

Germany

FRANET National Focal Point

Social Thematic Study

The situation of Roma

2012

German Institute for Human Rights

DISCLAIMER: This study was prepared under contract by the FRA's multidisciplinary research network FRANET. It is made available for information purposes only and does not necessarily reflect the views or the official position of the FRA.

Table of Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	4
1 ROMA POPULATION.....	7
2 EDUCATION	10
3 EMPLOYMENT.....	26
4 HOUSING AND NEIGHBOURHOOD	36
5 HEALTH.....	46

6	POVERTY/ECONOMIC SITUATION	54
7	ACTIVE CITIZENSHIP/RIGHTS AWARENESS	58
	ANNEXES	62
1.	Bibliography	62
2.	Statistical tables	70
3.	Table of complaints.....	72
4.	Table of sources (reports and studies on Roma).....	73
5.	Roma networks	86

Executive summary

The report addresses the situation of Roma in Germany and the particular difficulties they encounter in the areas of education, employment, housing/neighbourhood, health, poverty/economic situation as well as issues relating to active citizenship/right awareness.

To understand the legal framework and policies, which have a considerable impact on the opportunities and thus on the situation of Roma in Germany, different groups of Roma have to be distinguished. Two main groups of Roma¹ can be identified: 1) **Sinti and Roma with German citizenship** who are recognised as a national minority and 2) **Roma with a migration background**. Roma with a migration background include third-country nationals and nationals of other EU Member States (predominantly from Bulgaria and Romania who have migrated to Germany after the eastern enlargement of the EU in 2007) as well as refugees (mostly from former Yugoslavia and Kosovo). In addition, Roma constitute a very heterogeneous group with regard to cultural, economic, educational and regional criteria.

The lack of data and statistics disaggregated by ethnicity represents a constraint to this research. Considering that ‘for historical reasons, no statistical data is collected on the ethnic composition of the population’² in Germany, there is a lack of official statistics on the Roma population. Only the official statistics on the number of asylum applicants collected since 1993 contain differentiated information on ethnicity. Surveys or studies providing substantial quantitative insight into the characteristics and current living conditions of Roma are rarely undertaken, particularly at the national level. Thus, all available information on the number and characteristics of Roma residing in Germany are based on estimates or on predominantly non-official qualitative data.

Hence, reliable information derived from qualitative resources in the key sectoral fields is of key importance for this study. The analysis had to rely on empirical data such as informal surveys, interviews with experts and representatives of the Roma population in Germany and personal experiences reported by NGOs.

The background research carried out by the authors focused on an extensive desk review of existing literature and reports provided by several NGOs and research institutes.

It has to be mentioned that this study focuses primarily on the problems and challenges that many Roma face. Apart from that, experts emphasise the existence of numerous cases of successful integration of Roma families and their adequate or even above average living conditions; these, however, are not in the focus of this study. Furthermore, the figures and information of existing literature often do not clearly indicate, whether they include both German Sinti and Roma and migrant Roma or, if they distinguish between different legal categories of Roma. In addition, qualitative information often refers to the situation of a particular group of Roma in individual cities. Thus, whereas it was challenging to reconstruct a comprehensive picture combining the various aspects of the situation of Roma, some insights into their living circumstances can be provided by this study.

Keeping this in mind, the results of the study indicate that Roma children still face serious disadvantages regarding access to **education** compared to the majority population. A disproportional high number of German Sinti and Roma has never attended school or dropped out of the school system without a degree, which stands in sharp contrast to the majority

¹ In the following study, the term Roma covers both main groups unless otherwise specified.

² [Germany,] *Bundesdatenschutzgesetz (BDSG)* [Federal Data Protection Law],

[Germany,] Permanent Mission of the Federal Republic of Germany to the Office of the United Nations and to the other International Organizations Geneva (2008), *Note Verbale* to the OHCHR on 31 July 2008; Ref.: Pol 504.14; Note No.: 230/2008.

population of Germany. Furthermore, an above average number of German Sinti and Roma children as well as migrant Roma attend special schools for children with learning deficits (*Förderschulen*). In contrast, only a low share attend upper secondary schools, receive vocational training or graduate from universities.

A lack of pre-school education attendance and differing regulations regarding compulsory school attendance for some groups of Roma refugees have a decisive impact on the educational achievements of Roma. Perceived and structural discrimination are additional factors which might negatively influence their educational career.

The **employment situation** of Roma is influenced by a variety of factors. Difficulties in accessing the labour market are related to the lack of education and of formal qualification certificates as well as to discrimination when looking for work or at work. *De jure*, Sinti and Roma with German citizenship have the same rights on the labour market as Germans. Specific education and qualification programmes could contribute to an improvement of the labour market situation of German Sinti and Roma as well as migrant Roma. In particular, the legal situation of migrant Roma, as of migrants in general, is often very disadvantageous for their labour market integration. Therefore, refugees and asylum seekers are particularly affected by restrictive regulations on the access to the labour market. The assumed high unemployment rate among Roma persons in Germany makes precarious employment situations, such as informal employment or ‘false’ self-employment among migrant Roma, more attractive. This, in turn, leads to an exclusion from the social security system and prevents them from exercising their rights as employees.

Housing conditions differ significantly among Roma. Both, segregated as well as de-segregated Roma communities can be observed in Germany. While some Roma families live in the same conditions as most Germans, others suffer from sub-standard housing conditions. In general, the vast majority of Roma in Germany live in regular dwellings, but a few caravan sites for Roma still exist, for example in Hamburg or Bremen. With regard to the housing environment, they often reside in the outskirts of larger cities with a poorer infrastructure. Sometimes Roma communities are located in environmentally problematic areas, e.g. next to industrial zones, close to train tracks or waste dumps. A prevalent issue is finding adequate housing for large and disadvantaged families receiving social welfare. In particular, those holding the residence status of ‘toleration’ struggle to find living spaces of adequate quality. Informal housing and substandard flats seem to be an issue among Roma from Romania and Bulgaria. Overcrowding is often mentioned as a problem among all Roma groups. Social (e.g. large families) and economic (e.g. lower income, dependence on social welfare) factors but also “long-term neglect by public authorities” seem to be intertwined with anti-Roma prejudice and discrimination.

This study comprises various findings of studies that reflect the **health situation** of different Roma groups in Germany, which have been supplemented by expert opinions. Challenges in the area of health, especially for migrant Roma, include language barriers, lacking knowledge about general health issues and about health care services. Furthermore, discrimination on part of the medical personal and mistrust in medical institutions on part of the Roma constitute obstacles to adequate health care. In some cases, poor living conditions can also be identified as a determining factor for the health situation. Although these findings are not representative, some Roma representatives estimate that health issues, like heart disease, asthma and rheumatism can be observed. Many Roma refugees and asylum seekers have to deal with posttraumatic stress disorder and related symptoms. In conclusion, the results in this policy area show that restrictions and barriers in receiving health care seem to be evident in the healthcare system but also on part of the medical personal. Regarding these findings, it can be concluded that the health status differs between Roma and primarily depends on one’s social and economic status.

Regarding the **economic situation** of Roma in Germany, it seems that all groups of Roma are, to a different extent, affected by poverty. This conclusion is drawn on the basis of several

reports published by civil society organisations and from findings of other policy areas included in this study. Roma seem to be overrepresented among recipients of social welfare. For refugees from Kosovo and Serbia it seems to be particularly difficult to become independent from social welfare. Generally, it is assumed that Roma are among the poorest immigrants in Germany. Different approaches were identified to increase their income, e.g. taking up more than one job. Still, income is often not enough to cover the expenditures, especially in large families. It can be assumed that the economic situation correlates significantly with the education and employment situations. Poor housing conditions are another indicator of their disadvantaged economic situation.

The level of **participation in political** and public life of Roma men has increased in the last years. Yet, Roma are not present in areas of active citizenship such as (local) political commissions or parties in any of the Federal States. While Roma women participate in NGOs or are involved in activities in primary schools, there are no Roma women in any official bodies.

Furthermore, discrimination, in particular in access to housing and in the field of education, seems to be a relevant issue affecting Roma and their pursuit of integration into society.

1 Roma population

Considering that ‘for historical reasons, no statistical data is collected on the ethnic composition of the population’³ in Germany, there is a lack of official statistics on the Roma population.⁴ Only the official statistics on the number of asylum applicants collected since 1993 contain differentiated information on ethnicity.⁵ Surveys or studies providing substantial quantitative insight into the characteristics and current living conditions of Sinti and Roma are seldom undertaken, particularly at the national level⁶. Thus, all available information on the number and characteristics of Roma residing in Germany are based on estimates or on predominantly non-official qualitative data. Moreover, figures often do not clearly indicate if they include both Sinti and Roma or, if they distinguish between different legal categories of Roma.

Estimated figures on the **number of Roma** in Germany vary according to different sources. With regard to the group of Sinti and Roma with *German citizenship* living in Germany, the German Federal Government, the *Central Council of German Sinti and Roma* [Deutscher Zentralrat der Sinti und Roma] and several reports, agree that there are approximately 70,000, of whom 60,000 are Sinti and 10,000 Roma.⁷ According to another report, the entire Roma population in Germany is estimated at around 40,000 people, with an additional 70,000 Sinti.⁸ Thus, they represent approximately 0.13% of the total population in Germany (~ 82 million).⁹ A recently published NGO-report quantifies the number of German Sinti and Roma slightly higher, with up to 120,000, plus 50,000 refugees and so-called labour migrants.¹⁰ In 2011, within the group of asylum applicants, 9,568 and in 2010, 11,218 Roma applied for asylum, whereas in 2009 the number was only 1,808. Yet, the majority of Roma asylum seekers were rejected (2011: 64.8%).¹¹ Furthermore, despite bans on deportation in individual Federal States, an increasing number of Roma from Kosovo were deported.¹²

Even though no data on the **lifestyle of Roma** is available, neither at national nor at regional or local level, it is assumed by Sinti and Roma representatives and other experts that the vast

³ [Germany,] Bundesdatenschutzgesetz (BDSG) [Federal Data Protection Law],

[Germany,] Permanent Mission of the Federal Republic of Germany to the Office of the United Nations and to the other International Organizations Geneva (2008) *Note Verbale* to the OHCHR on 31 July 2008; Ref.: Pol 504.14; Note No.: 230/2008;

⁴ [Germany,] Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Inneren*) (2011), *EU-Rahmen für nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020 – Integrierte Maßnahmenpakete zur Integration und Teilhabe der Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Berlin, Bundesministerium des Inneren), [p. 12];

Peucker, M./ Bochmann, A./ Heidmann, R. (2009), *RAXEN Thematic study: Housing conditions of Sinti and Roma*, Bamberg, European forum for migration studies (efms), [p. 23].

⁵ Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der TU Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland*, [p. 45].

⁶ Peucker, M./ Bochmann, A./ Heidmann, R. (2009), *RAXEN Thematic study: Housing conditions of Sinti and Roma*, Bamberg, European forum for migration studies (efms), [p. 23].

⁷ [Germany,] Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Inneren*) (2011), *EU-Rahmen für nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020 – Integrierte Maßnahmenpakete zur Integration und Teilhabe der Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Berlin, Bundesministerium des Inneren), [p. 50].

⁸ Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung (2006), *Economic Aspects of the Condition of Roma Women*, Brussels, European Parliament, [p. 18].

⁹ Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung (2006), *Economic Aspects of the Condition of Roma Women*, Brussels, European Parliament, [p. 18].

¹⁰ Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg, I-Verb.de und RomnoKher, [p. 4], by referring to a UNICEF sponsored report on Roma refugees (Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der TU Berlin (2007)).

¹¹ BAMF Referat 222.

¹² [Germany,] Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2011e), ‘Antwort der Bundesregierung auf die Kleine Anfrage: Verschärfte Abschiebung von Roma in den Kosovo’, printed matter 17/8224, 19 December 2011.

majority of Sinti and Roma are sedentary nowadays.¹³ Some Sinti and Roma still own caravans “which are usually used to visit family members in Germany and other European countries or to travel during the summer holidays, which does not suggest an itinerant lifestyle”.¹⁴ This assumption is also confirmed by other reports stating that only “a small percentage of Sinti and Roma travel all year round”.¹⁵ In contrast to these statements, the recently published report on the education of Sinti and Roma says that there is still a high share of Sinti and Roma who are travellers.¹⁶

Generally, the majority of Sinti and Roma in Germany **live** in the large cities of West Germany, but they have also settled in other cities such as Hamburg, Bremen and Berlin.¹⁷ According to official estimates, many German Sinti and Roma also reside in the Rhine Ruhr area, particularly Düsseldorf and Cologne, the Rhine-Main, the Rhine-Neckar regions and Kiel and its surrounding area. The federal government thinks that there is a significant number of Sinti and Roma communities in smaller cities, for instance in East Friesland and Bavaria.¹⁸ Roma refugees are primarily concentrated in the capitals of the Federal Länder, such as in Hamburg or Berlin. Furthermore, Roma refugees are often clustered according to their country of origin: for instance, in Berlin two thirds of the refugees are from Serbian Entities of Bosnia and Herzegovina.¹⁹

With regard to their **origin**, the Roma in Germany are characterised by considerable heterogeneity. Firstly, the Roma in Germany have to be distinguished between *German Sinti and Roma* and *foreign Roma*. The former, Sinti and Roma with German citizenship, are recognized as a national minority.²⁰ The latter, foreign Roma, can be categorised into the following main groups: former civil-war refugees (mostly from former Yugoslavia and Kosovo), other third-country nationals and nationals of other Member States (predominantly from Bulgaria and Romania, which came to Germany after the eastern enlargement of the EU in 2004).²¹ In 2011, following the abolishment of the visa waiver for short stay within the Schengen area, an increase in the number of asylum seekers from Serbia, primarily Roma, was observed.²² Roma refugees constitute a very heterogeneous group not only with regard to their country of origin, language and religion but also in respect to their duration of stay and residence permits.²³ Around two-thirds of all Roma do not hold residence permits that allow

¹³ Peucker, M./ Bochmann, A./ Heidmann, R. (2009), *RAXEN Thematic study: Housing conditions of Sinti and Roma*, Bamberg, European forum for migration studies (efms), [p. 32].

¹⁴ *Ibid.*

¹⁵ Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung (2006), *Economic Aspects of the Condition of Roma Women*, Brussels, European Parliament [p. 22].

¹⁶ Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg, I-Verb.de und RomnoKher, [p. 16]

¹⁷ Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung (2006), *Economic Aspects of the Condition of Roma Women*, Brussels, European Parliament, [p. 18].

¹⁸ [Germany], Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Inneren*) (2004), *Nationale Minderheiten in Deutschland*, Berlin, [p. 14]; Verband deutscher Sinti und Roma e.V. (2009), *Sinti und Roma in NRW*, available at: www.sintiundroma-nrw.de/surnrwzwei.htm.

¹⁹ Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der TU Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland*, [p. 9f]

²⁰ The group of German Sinti is referring to those who can be traced back to live on the current German territory since 600 years, whereas Roma mostly came to Germany in the last 150 years mainly from Hungary (Germany, Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2012), ‘Beschränkungen der Reisefreiheit für Roma aus Serbien, Montenegro und Mazedonien infolge des EU-Visumregimes’, printed matter 17/8747, 27 February 2012, [p. 1]; Peucker, M./ Bochmann, A./ Heidmann, R. (2009), *RAXEN Thematic study: Housing conditions of Sinti and Roma*, Bamberg, European forum for migration studies (efms), [p. 23]).

