog plana oporavka i otpornosti 2021. – 2026.), Official Gazette No. 78/2021 from 9 July 2021
Organisation(s) involved in the monitoring tool or mechanism	National authority/authoritiesOther
Delete as appropriate Multiple answers possible	The institutional framework of the management system and monitoring of the implementation of activities within the National Recovery and Resilience Plan in the Republic of Croatia consists of the following bodies: - Steering Committee (Upravljački odbor) Members of the Steering Committee are: Prime Minister of the Republic of Croatia (presiding member) Minister in charge of finance (deputy president of the Steering Committee) Minister in charge of transport Minister in charge of agriculture Minister in charge of tourism

Minister in charge of culture Minister in charge of justice and administration Minister in charge of internal affairs Minister in charge of science and education Minister in charge of labor, pension system, family and social policy Minister in charge of health Minister in charge of physical planning, construction and state assets Minister in charge of regional development and European Union funds State Secretary in charge of demography and youth State Secretary in charge of digital society development. - Committee for the Implementation of the National Recovery and Resilience Plan (Odbor za provedbu Nacionalnog plana oporavka i otpornosti) The body responsible for coordinating the monitoring of the implementation of the National Recovery and Resilience Plan (Tijelo nadležno za koordinaciju praćenja provedbe Nacionalnog plana oporavka i otpornosti) The body responsible for sending payment requests to the European Commission (Tijelo nadležno za slanje zahtjeva za plaćanje Europskoj komisiji) State administration bodies responsible for the component/sub-component of the National Recovery and Resilience Plan (Tijela državne uprave nadležna za komponentu/podkomponentu Nacionalnog plana oporavka i otpornosti) Implementing bodies (Provedbena tijela) and Audit authority (Tijelo nadležno za reviziju). Members of those bodies are representatives of different state bodies and institutions, in accordance with their sectoral competence. The Steering Committee is responsible for the overall management and monitoring of the Summary description of how implementation of all activities set out in the National Recovery and Resilience Plan. organisation(s) these are involved in the monitoring tool or mechanism The Committee for the Implementation of the National Recovery and Resilience Plan is in charge of operational monitoring of the implementation of the RRP.

The body responsible for coordinating the monitoring of the implementation of the National Recovery and Resilience Plan is the organizational unit of the sector level within the Ministry of Finance. Its tasks, among others, include:

- coordination of monitoring the implementation of the RRP with monitoring of the fulfilment of key stages and target values;
- encouraging timely implementation of reforms and investments, supporting the implementing bodies in removing obstacles and speeding up the implementation process;
- preparation of the Report on the implementation of the National Recovery and Resilience Plan and the reports related to the achievement of key stages and target values.

For the implementation of reforms and investments for each component/subcomponent in the National Recovery and Resilience Plan, a competent authority has been identified at the level of the state administration body (e.g. ministry).

The RRP is divided into 5 basic components and one initiative, within which there are defined subcomponents. A competent body at the level of the ministry and the central state office has been appointed for the implementation of reforms and investments for each component / subcomponent. The bodies are designated in accordance with the sectoral competence prescribed by the Law on the System of State Administration Bodies and the Decision on the Bodies for the Implementation of the National RRP.

All bodies in charge of the implementation of the component/subcomponent are involved in the implementation of the European Structural and Investment (ESI) Funds 2014-2020 as bodies in management and control systems or as project beneficiaries. Procedures are used for these tasks, which describe the procedures, internal controls, separation of duties and all other prerequisites in accordance with the requirements for the implementation of ESI Funds. The operation of the system, as well as the procedures themselves, are subject to continuous audits. In order to ensure uniform rules for the use of funds, the authorities responsible for the component/sub-component and the implementing agencies will use the same procedures which, in cooperation with the National Fund, will be adapted to the National RPP. The Ministry of Finance develops procedures for monitoring and reporting on the fulfilment of key indicators and target values.

Summary description of the functioning of the tool or mechanism used to monitor the effectiveness of schemes adopted to foster social rights and equal treatment in the recovery	The Report on the implementation of the National Recovery and Resilience Plan is prepared once a month by the body responsible for coordinating the monitoring of the implementation of the National RRP in cooperation with the Office of the Prime Minister of the Republic of Croatia. The Steering Committee meets at least once a month and, based on the proposal of the Implementation Committee and the Report on the implementation, discusses the implementation of the National RRP and makes executive decisions related to the management and implementation of the National RRP. The Implementation Committee meets at least once a month and discusses and makes proposals on all aspects of the implementation of the National RRP, areas for improving implementation, coordination of activities financed from the National RRP, national and EU funds, irregularities and audit findings. The Implementation Committee, based on the discussion and the Report on the implementation, determines the proposal of measures to be taken and submits it to the Steering Committee for their implementation.
Summary description of the obligations, standards and benchmarks against which the effectiveness will be evaluated	Not applicable
Summary description of what the tool or mechanism foresees when non-compliance with obligations and standards is identified, with a particular emphasis on enforcement and remedial action	Not applicable