²¹ [Germany], Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Inneren*) (2004), *Nationale Minderheiten in Deutschland*, Berlin [p. 14/23].

²² [Germany], Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2012), ‘Beschränkungen der Reisefreiheit für Roma aus Serbien, Montenegro und Mazedonien infolge des EU-Visumregimes’, printed matter 17/8747, 27 February 2012, [p. 1].

²³ (German citizenship, asylum seeker, or ‘tolerated’); Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der TU Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland*. [p. 7/9].

their integration with regard to education, employment, health service and choice of housing.²⁴ According to UNICEF (2007), among all refugees, there are approximately 23,000 ‘tolerated’ Roma from Kosovo (amongst them 10,000 children), 3,000-4,000 ‘tolerated’ from former Yugoslavia and other east-European countries without legal documents (amongst them 2,000 children) as well as 2,929 ‘tolerated’ Roma, applying for asylum, of which 1,737 children.²⁵

In terms of integration, a distinction has to be made between the group of German Sinti and Roma and the group of *foreign Roma*, because they differ with regard to underlying legal status granting and in their access to various rights, thus they differ in their **state of integration**.²⁶ Today, the majority of German Sinti and Roma see themselves well integrated into German society.²⁷ For this group, various cultural and social projects have been implemented at the federal state and local level in order to support a societal participation which maintains the cultural identity of Roma and their language. Nevertheless, the need for improved employment opportunities has been acknowledged, especially for the group of Roma newcomers.²⁸ Despite this issue, primarily raised by NGOs, the Federal Government stated that they do not see a need to develop special integration measures for Roma in Germany. In terms of education, the Federal Government pointed out that policies and measures relating to education are left to the Federal States.²⁹ In addition, Roma coming from an EU country are, in principle, entitled to take part in all existing integration measures, such as language courses or migration counselling. Specific measures are only offered in a few Federal States.³⁰ The situation of Roma refugees is considered precarious due to their insecure rights to stay in the country. Many are not granted residence permits, but are ‘tolerated’ (*Duldung*) which, depending on the individual federal state, may restrict their freedom of movement, access to employment and to social protection.³¹ NGOs and human rights organisations criticise that families often face a permanent threat of deportation, even after a long time stay in Germany. Regarding the various aspects of integration, refugees also face difficulties depending on whether they come from a rural or urban area in their country of origin.³²

²⁴ Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der TU Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland*, [p. 9];

Grienig, G., (2010), *Roma in Deutschland*, Berlin, Berlin-Institut für Bevölkerung und Entwicklung, [p. 3];

Peucker, M./ Bochmann, A./ Heidmann, R. (2009), *RAXEN Thematic study: Housing conditions of Sinti and Roma*, Bamberg, European forum for migration studies (efms), [p. 8f].

²⁵ Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der TU Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland*, [p. 9].

²⁶ [Germany], Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Inneren*) (2011), *EU-Rahmen für nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020 – Integrierte Maßnahmenpakete zur Integration und Teilhabe der Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Berlin, Bundesministerium des Inneren.

²⁷ [Germany], Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2011a), ‘Antwort der Bundesregierung auf die Kleine Anfrage: Verabschiedung einer nationalen Strategie zur Integration der Roma’, printed matter 17/6698, 28 July 2011, [p. 3].

²⁸ [Germany], Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2011d), ‘Antrag: Die Integration der Sinti und Roma in Europa verbessern’, printed matter 17/6090, 07 June 2011, [p. 8].

²⁹ [Germany], Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2011b), ‘Antwort der Bundesregierung auf die Große Anfrage: Zur Situation von Roma in der Europäischen Union und in den (potentiellen) EU-Beitrittskandidatenstaaten’, printed matter 17/7131, 22 September 2011, [p. 48].

³⁰ [Germany], Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2011c), p. 1/3; Germany, Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2011b), [p. 48].

[Germany], Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2011b), ‘Antwort der Bundesregierung auf die Große Anfrage: Zur Situation von Roma in der Europäischen Union und in den (potentiellen) EU-Beitrittskandidatenstaaten’, printed matter 17/7131, 22 September 2011, [p. 8].

³¹ Open Society Institute (2002), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, available at: www.soros.org/resources/articles_publications/publications/monitorminpro_20030101/1monitorminproFULL_20030101.pdf, [p. 151].

³² Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der TU Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland*, [p. 7].

2 Education

Education in Germany has a complex organisation. Educational issues are under the competence of the *Länder* and are not regulated uniformly. Moreover, integration levels differ among various groups of Roma based on their legal statuses, and thus, their access to various rights varies as well.³³ In addition, data on ethnic origin is not recorded in German educational statistics.³⁴ Therefore, it is difficult to comprehensively assess the educational situation of Roma children in Germany. Nevertheless, while no relevant nationwide official statistics exist on the situation of Roma, there are regional and local studies as well as nationwide opinion polls and attitude surveys, which provide some insights into Roma's educational situation.³⁵

a. Pre-school/kindergarten

There is no official or unofficial data available regarding Roma in **pre-school/kindergarten** that allow to make substantial statements on the attendance of Roma. Some experts assume that there is a gap between all Roma groups and non-Roma regarding attendance in pre-school institutions and kindergartens.³⁶

The latest survey on the educational status of **German Sinti and Roma**³⁷, based on interviews with this group of Roma, supports this view, stating that less than one third (26.8%) of the respondents attended a Kindergarten.³⁸ However, according to data, nearly half of the younger German Sinti and Roma spent at least some time in pre-school institutions compared to the first generation of which only a few respondents attended a kindergarten.³⁹ With regard to the group of Roma arriving in Germany as **EU nationals from South-Eastern** Europe, a report indicates that in the city district *Neukölln* of Berlin only few Roma children from Romania and Bulgaria are enrolled in Kindergarten or in 'Kitas' (day care).⁴⁰ The same may be assumed for other cities and city districts.

While there is optional pre-school and kindergarten education for all children, including German and foreign Roma, Roma children classified as **'tolerated' or asylum-seekers with pending asylum applications** only have limited access to pre-school institutions. According to a report by UNICEF, Roma children living in refugee homes were sometimes rejected because

³³ [Germany,] Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Inneren*) (2010), *Nationale Minderheiten in Deutschland*, Berlin.

³⁴ [Germany,] Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Inneren*) (2011a), *Report from the Federal Republic of Germany to the European Commission – An EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020: Integrated packages of measures to promote the integration and participation of Sinti and Roma in Germany*, [p. 30].

³⁵ Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012, [p. 4].

³⁶ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), 'The Situation of Roma in Germany', in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [pp. 141-224].

³⁷ [Germany,] Supported by the national Foundation 'Remembrance, Responsibility and Future' (*Erinnerung, Verantwortung und Zukunft*), the head of the Baden-Württemberg state branch of the Association of German Sinti and Roma, commissioned a study on the current educational situation of German Sinti and Roma (2007–2011).

³⁸ Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg: I-Verb.de und RomnoKher, [p. 63].

³⁹ Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg: I-Verb.de und RomnoKher, [p. 63].

⁴⁰ [Germany,] *Bezirksamt Neukölln von Berlin – Abteilung Bildung, Schule, Kultur und Sport* (2012), 2. *Roma-Statusbericht: Entwicklung der Zuzüge von EU-Unionsbürger aus Südosteuropa: Berlin – Neukölln*, Berlin, [p. 9].

their parents were not employed.⁴¹ Further, in refugee homes, organised child care is rarely available. Of the 40 refugee homes situated in Cologne, only one offers specific child care.⁴²

According to an opinion poll among Roma experts, one half of the respondents think that there is unequal access to early childhood education for Germans as well as foreign Roma.⁴³

Firstly access to pre-schools and kindergartens is dependent on the motivation of parents to enrol their children in these institutions. This, however, requires that parents are informed and speak German in order to be able to contact the kindergarten. Furthermore, experts argue that many Roma parents have concerns regarding pre-school or kindergarten institutions.⁴⁴ Yet, actual data has shown that in contrast, the youngest group of respondents (14- to 25-years) have positive attitudes towards kindergartens with regard to their children.⁴⁵

Secondly, fees for pre-schools/kindergartens can only partly be covered by local authorities and the *Länder*, therefore families have to cover a part of the costs themselves. Parents who are unemployed may not be able pay kindergarten fees.⁴⁶

Last but not least, pre-school institutions must be willing, open and capable to provide a place for Roma children.⁴⁷ Experts in Berlin argue that while there is a rising demand to enroll children in kindergartens, there are not enough resources to provide space for all children. Thus, pre-school institutions increasingly have long waiting lists.⁴⁸

Lack of pre-school education is identified as a reason for the comparatively poorer educational achievements of Roma. Study results confirm the correlation between attendance of kindergarten or pre-school and the educational success of a child. Thus, migrant children who attended kindergartens in Germany are more likely to achieve higher educational levels.⁴⁹

A central issue frequently highlighted by experts is that immigrant or refugee Roma children often enter primary school unprepared with language deficits.⁵⁰

⁴¹ Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland, [p. 22].

⁴² Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland, [p. 22].

⁴³ Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012, [p. 6].

⁴⁴ Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg: I-Verb.de und RomnoKher, [p. 63].

⁴⁵ Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg: I-Verb.de und RomnoKher, [p. 63].

⁴⁶ Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland, [p. 22].

⁴⁷ Lüken-Klaßen, D. and Meixner, S. (2004), *Roma in Public Education*, Bamberg: european forum for migration studies (efms).

⁴⁸ [Germany.] *Bezirksamt Neukölln von Berlin – Abteilung Bildung, Schule, Kultur und Sport* (2012), 2. *Roma-Statusbericht: Entwicklung der Zuzüge von EU-Unionsbürger aus Südosteuropa: Berlin – Neukölln*, Berlin, [p. 9].

⁴⁹ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

⁵⁰ Knaus, V. and Widmann, P. (2010), *Integration unter Vorbehalt: Zur Situation von Kindern kosovarischer Roma, Ashkali und Ägypter in Deutschland und nach ihrer Rückführung in den Kosovo*, Köln: Deutsches Komitee für UNICEF e.V., [p. 43].

Considering the impact of pre-school and kindergarten attendance on the educational career, German, authorities, in particular local governments and other local actors, try to increase the number of kindergarten attendance among Roma. Collaborative projects by Sinti and Roma organisations and school authorities aiming at providing pre-school preparation to Roma children exist in several states.⁵¹ Yet, according to experts, there is still need for further intervention with regard to early education and kindergarten.⁵²

b. Compulsory school attendance

While pre-school and kindergarten education is optional for all children, **school attendance** of primary and secondary education is **compulsory**. Due to *Länder* competence in education, educational systems differ within Germany in terms of age and duration.⁵³

While all *Länder* are obliged to provide a place for all children of school age, only a few control school attendance systematically.⁵⁴

There is no harmonisation of regulations regarding compulsory school attendance for children of asylum seekers and refugees.⁵⁵ Children of asylum seekers and refugees are obliged to attend school in a few *Länder* while in others they only have the right to attend school.⁵⁶ However, this implies serious disadvantages: similarly to pre-school institutions and kindergarten, school attendance primarily depends on the commitment of the parents, and on whether the school can accommodate the child. Some experts state that parents have enormous concerns regarding educational institutions.⁵⁷

In addition, there are cases, such as in Berlin, where access to education is provided to all children, regardless of legal status or registration. However, in practice, “children may find their access to schools denied, in particular when no official registration exists”.⁵⁸ There are further cases of rejection due to limited staff and financial capacities. In some schools in Berlin there is a waiting list for nationals from Romania and Bulgaria with regard to secondary education. According to the previously mentioned report, “secondary school pupils sometimes have to wait several months in order to get a place at school”.⁵⁹

Another issue seems to be the fact that in some *Länder* there is no compulsory school attendance after the age of 16; therefore children arriving at the age of 16 and older might face the most difficult challenge. For these children, some *Länder* (e.g. Berlin) offer Youth

⁵¹ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

⁵² Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012, [p. 6].

⁵³ Presse- und Informationsamt der Bundesregierung 2010, [p. 88].

⁵⁴ Antidiskriminierungsnetzwerk Berlin des Türkischen Bundes in Berlin-Brandenburg (2007), [p. 8].

⁵⁵ Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland, [p. 11].

⁵⁶ In 2005, in 8 out of 16 Länder, there was no compulsory school attendance for children holding the residence status of toleration (Duldung) implemented.

⁵⁷ Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg: I-Verb.de und RomnoKher.

⁵⁸ Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES, [p. 9].

⁵⁹ Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES, [p. 6].

integration courses free of charge for SGBII receivers. Others are charged one Euro per lesson and since a general course consists of at least 660 lessons the course might constitute a financial burden for families.⁶⁰ Yet, exempted from the right of attendance of any integration course are EU citizens, which are only entitled to attend under specific circumstances.⁶¹

To sum up, not only the lack of pre-school education but also different regulations regarding compulsory school attendance for some groups of Roma play a decisive role for educational success of Roma.

c. Educational success/Achievements

As mentioned above, it is impossible to provide a general assessment of the **educational success** of Roma.

A recent study on education may provide some clues about the situation of **German Sinti and Roma** in the area of education. A main result of the study shows that a disproportionately high rate of German Sinti and Roma has never attended school (13%).⁶² Further, 44% have not completed primary or secondary education.

According to the representative survey among German Sinti and Roma, a high proportion of individuals did not attend primary school (18.4%) in comparison to a low share of the majority population which did not attend primary school (less than 1%). Broken down by age-groups, it should be noted that nearly 40% of the group of 51-year-olds and older did not attend primary school. The share of 14-25 year-olds who did not attend primary school is half of the share of 26-50 year-olds (9.4 and 18.8% respectively). In the light of these study results, it may be concluded that the number of German Sinti and Roma who have not attended school has clearly decreased.

Nevertheless, data gathered during desk research and expert interviews show that there is a general consensus that the educational situation of German Sinti and Roma is still poor, in particular with regard to secondary education. German Sinti and Roma are underrepresented in higher secondary education ('Gymnasium'⁶³, 'Realschule'⁶⁴) and at the same time overrepresented in lower education ('Hauptschule'⁶⁵, 'Förderschule') as well as in special needs schools.⁶⁶ Based on the previously mentioned survey, 78.3% of the 14-25 year-olds attend(ed) a general secondary school. In contrast, only 12.3% of the 14-25 year-olds and 13.4% of the 26-50 year-olds attend(ed) an intermediate secondary school and even fewer (2.3%) attended a higher education school. There are hardly any differences between women and men. The numbers – and the nearly complete lack of university graduates – are in sharp contrast to the majority of the German society.

⁶⁰ [Germany,] *Bezirksamt Neukölln von Berlin – Abteilung Bildung, Schule, Kultur und Sport* (2012), 2. *Roma-Statusbericht: Entwicklung der Zuzüge von EU-Unionsbürger aus Südosteuropa: Berlin – Neukölln*, Berlin, [p. 9].

⁶¹ [Germany,] Federal Ministry for Migration and Refugees (*Bundesministerium für Migration und Flüchtlinge, BAMF*) (2012), *EU-Bürger: Anspruch auf Teilnahme*, 2 March 2012, available at: [\[www.bamf.de/DE/Willkommen/DeutschLernen/Integrationskurse/TeilnahmeKosten/EUBuerger/eubuerger-node.html\]](http://www.bamf.de/DE/Willkommen/DeutschLernen/Integrationskurse/TeilnahmeKosten/EUBuerger/eubuerger-node.html).

⁶² Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg:, I-Verb.de und RomnoKher, [p. 32].

⁶³ higher education school

⁶⁴ intermediate secondary school

⁶⁵ general secondary school

⁶⁶ Antidiskriminierungsnetzwerk Berlin des Türkischen Bundes in Berlin-Brandenburg (eds.) (2007), *Sinti und Roma - Bürger/-innen unseres Landes*, Berlin: Concept Verlag & Werbeagentur GmbH, [p. 30].

A central issue often discussed in this context are the high non-attendance rates increasing with age. An expert confirmed that a high non-attendance rate of migrant Roma as well as German Sinti and Roma living in Cologne and in particular among older children can be observed.⁶⁷ Experts argue that for both groups, **German Sinti and Roma** as well as **migrant Roma**, the high drop-out rates in secondary schools constitute a problem.⁶⁸ According to the survey, 44% have dropped out of the school system without graduation which is in sharp contrast to the majority population (7.5% in 2008).⁶⁹

Study results show relatively poor educational success for **Roma girls**, of whom only a few go into higher education.⁷⁰ In particular, the report says that there is an even higher non-attendance and drop-out rate for girls than for boys, but also emphasises that this varies from Land to Land.⁷¹ Nevertheless, as mentioned in a State Report, Roma women may not have been able to share the progress that women in general have made in education over the past decade in Germany.⁷²

In particular, with regard to **EU nationals from Romania and Bulgaria** in Berlin, the previously mentioned report concludes that this group faces problems with regard to educational success at general schools due to lacking language competences. Furthermore, many of them are illiterate or have never attended school before coming to Germany.⁷³

Moreover, children holding the **residence status of toleration** (Duldung) primarily obtain lower education and attend special schools, while only a few attend higher education schools.⁷⁴

⁶⁷ Interview with Expert E: Representative of the regional Department for the Assistance of Children and Youth of Immigrant Families/RAA, Cologne (Regionale Arbeitsstelle zur Förderung von Kindern und Jugendlichen aus Zuwanderfamilien), Köln, 2 October 2012.

⁶⁸ Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012. [p. 6], Antidiskriminierungsnetzwerk Berlin des Türkischen Bundes in Berlin-Brandenburg (eds.) (2007), [p. 30].

⁶⁹ Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg: I-Verb.de und RomnoKher, [p. 32]. According to Faraco, around 20% of foreign children drop out of the school system without obtaining any certificates of completion, while among Germans, this only applies to 8% of the German youth in the school system.

⁷⁰ ERRC (European Roma Rights Center) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), [p. 24], available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf].

⁷¹ ERRC (European Roma Rights Center) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), [p. 21], available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf].

⁷² ERRC (European Roma Rights Center) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), [p. 24], available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf].

⁷³ [Germany,] *Bezirksamt Neukölln von Berlin – Abteilung Bildung, Schule, Kultur und Sport* (2012), *2. Roma-Statusbericht: Entwicklung der Zuzüge von EU-Unionsbürger aus Südosteuropa: Berlin – Neukölln*, Berlin, [p. 8].

⁷⁴ Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland, [pp. 19].

In this context it is often highlighted that families face permanent threats of deportation, which negatively impacts the children's educational success.⁷⁵

d. Vocational training/qualifications

Even more inequality and deficits of ethnic minority groups can be noted within the vocational training system and the labour market compared to the previously described situation in the general school system.⁷⁶ Even though the situation slightly improved during the last thirty years⁷⁷, there is still a considerable gap between Roma and non-Roma receiving vocational training.

While 83.4% of the majority completed some kind of vocational training, only 18.8% of the German Roma and Sinti received vocational training certificates. Even fewer women received vocational training (women 16.5, men 21.3).⁷⁸

Experts argue that inequalities within the transition from school to work are a major factor explaining the differences between Roma and the majority population. They consider German Sinti and Roma as well as migrant Roma disadvantaged compared to the majority population regarding the access to literacy programmes and second-chance education.⁷⁹

As previously mentioned, lacking school-leaving certificates or low levels of formal education lead to difficulties in acquiring vocational training. In Germany, it is essential to either complete a study course or vocational training offered by schools or training companies in order to find a job. Consequently, without successful completion of vocational training or any type of equivalent education, there is higher risk of unemployment and poverty.

e. Different types of schooling (home education, special schools, etc.)

Based on the information gathered during desk research and expert interviews, it appears that despite the lack of official data, it is frequently argued that Roma are overrepresented in **special schools** for underachievers as well as **promoting schools**.⁸⁰ Due to the absence of official

⁷⁵ Knaus, V. and Widmann, P. (2010), [p. 42]; Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland, [p. 43].

⁸⁰ Grienic, G. (2010), [p. 3], Faraco, C. (2006), OSI 2002, Lüken-Klaßen, D. and Meixner, S. (2004), Strauss (2011), Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland;

⁸⁰ Grienic, G. (2010), [p. 3], Faraco, C. (2006), OSI 2002, Lüken-Klaßen, D. and Meixner, S. (2004), Strauss (2011), Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland;

⁸⁰ Grienic, G. (2010), [p. 3], Faraco, C. (2006), OSI 2002, Lüken-Klaßen, D. and Meixner, S. (2004), Strauss (2011), Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland;

⁸⁰ Grienic, G. (2010), [p. 3], Faraco, C. (2006), OSI 2002, Lüken-Klaßen, D. and Meixner, S. (2004), Strauss (2011), Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland;

Knaus, V. and Widmann, P. (2010), *Integration unter Vorbehalt: Zur Situation von Kindern kosovarischer Roma, Ashkali und Ägypter in Deutschland und nach ihrer Rückführung in den Kosovo*, Köln: Deutsches Komitee für UNICEF e.V.;

Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.).

⁸⁰ Grienic, G. (2010), [p. 3], Faraco, C. (2006), OSI 2002, Lüken-Klaßen, D. and Meixner, S. (2004), Strauss (2011), Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland;

statistics as well as comprehensive studies exact numbers cannot be given. Yet, Sinti and Roma representatives, argue that “the transfer of Sinti and Roma children to special schools occurs at a disproportionately high rate (...)”⁸¹

In another report, experts confirm that **German Sinti and Roma** as well as **migrant Roma** groups are often placed in special schools.⁸² The above mentioned survey supports this assumption. The results clearly indicate that an above-average number of German Sinti and Roma children (10.7%), 9.4% of the group of 14-25 year-olds attend(ed) special primary schools for children, which is in a sharp contrast to the majority population (4.9%).

As previously mentioned a high percentage of **refugee children** are also placed in special schools.⁸³

In addition, an increasing amount of children from **Romania and Bulgaria** with special needs such as language support arrive during the school year. However, there is a waiting list for special schools. In order to solve this problem, “some special courses were established in primary and secondary schools to meet the needs of German language support among children from the new EU accession states.”⁸⁴ Furthermore, schools have increasingly employed additional language mediators since April 2012.⁸⁵

In principle, referral to special schools is based “on a child’s lower academic performance, assessed on the basis of tests and upon the recommendations of teachers”.⁸⁶ There is however, a general consensus that the high rate of Roma at special schools does not indicate a lack of talent or skills among Roma children, but a lack of German language skills as well as a lack of support from their parents and the government.⁸⁷ Furthermore, Roma children are often

Knaus, V. and Widmann, P. (2010), *Integration unter Vorbehalt: Zur Situation von Kindern kosovarischer Roma, Ashkali und Ägypter in Deutschland und nach ihrer Rückführung in den Kosovo*, Köln: Deutsches Komitee für UNICEF e.V.;

Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens’ Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.).

⁸¹ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

⁸² Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012, [p. 6].

⁸³ Knaus, V. and Widmann, P. (2010), [p. 42]; Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland, [p. 30].

⁸⁴ Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES, [p. 9].

⁸⁵ [Germany,] *Bezirksamt Neukölln von Berlin – Abteilung Bildung, Schule, Kultur und Sport* (2012), 2. *Roma-Statusbericht: Entwicklung der Zuzüge von EU-Unionsbürger aus Südosteuropa: Berlin – Neukölln*, Berlin, [p. 8].

⁸⁶ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

⁸⁷ Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012. [p. 6]; OSI (2002), [pp. 143], Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland, [p. 31].

randomly sent to a special school.⁸⁸ Some teachers and school administrations justify this by saying that “these children are allegedly regarded as “a distraction to the normal educational process.”⁸⁹ Furthermore, Roma mediators working in schools observe prejudices, such as “the assumption that Roma children attend school irregularly”.⁹⁰ It is also often argued that “once a child is sent to a special school it is more likely that parents will agree to send their other children to the same school to avoid separating them.”⁹¹

While special schools offer supporting measures that might help children with problems, they constitute an educational-trap for other children. The special school curricula prepare students for basic employment and not for advanced education, and thus make access to training and the labour market more difficult.⁹²

The disadvantaged initial position of some Roma groups which lead to poorer educational success in primary and secondary school, high numbers of drop-outs without graduation as well as overrepresentation in special schools have further consequences for Roma in the job market: A certificate of the lower secondary school (Hauptschule) or an equivalent certificate is the minimum requirement for vocational training. Vocational training is important to gain better opportunities in the labour market in Germany.

f. Issues of segregation and integration

A disproportional high rate of Roma has never attended school or has dropped out of the school system without graduation which is in sharp contrast to the majority population in Germany. Furthermore, an above average number of Roma children attended special primary schools for children (*Förderschulen*).⁹³ In contrast, only a low share attended higher education schools, received vocational training or graduated from universities.

In general, various factors may contribute to this situation: firstly, insufficient **human capital and cultural capital** such as inadequate knowledge of German, high levels of poverty and lack of pre-schooling. Secondly, there is – amongst others in the sense of insufficient support given – **structural discrimination** in the educational system.

It is widely reported, that Roma children face serious disadvantages regarding access to education compared to the majority population. This statement is confirmed by an opinion poll among experts: all respondents argue that Roma do not have equal opportunities regarding higher education.⁹⁴

⁸⁸ Faraco, C. (2006), ‘Country Report Germany’, in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [p. 18 – 29]. [p. 20], Strauß (2011); Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), OSI (2002), [pp. 143], ERRC and EUMAP (2004), [p. 25].

⁸⁹ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

⁹⁰ Faraco, C. (2006), ‘Country Report Germany’, in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [p. 18 – 29].

⁹¹ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

⁹² Lüken-Klaßen, D. and Meixner, S. (2004), *Roma in Public Education*, Bamberg: european forum for migration studies (efms).

⁹³ Faraco, C. (2006), ‘Country Report Germany’, in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [p. 18 – 29].

⁹⁴ Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012.

There are no policies of separate schooling of migrants in place, but **structural discrimination** towards Roma children is believed to be a key factor in education by many Romani leaders. In the German school system, a first selection to separate school children into separate educational tiers takes place after four years. This is seen as a major issue which hinders students whose mother tongue is not German from entering higher educational tiers.⁹⁵ The result is an overrepresentation of minority students in lower education.⁹⁶ In particular, the overrepresentation of Roma in “special schools” as well as “promoting schools” needs to be critically discussed: once children enter a special school they rarely have the opportunities “of re-integrating into the mainstream schooling system, since the curriculum of special schools focuses on preparing pupils for low-skilled labour (...)”.⁹⁷

Furthermore, the quality of the school is often dependent on the city district. According to the regulation “Sprengepflicht” which is applied in some *Länder* for primary education, children are supposed to attend the school which is located in the school district they live in.⁹⁸ Living in disadvantaged areas thus can imply fewer opportunities regarding education.

In addition, the residence status of migrants leads to legal restrictions in many social areas of life which have an impact on the educational opportunities of children. Labour restrictions and a lack of governmental benefits for asylum seekers impose a high financial burden for parents with school children.

Apart from the legal dimension, the **family and individual situation** also contributes to inequality amongst immigrant Roma children and adolescents within their educational career. Low levels of educational achievement amongst parents as well as negative experiences at school and language deficits are often mentioned by experts in order to explain the gap between the levels of education for Roma and non-Roma. Moreover, success in education is significantly dependent on the origin and social status of the child.⁹⁹ The age when the child arrived in Germany and the educational level achieved in the country of origin play a major role in the educational integration of Roma.¹⁰⁰

Moreover, a study on education (2011) found that there is a correlation between school attendance of parents or grandparents and the educational success of children. The more parents or grandparents were educated, the better the educational achievement of the children.¹⁰¹ There is also a correlation between the completion of vocational training by parents or grandparents and the willingness of children to obtain vocational training.¹⁰² Several aspects may contribute to this correlation: it is often stated that “many parents who did not receive education

⁹⁵ Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (2012), *UNO-Menschenrechtsrat, 15.-18. März 2012 in Genf Side Event IMADR am 16. März 2012 – Stellungnahme*.

⁹⁶ Peucker, M. and Lechner, C. (2010), *Machbarkeitsstudie: Standardisierte Datenerhebung zum Nachweis von Diskriminierung!? – Bestandsaufnahme und Ausblick*, Berlin: Antidiskriminierungsstelle des Bundes, [p. 19].

⁹⁷ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

⁹⁸ Link, J. (2011), *Schichttypische Benachteiligung im allgemeinen Bildungswesen: Ein Vergleich zwischen Kanada und Deutschland*. Wiesbaden: VS Verlag, [p. 142].

⁹⁹ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

¹⁰⁰ Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg: I-Verb.de und RomnoKher.

¹⁰¹ Antidiskriminierungsnetzwerk Berlin des Türkischen Bundes in Berlin-Brandenburg (eds.) (2007), *Sinti und Roma - Bürger/-innen unseres Landes*, Berlin: Concept Verlag & Werbeagentur GmbH, [p. 26].

¹⁰² Antidiskriminierungsnetzwerk Berlin des Türkischen Bundes in Berlin-Brandenburg (eds.) (2007), *Sinti und Roma - Bürger/-innen unseres Landes*, Berlin: Concept Verlag & Werbeagentur GmbH, [p. 26].

themselves (or are not proficient in German) are unable to support their children.”¹⁰³ In particular, for secondary education, the classification by grade and school type is also based on the parents’ engagement in the desired educational curriculum.¹⁰⁴ At the same time, “poor living conditions of many school-age Sinti and Roma children [provide] them little space or opportunity to complete their homework.”¹⁰⁵ Children living in refugee homes face difficulties in finding a place to do their homework or to practice German. NGOs and human rights organisations criticise that those families often face permanent threats of deportation, even after long term stay in Germany. Hence, children with this background often stay away from school.¹

Experts further indicate that they encounter a **lack of intercultural openness of schools** in Germany. In many parts of Germany, many schools consist of 90% of students with a migration background, while there are rarely teachers and social workers with a migration background employed at those schools. This leads communication difficulties between parents and teachers.¹⁰⁶ According to experts, there is vast room for improvement in the area of communication between students, parents and teacher. Furthermore, according to an opinion poll amongst teachers, there is a lack of knowledge about (German) Sinti and Roma amongst both teachers and students.¹⁰⁷

An option to support this need is to include education on the history of Sinti and Roma in school curricula.¹⁰⁸ In some *Länder*, e.g. in Baden-Wuerttemberg, the history of Sinti and Roma are included in the school curricula. In this context, the local government provides school materials on the history of Sinti and Roma, also aiming at reducing prejudices towards this group.¹⁰⁹ Yet, according to an expert, many school books show deficits regarding Sinti and Roma issues.¹¹⁰

While all *Länder* try to improve the educational achievements of local Roma children and adolescents through their own education policy, Germany lacks a nationally unified strategy for improving the educational situation of Roma. In general, the education system lacks structures that support the integration of Roma in schools and prevent structural discrimination.

¹⁰³ Antidiskriminierungsnetzwerk Berlin des Türkischen Bundes in Berlin-Brandenburg (eds.) (2007), *Sinti und Roma - Bürger/-innen unseres Landes*, Berlin: Concept Verlag & Werbeagentur GmbH, [p. 26].

¹⁰⁴ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

¹⁰⁵ Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland, [p. 7- 12].

¹⁰⁶ Antidiskriminierungsnetzwerk Berlin des Türkischen Bundes in Berlin-Brandenburg (eds.) (2007), *Sinti und Roma - Bürger/-innen unseres Landes*, Berlin: Concept Verlag & Werbeagentur GmbH, [p. 31].

¹⁰⁷ Mengersen, O. (2012), *Sinti und Roma in der Schule – die Meinung von Lehrerinnen und Lehrern*, in: Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (ed.), *Gleichberechtigte Teilhabe für Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Heidelberg.

¹⁰⁸ Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012, [p. 6].

¹⁰⁹ [Germany,] State Parliament of Baden-Württemberg (*Landtag von Baden-Württemberg*) (2011), ‘Anfrage und Stellungnahme: Situation der Sinti und Roma in Baden-Württemberg’, printed matter 15/472, 02 September 2011, [p. 3].

¹¹⁰ Rolly, H. (2012), *Ethnisierung der Bildungsbenachteiligung*, in: Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (ed.), *Gleichberechtigte Teilhabe für Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Heidelberg, [p. 3].

In addition, members of the Association of German Sinti and Roma as well as researchers argue that the poor educational situation is a result of the persecution of Sinti and Roma in Germany during the Nazi regime and the ensuing ostracism from German society after World War II.¹¹¹

g. Experiences and perceptions of discrimination

Besides structural discrimination, it is often reported that Roma experience **interpersonal discrimination** within their social environment, including at school. Yet, discrimination does not always occur in an obvious way, but often quite subtly and thus is more difficult to measure.

There is no official data on experiences and perceptions of discrimination of Roma in Germany.

The Federal anti-discrimination agency as well as regional and local anti-discrimination offices record complaints about discrimination on the grounds of ethnic origin in the field of education. However, they do not break them down into specific ethnic groups. Thereby, the following data and information stem from surveys of victims of discrimination or expert interviews.

There is a broad consensus that Roma are often confronted with prejudice and stigma. Discrimination is perceived to range from subtle discrimination to overt insults.¹¹² It is reported that Roma are often subjected to stereotypes, open hostility and insults such as “gypsies stink, gypsies steal” by classmates. Moreover, although to a lesser extent, insults and discrimination by teachers in schools are also reported.¹¹³ Some respondents mentioned discrimination by teachers to be purposefully neglecting their needs and making discriminatory comments relating to common stereotypes about their ethnic group.¹¹⁴ This is also confirmed by the previously mentioned victims’ survey (2006): Four out of ten persons stated that their children are treated less favourably at school and argued that their children or grandchildren do not receive sufficient support at school.¹¹⁵

Particularly Roma in refugee homes often face stigmatisation through negative reporting in the media on refugee homes.¹¹⁶ Besides media reports, it is said that teaching materials also include discriminatory content.¹¹⁷

The results of a representative survey among German Sinti and Roma on the experiences of racism and discrimination conducted by the Central Council of German Sinti (2006) clearly reinforced the assumption that Roma experience discrimination: 76% of the respondents have frequently experienced discrimination in social life. Insults and discrimination of children at

¹¹¹ Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg: I-Verb.de und RomnoKher.

¹¹² Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg: I-Verb.de und RomnoKher, [p. 100].

¹¹³ Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (2006), *Ergebnisse der Repräsentativumfrage des Zentralrats Deutscher Sinti und Roma über den Rassismus gegen Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Heidelberg: Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma, available at: [<http://zentralrat.sintiundroma.de/content/downloads/stellungnahmen/UmfrageRassismus06.pdf>].

¹¹⁴ Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg: I-Verb.de und RomnoKher.

¹¹⁵ Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (2006), *Ergebnisse der Repräsentativumfrage des Zentralrats Deutscher Sinti und Roma über den Rassismus gegen Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Heidelberg: Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma, available at: [<http://zentralrat.sintiundroma.de/content/downloads/stellungnahmen/UmfrageRassismus06.pdf>].

¹¹⁶ Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (2012), *UNO-Menschenrechtsrat, 15.-18. März 2012 in Genf Side Event IMADR am 16. März 2012 – Stellungnahme*, [p. 21].

¹¹⁷ Bachmann, L., Büsing, W., Kammerer, J., Yazar, S. (2007), *Roma und der Arbeitsmarkt: Berufs- und Bildungsförderung für Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Berlin: Ed. Parabolis, [p. 62].

school by other students or teachers was the third most frequent individual experience of discrimination.¹¹⁸

Similarly, the recently conducted survey on the educational situation of German Sinti and Roma found that the majority of respondents have experienced discrimination: 25.3% perceive themselves to be regularly or even very often discriminated against, whereas only 17.6% do not consider themselves discriminated against. With regard to experiences of discrimination during their educational career, nearly half of the respondents (41.8%) stated that they experienced discrimination at school. Broken down by age groups, it appears that the youngest group (13-25 years) feels discriminated against less than other groups. While there were no gender-specific differences, marginal differences can be identified when considering individual school types: discrimination in primary school was perceived most frequently (47.9%) as well as in special schools (46.4%) and general secondary school (43.7%). 30% of the respondents experienced discrimination in advanced schools (30%).¹¹⁹ According to school mediators and parents, Roma students experience discrimination in particular during their first school years, as younger students reproduce stereotypes in their environments without realizing it.¹²⁰

In order to avoid discriminatory behaviour by teachers and classmates, German Sinti and Roma often do not publicly make their ethnicity known which results in denial of being Roma in public. In order to avoid discrimination, 44.4% of the interviewed German Sinti and Roma deny their ethnicity in educational settings, vocational trainings or employment.¹²¹

Results of a recently conducted study clearly indicate that perceived discrimination, besides structural discrimination, is one major factor which might negatively impact the educational career of Roma. Discriminatory and defensive experiences with teachers as well as a hostile environment may lead to apathy or poor performance at school.¹²²

Major projects and initiatives

On the background of the EU Roma Framework Strategy, the German Federal Government has been developing a national Roma integration strategy to achieve a better social inclusion in general, as well as revise existing strategies.¹²³ Yet, in terms of education of Sinti and Roma, the Federal Government pointed out that policies and measures relating to education are, in principle, left to the *Länder*.¹²⁴ This implies “varying degrees of engagement with regard to

¹¹⁸ Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (2006), *Ergebnisse der Repräsentativumfrage des Zentralrats Deutscher Sinti und Roma über den Rassismus gegen Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Heidelberg: Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma, [p. 3], available at: <http://zentralrat.sintiundroma.de/content/downloads/stellungnahmen/UmfrageRassismus06.pdf>.

¹¹⁹ Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg: I-Verb.de und RomnoKher, [p. 45].

¹²⁰ Bachmann, L., Büsing, W., Kammerer, J., Yazar, S. (2007), *Roma und der Arbeitsmarkt: Berufs- und Bildungsförderung für Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Berlin: Ed. Parabolis, [p. 63].

¹²¹ Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg: I-Verb.de und RomnoKher, [p. 48].

¹²² Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg: I-Verb.de und RomnoKher, [p. 64].

¹²³ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens` Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.).

¹²⁴ [Germany,] Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2011b), ‘Antwort auf die Kleine Anfrage: Nationale Strategie zur Integration der Roma und Sinti in Deutschland’, printed matter 17/6698, 28 June 2011, [p. 4].

Roma across different *Länder*”.¹²⁵ Besides general measures supporting individual learning available for all students, specific measures such as special support classes in primary schools, German language support, mediators in schools for Roma children, homework assistance or day care centres providing substitute education are only offered in a few *Länder*.¹²⁶

The following major projects and initiatives, co-funded by the EU, are quoted by experts and Romani representatives as positive examples of providing necessary support to Romani children with regard to education. They are carried out at the local level and aimed at specific groups of Roma, such as Roma refugees. The initiatives and projects primarily include educational support measures, but are also aimed at improving the situation in other social areas.

“Amaro Kher”

Since 2004, the intercultural association Rom e.V. in Cologne has run a project for tolerated Roma children in refugee facilities.¹²⁷ The initiative is funded by the European Refugee Fund, the federal state of North Rhine-Westphalia, the youth welfare office of the city of Cologne and the support organisation “Aktion Mensch”. Initially, the initiative only consisted of the school project “Amaro Kher” (“Our house” in Romani), which later was expanded into a day-care centre.¹²⁸ Today, the day-care centre provides places for 15 children between the ages of three and six who are housed in those refugee facilities which are not particularly child-friendly. The school is directed to 30 children between the ages of six and thirteen.¹²⁹

In general, the initiative aims to support Roma children without basic educational preconditions which are necessary for attending standard schools. Overall, the initiative wants to increase the school attendance of Roma children with the help of different social life offers for children and their families. A wide range of opportunities show children the advantages of attending school and give them an alternative to the daily routine within refugee facilities. In order to do so the initiative organises transport to the school, three healthy meals a day, different sporting and leisure activities, youth work and cultural education.

The school project “Amaro Kher” further establishes necessary preconditions for the transition into standard schools of Roma children, such as positive experiences in learning and a well-developed self-confidence in speaking German.¹³⁰ Providing support for learning or developing their Romani language skills is also part of the activities. Another main aim is to facilitate vocational orientation among the Roma children.

Parental involvement plays an important role for ensuring better conditions for successful school attendance. To achieve this, the project provides German language courses (for mothers), a centre for societal and cultural needs (e.g. celebrating weddings, holidays, baptisms), individual counselling on housing, healthcare, juvenile court assistance and the right of residence (Aufenthaltsrecht) while it established a “parents’ café”. Moreover, the project

¹²⁵ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens’ Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 93].

¹²⁶ [Germany,] Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2011c), [p. 1/3]; [Germany,] Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2011b), [p. 48], [Germany,] Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2011d), [p. 8]; Bartlett *et al* (2011), [p. 93], Faraco, C. (2006), ‘Country Report Germany’, in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [p. 18 – 29].

European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia (EUMC) (2006), *Roma and Travellers in public education: An overview of the situation in the EU Member States*, Vienna, EUMC, [p. 71-72].

¹²⁷ See also: [<http://www.romev.de/>].

¹²⁸ See also: [<http://www.amaro-kher.de/>].

¹²⁹ See also: [www.kfi.nrw.de/service/publikationen/PDF/broschuere_begegnung_und_verstaendigung.pdf].

¹³⁰ See also: [www.romev.de/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=33&Itemid=124].

aims to reduce tensions and improve community relations between Roma and non-Roma, as well as between Roma parents and school staff.

The implementation of the initiative is carried out with the help of teachers, social workers and Roma school mediators who are particularly qualified for special schools. The mediators facilitate communication between teachers and Roma children and support them in preparation for school. The intercultural association Rom e.V. closely cooperates with the educational authority and the youth welfare office. In addition, Roma children of the Amaro Kher school and day-care centre have the opportunity to accept offers from an art school, which also cooperates within the initiative.

The inclusion of Roma children and families by means of different offers and possibilities within the initiative enables more knowledge about and confidence in the educational system, which in turn has a positive impact on integration in other areas. One third of more than 100 Roma children who have attended the school of Amaro Kher have achieved the transition to a standard school. Particularly those children who also attended the day-care centre for children of Amaro Kher prior to school were successful in transitioning to standard school. Another indicator of success is that the initiative was limited to a period of five years at the beginning but is now extended to an unlimited period of time.

The sustainability of the initiative is guaranteed as long as there are successful transitions to standard schools, which improves the access to apprenticeships. The initiative appears to be transferable to other cities and countries, provided that sufficient financial resources can be made available.

During his visit in the year 2006, UN Special Envoy Prof. Munoz praised the initiative for enabling Roma children to enforce their right to education.¹³¹

“Labour Market for Roma – Supporting Competencies through Outdoor Trainings and Intercultural Trainings”

One project within the XENOS-Programme¹³² is the project “Labour Market for Roma – Supporting Competencies through Outdoor Trainings and Intercultural Trainings” in Goettingen, which was carried out from June 2009 until May 2011. The Institute for applied cultural research (*Institut für angewandte Kulturforschung e.V.*, ifak) e.V. implemented this project. Funding was provided by the European Social Fund for Germany. The project’s target group were teachers and students, especially those with a Roma background. The project also involved the parents of Roma students, in order to improve their learning environment in general. The trainings were offered in four schools in Goettingen, which have a comparatively high proportion of Roma students.¹³³

The project aimed to strengthen intercultural competences of students through workshops and trainings for students and teachers in Goettingen.¹³⁴ It combined outdoor education and intercultural sensitisation in their activities and exercises. Previous projects showed that outdoor trainings have a positive impact on all adolescents because they make them more open to conversations and reflections on intercultural issues. In addition, by working in intercultural teams, a higher cultural sensitivity of students was achieved. An important consideration within the project was to focus more on competences and resources of migrants rather than on

¹³¹ See also: [www.romev.de/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=105].

¹³² The national funding programme “XENOS – Integration and Diversity”¹³², a follow-up programme of “XENOS – Living and Working with Diversity” (2004-2007), was launched by the Federal Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (Bundesministerium für Arbeit und Soziales, BMAS) in spring 2008 and is co-funded by the European Social Fund (ESF).

¹³³ See also: [www.esf.de/portal/generator/13204/arbeitsmarkt_fuer_roma.html].

¹³⁴ See also: [www.ifak-goettingen.de/ifak/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=107&Itemid=135].

deficits.¹³⁵ Furthermore, according to the project, teacher training should involve reducing insecurities regarding ethnic, cultural and religious diversity and support vocational requirements. The working teams for students, especially for Roma, contribute to strengthening interpersonal communication skills and social competencies, which facilitate access to the labour market. Within the project, it was important to enable dialogue between the school and the target group; therefore, the trainings were adapted according to the circumstances in each school.¹³⁶

The activities within the project have strengthened a higher cultural sensitivity as well as openness towards cultural diversity and thus reduced prejudices.¹³⁷ The sustainability of the project is highlighted, since the materials of the project were revised so that trainings could be used by other establishments as well. In addition, schools were motivated to implement outdoor and intercultural trainings as long-term measures to integrate migrant students.

“Vocational Education, School-based Qualification and Gainful Employment for Roma Adolescents and Young Adults”

The project “Vocational Education, School-based Qualification and Gainful Employment for Roma Adolescents and Young Adults” in Frankfurt/ Main, which is a follow-up project of the EQUAL-Project “Orientation, Qualification and Employment” (2003–2005), was implemented in September 2005. The project responds to the demand of the EU and the World Bank (Decade of Roma Inclusion 2005-2015) to increase efforts in developing projects in the field of education.¹³⁸ Funding has been provided by the Ministry for Social Affairs of Hessen (*Hessisches Sozialministerium*) with resources from the European Refugee Fund, the social and youth welfare office Frankfurt/ Main, the Rhine-Mine Jobcenter and the foundation Pro Region of the Fraport AG.¹³⁹ The main body responsible for the project is the non-governmental Association of Roma e.V. for Roma culture and awareness in Frankfurt/ Main.

The project aims to prepare Roma for employment and to reduce discrimination in relation to the labour market.¹⁴⁰ The target group consists of Roma adolescents and young adults between the age of 16 and 27, primarily Roma from Romania who have been living for over 10 years in Frankfurt/ Main.¹⁴¹ Since 2005, about 300 Roma adolescents and young adults have participated in the project.¹⁴²

The activities of the project include courses (Monday to Wednesday, 9 am to 3.30 pm) such as computer courses, language courses, courses on social sciences, tutoring courses, literacy and providing academic support for the secondary general school certificate as well as vocational orientation through internships within different sectors (e.g. craft, retail, administration, domestic economy). Intensive support by social workers, a range of differentiated courses and close work with parents and families is offered, also by Romani speaking staff. The project proved to be effective. In particular, an increase in the participation of adolescents and young adults in this project who had never attended school or completed an apprenticeship before was achieved.¹⁴³

¹³⁵ Institut für angewandte Kulturforschung e.V. (Hrsg.) (2011), *Schulwege in die Vielfalt – Interkulturelle Lernprozesse erlebnispädagogisch gestaltet*, Göttinger Kulturwissenschaftliche Schriften Band 19, Göttingen, [p. 6ff.].

¹³⁶ See also: [www.ifak-goettingen.de/ifak/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=107&Itemid=135].

¹³⁷ See also: [www.ifak-goettingen.de/ifak/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=107&Itemid=135].

¹³⁸ See also: [www.romadecade.org/].

¹³⁹ See also: [www.foerderevereinroma.de/projekt/entwber2006.htm].

¹⁴⁰ See also: [www.esf-hessen.de/Foerdereverein_Roma_e__V__esf?Channel=Print1%20von].

¹⁴¹ See also: [www.foerderevereinroma.de/projekt/entwber2006.htm].

¹⁴² See also: [www.foerderevereinroma.de/projekt/entwber2006.htm].

¹⁴³ See also: [www.esf-hessen.de/Foerdereverein_Roma_e__V__esf?Channel=Print1%20von].

“Schaworalle”

The previously mentioned project is supporting the activities of the day-care centre and its school project, also located in Frankfurt/ Main, named “Schaworalle” (“Hello children” in Romani). “Schaworalle” was founded within the framework of the Association of Roma e.V. in September 1999.¹⁴⁴ The aim of “Schaworalle” is to provide Romanian Roma children and young people a basis for educational success in regular kindergarten groups and “substitute education” for those who are of school age but currently do not attend a regular school. The project “Schaworalle” also includes additional opportunities for Roma children and families in cooperation with Roma and non-Roma. The success of “Schaworalle” is well-known among experts throughout Germany and it increasingly serves as a model for other projects supporting Roma.¹⁴⁵ Children and adolescents in “Schaworalle” are entitled to support until reaching the age of 16 which is when they may get the opportunity to participate in the project “Vocational Education, School-based Qualification and Gainful Employment for Roma Adolescents and Young Adults”.

¹⁴⁴ See also: [www.schaworalle.de/].

¹⁴⁵ See also: [www.schaworalle.de/info/jb2011.pdf].

3 Employment

As in the area of education, it is difficult to provide reliable statistics and quantitative data on the situation of Roma in the labour market due to a lack of data on ethnic minorities in Germany. However, based on qualitative information and small-scale research conducted by civil society organisations it is possible to identify the various issues related to labour market integration of Roma. Therefore, it is necessary to differentiate between a formal and a social dimension to understand the challenges in this field. On a formal level, Germany has several legal provisions against discrimination on grounds of ethnicity aimed at guaranteeing equal access to the labour market for persons with the same legal status. On a non-formal level however, various shortcomings and challenges arise.

a. Paid employment

No Roma-specific legal instruments exist given that German Sinti and Roma have the same rights as any other German citizen. However, migrant Roma face difficult conditions in the labour market when compared to Roma with German citizenship. Depending on their **residence status**, migrant Roma may not be able to get a formal job.¹⁴⁶ Moreover, the issuance of a work permit depends on residence status of Roma migrants. Migrants need a permanent settlement permit (*Niederlassungserlaubnis*), a residence permit (*Aufenthaltserlaubnis*) or an EC long-term residence permit (*Erlaubnis zum Daueraufenthalt*) in order to be allowed to work or to start their own business in Germany.¹⁴⁷ Recognized asylum seekers and refugees receive temporary residence permits (*befristete Aufenthaltserlaubnis*), which allow them to work or to obtain vocational training. Asylum seekers and refugees with the status of toleration (*Duldung*) are allowed to apply for a work permit after one year. However, they only have limited or subordinate access to the labour market meaning that national employees have priority on the labour market.¹⁴⁸ With the implementation of new regulations exceptions are made for high-skilled migrants.¹⁴⁹ In general, the German law does not provide for legalising the situation of irregular immigrants in order to ensure their right to work. EU citizens do not need these permissions a work permit and as such, in general, Roma who are EU citizens enjoy privileged rights according to the Freedom of Movement Law¹⁵⁰ and to the General Administrative Regulations¹⁵¹ including unlimited access to the German labour market.¹⁵²

Yet, Germany has imposed **transitional restrictions** on the access to the national labour market for workers from the new EU member states, Bulgaria and Romania. Although the right of freedom of movement is not affected, EU citizens from those countries are not yet allowed to

¹⁴⁶ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens` Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [pp. 67, 108, 129].

¹⁴⁷ [Germany,] Residence Act (*Gesetz über den Aufenthalt, die Erwerbstätigkeit und die Integration von Ausländern im Bundesgebiet, AufenthG*), 20 July 2004. articles 4, 5, 7, 9, 9a, 12, 16.

¹⁴⁸ Aumüller, J. and Bretl, C. (2008), *Lokale Gesellschaften und Flüchtlinge: Förderung von sozialer Integration – Die kommunale Integration von Flüchtlingen in Deutschland*, Berlin: Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung, [p. 11].

¹⁴⁹ Migazin (2012), 'Bundesregierung verabschiedet Blaue Karte', 30 April 2012, available at: [www.migazin.de/2012/04/30/bundesregierung-verabschiedet-blaue-karte/].

¹⁵⁰ See Article 2 (1) *FreizügG/EU*.

¹⁵¹ See No. 2.1 *VV FreizügG/EU*.

¹⁵² [Germany,] *Bezirksamt Neukölln von Berlin – Abteilung Bildung, Schule, Kultur und Sport* (2012), 2. *Roma-Statusbericht: Entwicklung der Zuzüge von EU-Unionsbürger aus Südosteuropa: Berlin – Neukölln*, Berlin, [p. 7].

access the national labour market like other EU citizens.¹⁵³ Workers from Bulgaria and Romania need an EU work permit, which is issued by the International Placement Services of the federal employment agency (*Zentrale Auslands- und Fachvermittlung der Bundesagentur für Arbeit, ZAV*).¹⁵⁴ These transitional restrictions are planned to be lifted by 1 January 2014.¹⁵⁵ One exception is made however taking into account Germany's special regulations for highly qualified workers. Therefore, citizens from Bulgaria and Romania, who seek employment that requires a qualified vocational training, can receive an EU work permit upon request without a prior check whether a German or other EU citizen might also be available for the job. For qualified on-the-job training in a state-recognized or similarly accredited training occupation, trainees do not need an EU work permit. Seasonal workers in agriculture and forestry, in the hotel industry and gastronomy, in fruit and vegetables processing as well as in sawmills do not need a work permit. Citizens from Bulgaria or Romania who had a work permit for at least twelve months are eligible to receive a EU work permit, which guarantees unrestricted access to the German labour market.¹⁵⁶

Several studies point out, that the **average income** of Roma in paid employment is lower than the national average.¹⁵⁷ In general, third country nationals receive lower pay rates than German nationals. The data baseline does not allow for certain explanations of the lower pay rates of third country nationals.¹⁵⁸ A survey among Roma migrants from Bulgaria and Romania in the district Neukölln in Berlin shows examples of low wages for employment in the construction industry and gastronomy.¹⁵⁹

b. Self-employment

Roma migrants, including citizens from Bulgaria and Romania, are generally allowed to be **self-employed**. According to experts, many persons make use of this opportunity and register a business. Data provided by the trade licensing authority of the Neukölln district in Berlin shows that 1377 Bulgarian and 1034 Romanian citizens have registered a business. Self-employed persons from Bulgaria and Romania are often subcontractors and 'falsely' self-

¹⁵³ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 12].

¹⁵⁴ [Germany,] Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Innern*) (2011a), *Report from the Federal Republic of Germany to the European Commission – An EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020: Integrated packages of measures to promote the integration and participation of Sinti and Roma in Germany*, [p. 40].

¹⁵⁵ [Germany,] *Bezirksamt Neukölln von Berlin – Abteilung Bildung, Schule, Kultur und Sport* (2012), 2. *Roma-Statusbericht: Entwicklung der Zuzüge von EU-Unionsbürger aus Südosteuropa: Berlin – Neukölln*, Berlin, [p. 7].

¹⁵⁶ [Germany,] Commissioner of the Berlin Senate for Integration and Migration (*Beauftragter des Senats von Berlin für Integration und Migration*) (2012), *Roma und europäische Wanderarbeitnehmerin-nen und –arbeitnehmer: Rechtsgrundlagen zu Aufenthalt und Bildung sowie Kontaktstellen*, Berlin: Senatsverwaltung für Arbeit, Integration und Frauen, [p. 2-3].

¹⁵⁷ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 129].

¹⁵⁸ Engels, D., Köller, R., Koopmans, R., Höhne, J. (2011), *Zweiter Integrationsindikatorenbericht erstellt für die Beauftragte der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration*, Köln/Berlin, [p. 198].

¹⁵⁹ Amaro Drom e.V., *Zielgruppenspezifische Unterstützungsbedarfe der Roma-Communities im Flughafenkiez: Auswertung der aktivierenden Befragung unter Bewohnergruppen mit Roma-Hintergrund und der Expertengespräche mit Bildungs- und Nachbarschaftseinrichtungen in den Quartiersmanagementgebieten Flughafenstraße und Donaustraße Nord*, Berlin, [p. 25].

employed in construction, as is mentioned in a field report on a district of Berlin.¹⁶⁰ This data does not provide any information about ethnic origin. However, in order to prevent further ‘false’ self-employment, it is no longer sufficient to register planned employment at the trade licensing authority but to prove the actual everyday job, which has to be classified as commercial (*gewerblich*) or freelance (*freiberuflich*).¹⁶¹ The status of self-employment is often associated with weak social protection, especially in the case of ‘false’ self-employment.¹⁶²

c. Communal work and other forms of payment schemes

In general, working-age people are eligible to receive state support.¹⁶³ Workers entitled to freedom of movement, self-employed and persons entitled to freedom of movement under the Freedom of Movement Law¹⁶⁴ are able to list their family members to receive support according to the Social Code II. (*SGB II*). Those who only stay in Germany in order to find a job are not entitled to register their family members for these benefits.¹⁶⁵ It has not been settled yet, if this federal regulation is valid under EU law.¹⁶⁶

Self-employed citizens from Bulgaria or Romania who do not earn enough money to secure a livelihood for them and their families are eligible for additional support according to the regulations of the German social legislation.¹⁶⁷ Thus, all Roma who are generally allowed to work in Germany due to their legal status are entitled to get **support** in case they do not find an apprenticeship or employment. These measures include vocational counselling and support in the recruitment procedure. If the relevant requirements set in the Social Code II or III (*SGB II* or *III*.) are met every person has equal access to support, regardless of nationality or ethnicity. This also applies to benefits for self-employed individuals following unemployment.¹⁶⁸ Still, these preconditions seem not to result in higher employment rates of Roma and the problem remains that long-term unemployed persons are *de facto* excluded from the labour market.¹⁶⁹

¹⁶⁰ [Germany,] *Bezirksamt Neukölln von Berlin – Abteilung Bildung, Schule, Kultur und Sport* (2012), 2. *Roma-Statusbericht: Entwicklung der Zuzüge von EU-Unionsbürger aus Südosteuropa: Berlin – Neukölln*, Berlin, [pp. 6-7].

¹⁶¹ [Germany,] Commissioner of the Berlin Senate for Integration and Migration (*Beauftragter des Senats von Berlin für Integration und Migration*) (2012), *Roma und europäische Wanderarbeitnehmerinnen und –arbeitnehmer: Rechtsgrundlagen zu Aufenthalt und Bildung sowie Kontaktstellen*, Berlin: Senatsverwaltung für Arbeit, Integration und Frauen, [p. 3].

¹⁶² Faraco, C. (2006), ‘Country Report Germany’, in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [p. 18 – 29];

Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

¹⁶³ See article 7 (1) sentence 2 of the Social Code II. (*Artikel 7 (1) Satz 2 SGB II*).

¹⁶⁴ See article 2 (3) *FreizügG/EU*.

¹⁶⁵ See article 7 (1) number 1-2 *SGB II*.

¹⁶⁶ [Germany,] Commissioner of the Berlin Senate for Integration and Migration (*Beauftragter des Senats von Berlin für Integration und Migration*) (2012), *Roma und europäische Wanderarbeitnehmerinnen und –arbeitnehmer: Rechtsgrundlagen zu Aufenthalt und Bildung sowie Kontaktstellen*, Berlin, Senatsverwaltung für Arbeit, Integration und Frauen, [p. 6].

¹⁶⁷ [Germany,] *Bezirksamt Neukölln von Berlin – Abteilung Bildung, Schule, Kultur und Sport* (2012), 2. *Roma-Statusbericht: Entwicklung der Zuzüge von EU-Unionsbürger aus Südosteuropa: Berlin – Neukölln*, Berlin, [p. 7].

¹⁶⁸ [Germany,] Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Innern*) (2011a), *Report from the Federal Republic of Germany to the European Commission – An EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020: Integrated packages of measures to promote the integration and participation of Sinti and Roma in Germany*, [p. 41].

¹⁶⁹ Faraco, C. (2006), ‘Country Report Germany’, in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [p. 18 – 29].

d. Unemployment

Although it is not possible to assess the exact **unemployment** rate among the group of Roma due to a lack of data on ethnic minorities, experts as well as Sinti and Roma representatives estimate that more than 60% of Roma are unemployed.¹⁷⁰ An expert mentions that many Roma generally face obstacles in getting formal employment.¹⁷¹ An opinion poll from 2012 pointed out that the situation of Roma who immigrated to Germany as refugees is especially precarious. After years in which they were prohibited to work due to their legal status (*Duldung*) and their often low qualifications, it is very difficult to find a formal job.¹⁷² Due to the absence of relevant data there is no assessment of the unemployment rate among Roma but it is assumed that Roma, both men and women, show higher rates of unemployment than the majority population.¹⁷³

Germany does not identify or formulate concrete goals to reduce the unemployment rate among Roma which is, according to experts, significantly higher than the average employment rate in Germany.¹⁷⁴ This approach toward the Roma integration strategy reflects the attitude of the German government towards the situation of Roma in Germany which differs significantly from the perception of experts and Roma representatives. The German government assumes that German Sinti and Roma regard themselves as well-integrated in German society.¹⁷⁵

Several studies identified different factors contributing to the often stated lower employment rate and the problems concerning **employability** of Roma. The overall poorer educational performance within the Roma community affects their chances in the labour market.¹⁷⁶ Access to jobs for Roma is often limited due to a lack of formal education.¹⁷⁷ Underachievement in the German education system is not the only reason for disadvantages in the access to the labour market. Discrimination and antiziganism impede equal opportunities and lead to Roma's exclusion from the labour market. Stereotypes on parts of employers seem to be a reason for the rejection of applications for internships or apprenticeships in the case of young Roma. Experiences from interviews show that it is easier to get an internship or an apprenticeship if the employer is not informed about the applicant's ethnic background. For some employers,

¹⁷⁰ Faraco, C. (2006), 'Country Report Germany', in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [p. 18 – 29].

¹⁷¹ Interview with Expert B, Förderverein Roma e.V., Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

¹⁷² Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012, [p. 9].

¹⁷³ ERRC (European Roma Rights Center) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), [p. 26], available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf].

¹⁷⁴ European Commission, Directorate-General for Justice (2012), [p. 8].

¹⁷⁵ [Germany,] Federal Government (2011b), [p. 3].;

Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012, [p. 15-16].

¹⁷⁶ Faraco, C. (2006), 'Country Report Germany', in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [p. 18 – 29].

¹⁷⁷ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 129].

ethnicity does not enter into their decision especially if they personally got to know the applicants and their qualifications. The interviewed expert identifies the challenge of a ‘self-fulfilling prophecy’ meaning that general stereotypes about Sinti and Roma, like unwillingness to work, exacerbate the issue concerning the employability of Roma.¹⁷⁸ Another factor concerning especially Roma women, mentioned in a report in 2004, is that Roma often live in remote housing, which prevents them from easily accessing the work place in case there is poor transport infrastructure.¹⁷⁹ An additional disadvantageous factor mentioned is that there is no demand for traditional Roma occupations on the German labour market.¹⁸⁰

The situation of **Roma women** is affected by additional elements. Experiences of civil society organisations offering vocational training show that employment and the economic situation of Roma women are affected by certain gender-related circumstances. For example, women had to skip/miss lessons due to family affairs, like childcare or care of elderly persons.¹⁸¹ It was reported that traditional family planning weakens the importance of a career for Roma women.¹⁸² Furthermore, the often precarious residence status reportedly restrained planning in a long-term perspective and resulted in a lack of motivation.¹⁸³ This may be the case for both Roma women and men.

A critical issue in the field of employment is **informal employment** among Roma who are consequently excluded from the social security system.¹⁸⁴ According to an expert, two different kinds of factors contribute to informal employment. Firstly, the need for informal workers by employers constitutes a general problem on the labour market and so does wage dumping. Secondly, many employers are unwilling to transform undeclared work into regular employment. Additionally, Roma are often not able to provide relevant qualification certificates to get regular employment. The expert assumes that for Roma migrants there may be even more incentives for informal employment because they have to deal with more obstacles when trying to access the regular labour market, such as language barriers and discrimination because of physical appearance.¹⁸⁵

¹⁷⁸ Interview with Expert B, Förderverein Roma e.V., Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

¹⁷⁹ ERRC (European Roma Rights Center) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), [p. 26], available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf].

¹⁸⁰ Faraco, C. (2006), ‘Country Report Germany’, in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [pp. 20].

¹⁸¹ Faraco, C. (2006), ‘Country Report Germany’, in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [pp. 26 – 28].

¹⁸² Interview with Expert B, Förderverein Roma e.V., Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

¹⁸³ Faraco, C. (2006), ‘Country Report Germany’, in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [pp. 26 – 28].

¹⁸⁴ Faraco, C. (2006), ‘Country Report Germany’, in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [p. 20]; [Germany.] Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [pp. 141-224].

¹⁸⁵ Interview with Expert B, Förderverein Roma e.V., Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

e. Child labour

Concerning child labour, no studies or respective experiences among Roma in Germany have been published or mentioned.

f. Old age pension

The German pension system is made up of three pillars. Firstly, the social security system includes a statutory pension insurance (*gesetzliche Rentenversicherung, GRV*), which mainly serves as pension for employees. The German pension insurance is the responsible institution for the statutory pension scheme, which is regulated by the Social Code VI. (*Sozialgesetzbuch, SGB VI*). The second pillar consists of company pension plans consisting of a voluntary payment made by employers. Employees are also allowed to pay part of their wages into the company pension. The last pillar includes private provisions, such as investments in real estate, shares or private life insurance. While the last two pillars require sufficient income to additionally provide for old age, the first column is the most important one for the majority. The level of pension benefits depends on the duration of employment.¹⁸⁶ Taking into consideration that unemployment is presumable high among Roma and that many persons work in the informal sector, it can be assumed that pensions are not secured for this group. Generally, the effects of several German pension reforms on the support of elderly migrants are hardly discussed by academics or politicians.¹⁸⁷

g. Experiences and perceptions of discrimination

The General Equal Treatment Act (*Allgemeines Gleichbehandlungsgesetz, AGG*) constitutes Germany's core **anti-discrimination legislation** and is the most specific legislation prohibiting ethnic or racial discrimination in employment. The *AGG* aims to prevent and to eliminate discrimination on grounds of 'race' or ethnic origin, sex/gender, religion or belief, disability, sexual identity or age.¹⁸⁸ It does not contain any provisions on Sinti and Roma in particular.¹⁸⁹ The *AGG* regulates discrimination in employment and occupation, including the selection of applicants for job positions.¹⁹⁰ Former legislation did not include provisions prohibiting discrimination in the job recruitment procedure.¹⁹¹ Before the *AGG* entered into force, article 3 of the German Basic Law (*Grundgesetz für die Bundesrepublik Deutschland, GG*) provided general legislation against discrimination.

Concerning **perceptions of discrimination**, a survey conducted by the *Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma* in 2006 showed that 44% of the respondents experienced discrimination in the job recruitment process. Others reported that they were dismissed after their ethnicity became

¹⁸⁶ Frick, J. R., Grabka, M. M., Groh-Samberg, O., Hertel, F. R., Tucci, I. (2009), *Alterssicherung von Personen mit Migrationshintergrund*, Berlin: Deutsches Institut für Wirtschaftsforschung, [p. 47-48].

¹⁸⁷ Frick, J. R., Grabka, M. M., Groh-Samberg, O., Hertel, F. R., Tucci, I. (2009), *Alterssicherung von Personen mit Migrationshintergrund*, Berlin: Deutsches Institut für Wirtschaftsforschung, [p. 47].

¹⁸⁸ See article 1 *AGG*. Germany, General Equal Treatment Act (*Allgemeines Gleichbehandlungsgesetz, AGG*), 14 August 2006.

¹⁸⁹ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 129].

¹⁹⁰ Nickel, R. (2006), 'Das Allgemeine Gleichbehandlungsgesetz: Einführung und Würdigung', available at: [www.migration-boell.de/web/diversity/48_804.asp].

¹⁹¹ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), 'The Situation of Roma in Germany', in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

known.¹⁹² Similar accounts were mentioned in an expert interview, where Roma remain silent about their ethnic origin due to previous personal experiences or other Roma's experiences. Reportedly, in some cases the situation at work deteriorated significantly after one's ethnicity became known, even if the person had already worked there for a long time. The expert assumes that the vast majority of Roma tries to remain silent about their ethnicity.¹⁹³

A report from several civil society organisations representing the interests of Roma shows similar findings concerning discrimination. An opinion poll of Roma and Sinti civil society organisations concerning the situation of German Sinti and Roma and migrant Roma in the fields of education, employment, health and housing was conducted in 2012. Additionally, experts and activists were interviewed about these issues. The results show that, according to the opinion of the 26 respondents, neither German Sinti and Roma nor migrant Roma seem to have equal opportunities in gaining access to the labour market. Furthermore, most of the respondents assume that Roma experience discrimination in self-employment because of their ethnic origin.¹⁹⁴ Respondents state that Roma avoid mentioning their ethnic origin in most areas of life because they have experienced that stigmatisation/ labelling puts them at a disadvantage in almost all areas of life, including employment. The consequences are social exclusion and discrimination.¹⁹⁵

Minorities as well as migrants can join a German **trade union**, and if they do they have the same rights and duties as German members. It seems that trade unions do not engage in specific activities recruiting or supporting the rights of Roma. Nevertheless, it is part of the statute of the German Federation of Trade Unions (*Deutscher Gewerkschaftsbund, DGB*) to actively fight discrimination on the grounds of sex, race, ethnic origin, religion or belief system, disability, age or sexual orientation, whenever it occurs in the economy, the state or in society.¹⁹⁶

To conclude, according to the German law, German Sinti and Roma have the same rights on the labour market as others. Yet, the main problem is that "the labour market cannot be adapted to the needs of the job seekers, whereas the job seeker needs to adapt to the conditions and requirements of the labour market". Specific education and qualification programmes could contribute to an improvement of the labour market situation of German Sinti and Roma as well as migrant Roma. Especially the legal situation of migrant Roma and of migrants in general is often very unfavourable for labour market integration.¹⁹⁷

Major projects or initiatives

Compared to other EU member states, Germany has no specific **national strategy** and programme for improving the employment situation of Roma in Germany. Some employment

¹⁹² Bachmann, L., Büsing, W., Kammerer, J., Yazar, S. (2007), *Roma und der Arbeitsmarkt: Berufs- und Bildungsförderung für Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Berlin: Ed. Parabolis, [p. 64].

¹⁹³ Interview with Expert B, Förderverein Roma e.V., Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

¹⁹⁴ Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012, [p. 3, 9].

¹⁹⁵ Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012, [p. 5].

¹⁹⁶ See also: [Germany,] German Federation of Trade Unions (*Deutscher Gewerkschaftsbund, DGB*): [\[www.dgb.de/uber-uns/dgb-heute/satzung\]](http://www.dgb.de/uber-uns/dgb-heute/satzung).

¹⁹⁷ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 130].

measures addressing the needs of Roma have been implemented at the regional level while there are no specific employment policy measures at the national level. Thus, programmes for Roma employment are very limited in Germany.¹⁹⁸

At the local level, there are projects to improve qualifications and to provide vocational training for minorities as well as projects for labour market integration and career guidance.¹⁹⁹ The access to employment via dual vocational education constitutes an important possibility for migrants and minorities to access the labour market.²⁰⁰

The German federal government believes that no specific employment measures targeting specifically Roma should be implemented as German Sinti and Roma have the same opportunities as other employees for support.²⁰¹ Thus, the German Roma Integration strategy implementing the EU Framework until 2020 does not make any specific provisions in the field of employment but supports integration “under the general worker-focused integration concept available to all Sinti and Roma”.²⁰² Thereby, the German government highlights the European Structure Fund (ESF) which is used to improve labour market access and integration of disadvantaged persons.²⁰³ The German approach is problem-orientated and considers the *Länder* to be responsible for the integration of Roma. The *Länder* use the structural funds according to their specific needs.²⁰⁴

Several non-governmental organisations have established projects to improve the employability of Roma and to promote diversity and anti-discriminatory attitudes on parts of employers. Furthermore, neighbourhood management, district administration, labour market administrations, social partners, welfare associations as well as different charitable foundations and migrant organisations are considered to be important cooperation partners to improve the

¹⁹⁸ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens` Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 12-13, 110-111].

¹⁹⁹ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens` Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 112, 130].

²⁰⁰ Bachmann, L., Büsing, W., Kammerer, J., Yazar, S. (2007), *Roma und der Arbeitsmarkt: Berufs- und Bildungsförderung für Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Berlin: Ed. Parabolis, [p. 52-53]

Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels, European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens` Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 129].

²⁰¹ [Germany,] Federal Government (*Bundesregierung*) (2011a), ‘Antwort der Bundesregierung auf die Große Anfrage der Abgeordneten Volker Beck (Köln), Tom Koenigs, Manuel Sarrazin, weiterer Abgeordneter und der Fraktion BÜNDNIS 90/DIE GRÜNEN – Drucksache 17/5536 – Zur Situation von Roma in der Europäischen Union und in den (potentiellen) EU-Beitrittskandidatenstaaten’, Printed matter 17/7131, 22 September 2011.

²⁰² European Commission, Directorate-General for Justice (2012), *National Roma Integration Strategies: a first step in the implementation of the EU Framework*, [p. 31].

²⁰³ [Germany,] Federal Government (*Bundesregierung*) (2011b), ‘Antwort der Bundesregierung auf die Kleine Anfrage der Abgeordneten Volker Beck (Köln), Tom Koenigs, Marieluise Beck (Bremen), weiterer Abgeordneter und der Fraktion BÜNDNIS 90/DIE GRÜNEN – Drucksache 17/6582 – Verabschiedung einer nationalen Strategie zur Integration der Roma’, Printed matter 17/6698, 28 July 2011, [p. 5].

²⁰⁴ European Commission, Directorate-General for Justice (2012), *National Roma Integration Strategies: a first step in the implementation of the EU Framework*, [p. 31]; Germany, Federal Government (*Bundesregierung*) (2011a), ‘Antwort der Bundesregierung auf die Große Anfrage der Abgeordneten Volker Beck (Köln), Tom Koenigs, Manuel Sarrazin, weiterer Abgeordneter und der Fraktion BÜNDNIS 90/DIE GRÜNEN – Drucksache 17/5536 – Zur Situation von Roma in der Europäischen Union und in den (potentiellen) EU-Beitrittskandidatenstaaten’, Printed matter 17/7131, 22 September 2011, [p. 50].

labour market integration of Roma.²⁰⁵ Some identified positive initiatives in the area of labour are presented in the following section.

“Kumulus Plus – A Pool of Consultation and Mediation for Roma and Sinti”

The project “Kumulus Plus – A Pool of Consultation and Mediation for Roma and Sinti” was implemented from 2005 to 2007.²⁰⁶ The Regional Office for Education, Integration and Democracy in Berlin (*Regionale Arbeitsstellen für Bildung, Integration und Demokratie e.V., RAA*) was in charge of the project.²⁰⁷ The project was one of ten subprojects of the development partnership “Kumulus Plus – Integration and Qualification” in the subject area ‘Facilitation of the access or the return to the labour market’ within the German EQUAL programme. This subproject aimed to support disadvantaged people in the labour market. Within the subject, area models have been developed which should help to eliminate personal and structural entry barriers to the labour market.

Specifically, the project “Kumulus Plus – A Pool of Consultation and Mediation for Roma and Sinti” aimed to disseminate already existing offers for training and to support literacy and the knowledge of the German language as basic requirements for employment and advanced trainings. Furthermore, the project offered job application trainings. The project functioned as a contact point with the possibility of referring persons in need to psychological and medical services.²⁰⁸ Consultations were structured according to the principle ‘Help them to help themselves’, which were offered by Romani speaking mediators.

Thus, dismantling barriers in communication between public employment services and people in search of advice was also part of the project. The accompaniment and consulting of project participants to different institutions have promoted open dialogue. Raising awareness among staff of public institutions created a better understanding of the special needs of their Roma clients. The project has achieved a measurable improvement of the participants’ knowledge of German through diverse trainings. Moreover, the mediated internships and qualification programmes have led to an improvement of the participants’ employability in many cases.²⁰⁹

“Ways into gainful Employment”

The association KAROLA – International Meeting Place for Women and Girls e.V., located in Hamburg, provides consultations and learning programmes for women with a migration background and for Roma women in particular.²¹⁰ Since 2005, the association has carried out six projects in order to improve the education and health of Roma women and girls.

²⁰⁵ [Germany,] Federal Government (*Bundesregierung*) (2011a), ‘Antwort der Bundesregierung auf die Große Anfrage der Abgeordneten Volker Beck (Köln), Tom Koenigs, Manuel Sarrazin, weiterer Abgeordneter und der Fraktion BÜNDNIS 90/DIE GRÜNEN – Drucksache 17/5536 – Zur Situation von Roma in der Europäischen Union und in den (potentiellen) EU-Beitrittskandidatenstaaten’, Printed matter 17/7131, 22 September 2011, [p. 43].

²⁰⁶ See also: [www.kumulus-plus.de].

²⁰⁷ See also: [www.raa-berlin.de].

²⁰⁸ Bakar, R., Hofert, A., Kraake, A., Leucht, C., Lorenz, M., Niederer, S., Stroux, M. (2007), Zugang zum Arbeitsmarkt für Roma und für Sinti: Informationen zur beruflichen Integration von Roma und Sinti in Deutschland, Hamburg, Arbeitsgruppe Roma und Sinti im Rahmen des Nationalen Thematischen Netzwerks Asyl in der europäischen Gemeinschaftsinitiative EQUAL, [p. 10-11].

²⁰⁹ Bakar, R., Hofert, A., Kraake, A., Leucht, C., Lorenz, M., Niederer, S., Stroux, M. (2007), Zugang zum Arbeitsmarkt für Roma und für Sinti: Informationen zur beruflichen Integration von Roma und Sinti in Deutschland, Hamburg, Arbeitsgruppe Roma und Sinti im Rahmen des Nationalen Thematischen Netzwerks Asyl in der europäischen Gemeinschaftsinitiative EQUAL, [p. 10-11].

²¹⁰ See also: [www.karola-hamburg.de].

“Ways into gainful Employment” is one of the projects, which has been carried out between July 2005 and the end of 2007. It was funded by the European Social Fund, the development partnership Fluchtort Hamburg, the Federal Ministry for Labour and Social Affairs and the Free and Hanseatic City of Hamburg. About 60 Roma women and girls have participated in the project.²¹¹ It was aimed at supporting Roma women and girls without a secure residence status in Germany in getting access to school, apprenticeships and paid employment.²¹² In particular, the social situation of Roma women and girls should be improved through development of their competencies and support of their ability to act independently.²¹³ An additional main objective was to create a cultural meeting point where Roma and non-Roma can exchange experiences.²¹⁴

²¹¹ Bakar, R., Hofert, A., Kraake, A., Leucht, C., Lorenz, M., Niederer, S., Stroux, M. (2007), Zugang zum Arbeitsmarkt für Roma und für Sinti: Informationen zur beruflichen Integration von Roma und Sinti in Deutschland, Hamburg, Arbeitsgruppe Roma und Sinti im Rahmen des Nationalen Thematischen Netzwerks Asyl in der europäischen Gemeinschaftsinitiative EQUAL, [pp. 6-7].

²¹² Netzwerk “FLUCHTort Hamburg” (2006), ‘Wege in die Erwerbsarbeit – Beratung und Qualifizierung für Roma-Frauen’, in *Newsletter Netzwerk FLUCHTort Hamburg: Berufliche Qualifizierung für Flüchtlinge*, No. 1, March 2006.

²¹³ Netzwerk “FLUCHTort Hamburg” (2006), ‘Wege in die Erwerbsarbeit – Beratung und Qualifizierung für Roma-Frauen’, in *Newsletter Netzwerk FLUCHTort Hamburg: Berufliche Qualifizierung für Flüchtlinge*, No. 1, March 2006.

²¹⁴ Bender-Jarju, S. and Torres Mendes, C. (2007), ‘Bildungsarbeit mit geflüchteten Frauen’, in: EQUAL Entwicklungspartnerschaft FLUCHTort Hamburg (ed.), *Lernen trotz Trauma: Möglichkeiten der beruflichen Qualifizierung von kriegs- und fluchttraumatisierten Frauen*, Hamburg, [p. 36-43].

4 Housing and neighbourhood

Similar to other social aspects dealt with in this study, it is challenging to paint a comprehensive picture combining the various aspects of the housing situation of Roma given the lack of data and the fact that housing conditions differ significantly among Roma groups.²¹⁵ While many Roma suffer from poor housing, other Roma families live in the same housing as or better than non-Roma.²¹⁶ Contrary to prevailing prejudices the vast majority of Roma in Germany are sedentary.²¹⁷ A few encampments and caravan sites for Roma still exist in Germany; nevertheless it would be false to suggest that this indicates an existent form of semi-sedentary or even itinerant lifestyle of Roma in Germany.²¹⁸

Due to the fact that there is no official data available, besides rare data at the local level, the following information is largely based on results of qualitative studies which often solely refer to the situation of individual cities.

a. Quality and affordability of housing

The information that is available on the quality of housing suggests that housing conditions vary amongst Roma. While some Roma families live in the same conditions as most Germans, others suffer from sub-standard housing conditions.²¹⁹

Experts argue that the housing conditions of Roma in Germany are dependent on citizenship, amongst other factors. In particular, Roma who are categorised as ‘tolerated’ face difficulties in finding good quality housing.²²⁰ Furthermore, housing conditions vary not only between and among Roma groups, but also depend on location.

With regard to **German Sinti and Roma**, historical developments cannot be neglected in order to understand their current housing situation. After World War II many Sinti and Roma were accommodated in emergency camps.²²¹ In many areas, Sinti and Roma had been living in emergency housing which was characterised by simplicity and poor standard until the 1970/80s,

²¹⁵ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [pp. 141-224].

²¹⁶ Mihok, B. and Widmann, P. (2007), ‘Die Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Fallbeispiele aus fünf Städten’, in: Schlagintweit, R. and Rupprecht, R. (eds.): *Zwischen Integration und Isolation: Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland und Südosteuropa*, Berlin: Metropol Verlag, [pp. 22-23];

Council of Europe (1999), *Housing, urban planning and poverty: problems faced by Roma / Gypsy communities with particular reference to central and eastern Europe*, available at: [www.coe.int/T/DG3/RomaTravellers/documentation/housing/Housingreport(99)1Macura_en.asp].

Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens’ Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.). [p. 155].

²¹⁷ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens’ Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 155].

²¹⁸ Peucker, M. (2009), *Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009*, [p. 33].

²¹⁹ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [pp. 141-224].

²²⁰ Faraco, C. (2006), ‘Country Report Germany’, in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens’ Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [p. 18 – 29].

²²¹ Peucker, M. (2009), *Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009*, [p. 32].

or longer. As a consequence, many cities implemented re-housing programmes for Sinti and Roma aiming at finding more adequate and permanent housing options in social or private housing.²²² In the meantime, nearly all these encampments have been abolished and the residents have moved to normal flats.²²³ Nevertheless, a field study conducted between 2001 and 2002, states that many Sinti and Roma still “live in substandard housing in remote segregated areas, often in areas considered hazardous to human health”.²²⁴ A more recently published report based on expert interviews (2009), indicates that the housing situation of Roma remains difficult.²²⁵ For instance, according to the Sinti and Roma Association in Baden-Württemberg, many Sinti and Roma of Baden-Württemberg still reside “in the outskirts of larger cities in simple flats” which are “often too small and overcrowded”.²²⁶ Other local experts “confirmed the problem of overcrowding assumedly amongst other reasons due to an allegedly above-average family size and manifold socio-economic aspects.”²²⁷

As mentioned above, **(Roma) asylum seekers** whose applications are still pending or have been rejected without having been deported are at a particular legal disadvantage which also affects their housing conditions because they are “often not allowed to choose their own dwelling”.²²⁸ Often those asylum applicants and rejected asylum seekers are housed in centralised refugee accommodation centres where quality standards are often described as below average in terms of facilities and infrastructure. Furthermore, they are often overcrowded. According to a recent report, Roma asylum seekers have experienced and still experience isolation and poor living conditions. Despite some improvements in recent years, their housing and accommodation continues to be extremely poor.²²⁹

With regard to Roma **immigrants from Eastern European countries** (largely from Romania, Hungary, Bulgaria), their housing situation can only be assessed in particular city districts. A recent report on the situation of Roma from Romania and Bulgaria in Berlin highlighted that Roma migrants often live in precarious substandard housing. For many Roma families it seems to be difficult to find a flat, in particular when savings made in the country of origin are not high enough to cover rental deposits or when there is no proof of income.²³⁰ Being aware of these issues, some shady landlords rent substandard and nearly uninhabitable flats to Roma families. Moreover, a lack of tenancy agreements is often stated to be a problem among Roma families resulting in being unable to register in the municipality.²³¹ Nevertheless, without an official registration they have no opportunity to receive work permits or health insurance.²³² Overcrowding is also a common problem leading to other problems such as the reinforcing of existing “Gipsy” prejudices.²³³ It is further stated that prejudices towards Roma are often

²²² Minority Rights Group International (2008)

²²³ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 32].

²²⁴ Abdikeeva, A. (2002), *Germany’s Policies towards Sinti and Roma: Living Apartheid?*, online ERRC report, available at: [www.errc.org/cikk.php?cikk=777#12].

²²⁵ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009.

²²⁶ Information provided by the Sinti and Roma Association of Baden-Württemberg in Peucker, M. (2009), [p. 33].

²²⁷ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 33].

²²⁸ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 44].

²²⁹ Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland.

²³⁰ Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES, [p. 8].

²³¹ Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES, [p. 8].

²³² Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES, [p. 8].

²³³ Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES, [p. 8].

expressed openly by landlords and media reports. Consequences of the housing issues in Berlin have led to “various cases of Romanian Roma migrants with toddlers spending nights in parks.”²³⁴

Another widespread issue in general is inadequate housing for low-income families receiving social welfare and for large families. This is an issue which affecting other German citizens as well.²³⁵ Experts state that “many Sinti and Roma have difficulties in finding dwellings that fulfil their housing preferences and family-life oriented needs – either due to their personal socio-economic status and/or due to general housing shortages.”²³⁶ According to the Sinti and Association of Baden-Württemberg, “it is often difficult to help Sinti and Roma find better housing, because there are only few cost-efficient dwellings available in the local housing market that cater for the needs of larger families.”²³⁷ Large families of Roma are especially affected by the low availability of housing options. In many large cities, such as Munich, there is a general lack of affordable housing, in particular for large families. This results in longer waiting time for large families regarding private housing as well as social housing.²³⁸

Furthermore, studies and expert interviews indicate that Roma are overrepresented in social housing and that their living conditions are below average.²³⁹ Social (e.g. large families) and economic (e.g. lower income, dependence on social welfare) factors but also “long-term neglect by public authorities”²⁴⁰ seem to be intertwined with anti-Roma prejudice and discrimination.

b. Access to social or private housing

According to the Housing Support Act (*Wohnraumförderungsgesetz, WoFG*) and corresponding legislation in individual *Länder*, **access to social housing** is provided to households who cannot afford suitable housing in the private housing market.²⁴¹ Generally, housing support is guaranteed to all socially disadvantaged households regardless of their ethnic or national belonging if they permanently reside in Germany.²⁴² Thus, if Roma “lawfully” reside in Germany, they are entitled to access social housing under the same conditions as non-Roma.²⁴³

Precondition to access to social housing is a housing authorisation permit (*Wohnberechtigungsschein*), which is issued when the households` annual income is below a

²³⁴ Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCIITIES, [p. 8].

²³⁵ Faraco, C. (2006), ‘Country Report Germany’, in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [pp. 18 – 29].

²³⁶ Peucker, M. (2009), *Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009*, [p. 45].

²³⁷ Information provided by the Sinti and Roma Association of Baden-Württemberg in Peucker, M. (2009), [p. 45].

²³⁸ Peucker, M. (2009), *Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009*, [p. 45].

²³⁹ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens` Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 155].

²⁴⁰ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [pp. 141-224].

²⁴¹ [Germany,] Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Innern*) (2011a), *Report from the Federal Republic of Germany to the European Commission – An EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020: Integrated packages of measures to promote the integration and participation of Sinti and Roma in Germany*, [p. 48].

²⁴² [Germany,] Article 27 (2) WoFG

²⁴³ [Germany,] Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Innern*) (2011a), *Report from the Federal Republic of Germany to the European Commission – An EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020: Integrated packages of measures to promote the integration and participation of Sinti and Roma in Germany*, [p. 48].

certain level.²⁴⁴ Although landlords of council accommodations have to select the tenants along existing legal provisions, including the AGG, a housing authorisation permit is no absolute guarantee for finding social accommodation. Furthermore, asylum seekers whose applications are pending, non-nationals with toleration certificates (*Duldung*), refugees with temporary residence permits according to the EU Directive 2001/55/EG and foreigners who are obliged to leave Germany are “often excluded from the benefit of gaining access to social housing.”²⁴⁵

As there is no quantitative data available on the number of Roma in council housing it is impossible to assess the actual number of persons living in social housing. Yet, study results and experts suppose that Roma are overrepresented in social housing.²⁴⁶ Moreover, information gathered by a report on the housing situation (2009) based on expert interviews indicate that many Roma live in council housing or in neighbourhoods with a high proportion of social houses.²⁴⁷

Access to private housing is generally available to all households and regulated according to economic principles and the general situation on the housing market. Thus, in principle, any individual has access to private housing by either renting or buying a dwelling, if he or she can afford it. The German government also provides housing benefits “as a financial contribution towards housing costs in order to ensure that people are able to live in appropriate accommodation which is suitable for families” under the Housing Benefit Act (*Wohngeldgesetz*) regardless of individual ethnic origins.²⁴⁸ The German government supports additional accommodation costs of job seekers.²⁴⁹

Furthermore, German legislation tries to ensure equal treatment in the private housing market via the German Anti-Discrimination Act (AGG).²⁵⁰ Yet, a recently conducted expert survey, argued that all respondents believe that German Sinti and Roma as well as migrant Roma suffer from discrimination and do not have the same opportunities as non-Roma regarding access to private housing.²⁵¹ Foreigners who are subject to the Law on Benefits for Asylum Seekers (AsylbLG), namely asylum seekers whose applications are pending, non-nationals with toleration certificates (*Duldung*), refugees with temporary residence permits according to the EU Directive 2001/55/EG and foreigners who are obliged to leave Germany have limited access to private housing. These groups of third country nationals are largely exempted from “benefits according to the general social security laws as they receive substitute allowances according to the Law on Benefits for Asylum Seekers (AsylbLG)”.²⁵² These allowances are far below the

²⁴⁴ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 15].

²⁴⁵ [Germany,] Article 44 I (1) AufenthG

²⁴⁶ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens` Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 155].

²⁴⁷ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens` Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 155].

²⁴⁸ [Germany,] Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Innern*) (2011a), *Report from the Federal Republic of Germany to the European Commission – An EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020: Integrated packages of measures to promote the integration and participation of Sinti and Roma in Germany*, [p. 48].

²⁴⁹ [Germany,] Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Innern*) (2011a), *Report from the Federal Republic of Germany to the European Commission – An EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020: Integrated packages of measures to promote the integration and participation of Sinti and Roma in Germany*, [p. 49].

²⁵⁰ [Germany,] German Anti-Discrimination Act (AGG), Section 19 (3)

²⁵¹ Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012.

²⁵² Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 18].

regular social benefits and cover only basic needs, including housing.²⁵³ Furthermore, they are usually accommodated in local refugee centres or decentralised “normal” flats until local authorities decide that “a person or family is entitled to move out of the accommodation centre and into a private flat”.²⁵⁴ In some *Länder* they are not allowed to look for their own housing, as they are legally obliged to live in centralised refugee homes for many years. A large share of Roma refugees, primarily from the Balkans, is disadvantaged by this law because “their asylum applications were mostly rejected, but their deportation is (currently) considered as barely enforceable.”²⁵⁵

A recently published report criticises the housing situation of Roma for clearly differentiating “between German citizens and immigrants, also with regard to regulations on access to social housing”.²⁵⁶ Roma migrants with a stronger residential status and Roma who are German citizens are privileged to receiving housing support, including an entitlement to social housing as well as allowances and assistance in case of unemployment.

c. Location and access to public utilities and infrastructure

Some Sinti and Roma representatives and organisations, such as the Baden-Württemberg State association of Sinti and Roma and the ERRC have pointed out that many Roma communities are **located** on the outskirts of larger cities²⁵⁷ and/or remote segregated areas²⁵⁸. However, although many Roma tend to reside in the outskirts with poor access to public transportation, this cannot be generalised for all Roma neighbourhoods.

The situation of Roma regarding **access to public utilities and infrastructure** is mainly dependent on the type of housing, but also on the local situation.

Roma living in the outskirts of larger cities often have poorer infrastructure than those living in the city centre. They are sometimes located in “environmentally problematic areas”, for example next to industrial zones.²⁵⁹ A study confirms that a number of Roma settlements are situated next to “polluting industries, highways or roads with heavy traffic, city garbage dumps or toxic/hazardous waste sites”²⁶⁰ while the example of the Sinti settlement located on the outskirts of Hamburg which used to be a former toxic waste dump is provided.²⁶¹

²⁵³ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 18].

²⁵⁴ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 18].

²⁵⁵ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 18].

²⁵⁶ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens` Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 155].

²⁵⁷ Information provided by the Sinti and Roma Association of Baden-Württemberg in Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009.

²⁵⁸ Abdikeeva, A. (2002), *Germany's Policies towards Sinti and Roma: Living Apartheid?*, online ERRC report, available at: [www.errc.org/cikk.php?cikk=777#12].

²⁵⁹ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 6].

²⁶¹ ERRC (European Roma Rights Center) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), [p. 30], available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf].

²⁶¹ ERRC (European Roma Rights Center) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), [p. 30], available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf].

Council housing and public housing are generally regarded positively in terms of access to infrastructure and public utilities. However, there are significant differences. In Munich, there are council housing areas that have been built specifically for Roma in 2002 and are equipped with a playground for children and a community house for events and other activities, such as helping children with homework.²⁶² Nevertheless, there are other council housing units located in high-rise buildings without any facilities tailored towards the needs of Roma.²⁶³

In general, the vast majority of Roma in Germany live in regular dwellings, but a few caravan sites and encampments still exist. In terms of infrastructure, such as sanitary facilities, electricity, water and waste disposal, the housing situation in encampments is worse than in council and private housing.²⁶⁴ A study on the housing conditions (2009) in Braunschweig provides an example of “two of long-term encampments [which] can be described as renovated garden sheds with very bad sanitary facilities.”²⁶⁵

Halting sites with different quality standards are provided in some major cities (e.g. Munich, Hamburg, Berlin) for Roma from other European countries travelling through Germany and the few German Sinti and Roma who travel mostly in the summer months.²⁶⁶ Sanitation and access to public transportation is often very poor, despite some positive exceptions, for example the halting site in Berlin-Dreilinden: since the 1990s the Land Berlin has allowed Roma (mainly seasonal workers) to camp on this halting site in the outskirts of Berlin next to the highway between March and October.²⁶⁷ The Catholic welfare organisation Caritas runs the halting site with the help of social workers who support Roma by contacting authorities.²⁶⁸

The standards of **refugee accommodation centres** in which asylum applicants and rejected asylum seekers are housed are mostly poor in terms of facilities and infrastructure. Moreover, they are often characterised by overcrowding. Kindergarten institutions are rarely offered.²⁶⁹

d. Security of tenure (including forced evictions and expulsions)

No data on forced eviction or expulsion of Roma is available. According to German law, forced evictions are possible but they are allowed only in particular circumstances and thus occur only rarely. According to the German Civil Code, evictions are legitimate if, for instance, the landlord needs the house or flat for him/herself (*Eigenbedarf*) or in case of severe violations of contractual duties by the tenant. Further, tenants who receive unemployment benefits might be forced to move out by public authorities in case their current dwelling is ‘inappropriate’, which means that it is too expensive, for example.

²⁶² Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 36].

²⁶³ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 36].

²⁶⁴ Faraco, C. (2006), ‘Country Report Germany’, in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [pp. 18 – 29].

²⁶⁵ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 38].

²⁶⁶ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 39].

²⁶⁷ Abdikeeva, A. (2002), *Germany's Policies towards Sinti and Roma: Living Apartheid?*, online ERRC report, available at: [www.errc.org/cikk.php?cikk=777#12];

Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 38].

²⁶⁸ K. Lange (2004), Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [pp. 141-224].

²⁶⁹ Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland, [p. 22].

Forced eviction may be a concern for Roma living in emergency housing, encampments and halting sites and for those living in informal housing situations. People living in emergency housing often do not have a lease contract and therefore lack tenancy rights. Consequently, “they can be evicted if the city needs the flat to house another family”.²⁷⁰ Similarly, families living in informal housing situations without tenancy agreements lack tenants’ rights.²⁷¹ Moreover, “encampment residents may fear eviction because, in some instance, they are unsure of the legal status of the site or uncertain about whether they meet administrative recognition standards.”²⁷² “Halting sites have not always been legalised by local authorities or are accessible only during summer; this may entail the risks of being (temporarily or permanently) evicted from halting sites.”²⁷³ This has happened in a Sinti settlement of Bochum (NRW).²⁷⁴

e. Residential segregation

According to a report on the housing situation of Roma in Germany published in 2009, there are still both segregated and de-segregated Roma communities in Germany.²⁷⁵ An example for de-segregated communities can be found in Frankfurt where Roma live within the entire city.²⁷⁶ In contrast, Roma segregation seems to be more common in Karlsruhe where “the majority of Sinti and Roma live on the outskirts of the city in deprived neighbourhoods with only few individual Sinti families living within Karlsruhe”.²⁷⁷

In general, segregation can be desired or forced. According to the aforementioned report (2009), the segregation of Roma is found to be either desired such as in Kiel, Munich or Hamburg, or forced such as in Karlsruhe.²⁷⁸ Experts conclude that all groups of Roma often suffer from involuntary segregation due to discriminatory practices regarding hiring and housing.²⁷⁹ However, due to the low availability of data, the general reasons why many Roma live in the outskirts remain unclear.

In Germany the general urban planning policies and legislation aim at avoiding ethnic segregation. Yet, it has to be pointed out that in some cities, such as Kiel, neighbourhoods exclusively for Roma families have been established after “requests from Sinti and Roma communities and with support by governmental authorities”.²⁸⁰ There is no evident reason why

²⁷⁰ Information from the Sinti and Roma Association of Baden-Württemberg in Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009.

²⁷¹ Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES, [p. 8].

²⁷² Faraco, C. (2006), ‘Country Report Germany’, in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [pp. 18 – 29].

²⁷³ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 37].

²⁷⁴ Amtsgericht Bochum/38C 157/96 (25.09.1995) in Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009.

²⁷⁵ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 6].

²⁷⁶ Information provided by Förderverein Rom in Frankfurt in Peucker, M. *et al* (2009), [p. 36].

²⁷⁷ G. Weiß (2004) in Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009.

²⁷⁸ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 36].

²⁷⁹ Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012, [p. 13].

²⁸⁰ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 34].

municipalities “may encourage such segregation by providing land in spatially segregated areas” for instance on the outskirts and/or with bad infrastructure.²⁸¹

f. Experiences and perceptions of racial/ethnic discrimination

There is general agreement that Roma experience discrimination when accessing the housing market.²⁸²

According to German law, discrimination within housing market is prohibited. The German Anti-Discrimination Act (AGG) bans ethnic discrimination, including discrimination in the access to housing. Yet, the AGG contains exemption clauses, one of which allows unequal access to the housing market in cases in which it serves ‘to create and maintain stable social structures regarding inhabitants and balanced settlement structures, as well as balanced economic, social and cultural conditions’.²⁸³ Consequently, this exemption gives landlords the possibility to “legally” discriminate against Roma if they can give evidence that too many Roma live in the neighbourhood.²⁸⁴

According to a recently published report, all experts argue that all migrant, including German Sinti and Roma, do not have the same opportunities to rent in the open housing market as non-Roma.²⁸⁵ Further, they believe that all groups of Roma face disadvantages in receiving construction loans or other housing subsidies.

Although there are no substantial official data with regard to discrimination in access to housing of Roma, there is evidence that such forms of unequal treatment exist and hinder the access to housing. Anti-discrimination agencies and other reports on the housing market argue that people with foreign sounding names are often discriminated against when looking for housing.²⁸⁶ Experts interviewed for the study on the housing situation of Roma also gave evidence that Roma encounter enormous difficulties when trying to find a private flat.²⁸⁷

A nationwide survey among Sinti and Roma, conducted by the Central Council for German Sinti and Roma on perceived discrimination states that the majority of respondents (54%) have experienced discrimination when looking for housing.²⁸⁸ Furthermore, Sinti and Roma experience discrimination not only when accessing the housing market, but also within their own neighbourhoods. In response to a question on personal experiences with discrimination, 54

²⁸¹ Peucker, M. (2009), *Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009*, [p. 34].

²⁸² Council of Europe (2007), [p. 29];

Peucker, M. (2009), *Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009*.

²⁸³ [Germany,] AGG, Article 19 (3)

²⁸⁴ Council of Europe (2007) *Report by the Commissioner for Human Rights Mr. Thomas Hammarberg on his Visit to Germany 9-11 and 15-20 October 2006*, [p. 29], available at:
[<https://wcd.coe.int/ViewDoc.jsp?id=1162763&Site=COE&BackColorInternet=DBDCF2&BackColorIntranet=FDC864&BackColorLogged=FDC864>].

²⁸⁵ Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012, [p. 13].

²⁸⁶ Planerladen (ed.) (2009), *Ungleichbehandlung von Migranten auf dem Wohnungsmarkt. Ergebnisse eines telefonischen „Paired Ethnic Testing“ bei regionalen Immobilienanzeigen*, Dortmund.

²⁸⁷ Peucker, M. (2009), *Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009*, [p. 35].

²⁸⁸ [Germany,] Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (2006), *Ergebnisse der Repräsentativumfrage des Zentralrats Deutscher Sinti und Roma über den Rassismus gegen Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Heidelberg: Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma, available at:
[<http://zentralrat.sintiundroma.de/content/downloads/stellungnahmen/UmfrageRassismus06.pdf>].

respondents argue that they have experienced insults and threats from fellow citizens and neighbours.²⁸⁹

As mentioned above, finding adequate housing for large families seems to be difficult. Discrimination is often indicated as a reason for this issue. It can be assumed that some landlords associate social problems with families with many children. Discrimination based on family size could be considered a form of indirect discrimination since Roma tend to have larger families than non-Roma.²⁹⁰

According to experts, Roma often receive many rejections from housing companies and landlords because of prejudices and resentments against Roma.²⁹¹ Opinion polls conducted among the majority population confirm this view: the findings of a special Eurobarometer survey in 2008²⁹² clearly indicate negative attitudes towards Roma as neighbours. One out of four German respondents stated that they would feel uncomfortable having a Roma neighbour.²⁹³ The recently published data of a longitudinal survey on group-focused hostility (*Gruppenbezogene Menschenfeindlichkeit*, GFE) conducted by the University of Bielefeld, also provides evidence that there are still tendencies of antiziganism in Germany which also have impacts on the housing situation of Roma. The results show that 40% of the German respondents have problems with Roma in their neighbourhood. Nearly one third (27.7%) agreed with the statement that Roma should be banned from the inner city.²⁹⁴

Sometimes experts stressed that “the housing situation is not the most pressing issue for German Roma, since hardly anybody lives on the street” in Germany. Nevertheless, it has to be taken into account that a difficult housing situation has further negative effects on other social areas such as education, health, etc. Lack of adequate housing and, in some settlements possible exposure to environmental hazards, can impact significantly on the health of Roma families, in particular, women and children.²⁹⁵ Furthermore, overcrowded living arrangements cause increasing conflicts with neighbours.²⁹⁶

Major projects or initiatives

In Germany various projects and initiatives have been implemented in the context of Roma housing. The national government and the *Länder* have implemented the following main instruments aimed at improving the housing situation of the socially disadvantaged, including Roma: special housing programmes (or general social city programmes), general housing allowances (for German Roma) and the provision of halting sites”.²⁹⁷ Within the study on the

²⁸⁹ [Germany,] Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (2006), *Ergebnisse der Repräsentativumfrage des Zentralrats Deutscher Sinti und Roma über den Rassismus gegen Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Heidelberg: Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma, available at: [http://zentralrat.sintiundroma.de/content/downloads/stellungnahmen/UmfrageRassismus06.pdf].

²⁹⁰ Peucker, M. (2009), *Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009*, [p. 44].

²⁹¹ Information provided by Förderverein Rom in Frankfurt/Main in Peucker, M. (2009), *Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009*.

²⁹² European Commission (2008), *Discrimination in the European Union: Perception, Experiences and Attitudes*, Special Eurobarometer 296, available at: [http://ec.europa.eu/public_opinion/archives/ebs/ebs_296_en.pdf].

²⁹³ The proportion of those who would feel uncomfortable having other minorities as neighbours, such as members of another ethnic or religious minority or disabled people, is significantly lower in Germany.

²⁹⁴ Heitmeyer, W. (ed.) (2012), *Deutsche Zustände: Folge 10*, Berlin, [p. 39].

²⁹⁵ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [pp. 141-224].

²⁹⁶ Information provided by the Förderverein Rom in Frankfurt/Main, Berlin report etc. in Peucker, M. *et al* (2009).

²⁹⁷ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens’ Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 155].

housing situation of Roma (2009), three types of projects have been identified: **resettlement**, **revitalisation** of existing housing and **creation** of new housing.²⁹⁸

The following section provides information on two projects co-financed by the European Fund for Local Development and aimed at improving the housing environment of Roma families.

“Horizons of Roma - Empowerment for Roma Families”

„Horizons of Roma - Empowerment for Roma Families“ is a cooperation project of südost Europa Kultur e.V. and Cultures in the Kiez e.V.. The project is located in the Neighbourhood Management Area “Pankstraße”. It is funded by the European Fund for Local Development, the Federal Government and the Land of Berlin within the framework of the funding programme “Future Initiative District/ Social City”. The project started in May 2010 and will run until December 2012.²⁹⁹

The project consists of a contact point and a cultural venue for Roma families with the underlying intention to facilitate integration. Therefore, the project centralises local offers for Roma families to ensure that they are used more effectively.³⁰⁰ The long-term aim is to establish a cultural centre in the district Wedding of Berlin where Roma children, adolescents and families can actively participate in developing cultural offers.

Within the project, Roma families have the possibility to receive counselling services in order to strengthen their inclusion in society and the school attendance of Roma children. Regular consultations for citizens (*Bürgersprechstunde*) intensify neighbourhood dialogues through the participation of residents. Furthermore, the project offers homework supervision, cultural workshops such as intercultural cooking or film making, literacy courses for mothers, consultation and accompaniment by health, educational, employment, housing, social, residence status, debts and legal issues, as well as mediation and accompaniment in projects, institutions and other establishments in the neighbourhood and in Berlin. All services can also be provided by Romani-speaking people.

“Mobile Contact Point for European Migrant Workers and Roma – Conflict Intervention against Anti-Gypsyism”³⁰¹

One of the main goals of the project „Mobile Contact Point for European Migrant Workers and Roma – Conflict Intervention against Anti-Gypsyism“ is to support clients with paperwork needed to rent housing, such as proof of income and debt, and to show them how to find housing via the Internet or newspapers. The contact point helps Roma families with “housing administrations, regularising informal housing arrangements, informing renters with a precarious status, translating contracts and raising awareness among sub-letters and landlords”.³⁰² It tries to find accommodation in homeless shelters for Roma families and supports families who have problems in accessing homeless shelters and assists them in lodging appeals to the court which, at the time of writing, have been successful in all cases. In addition, an informal network was established “that can temporarily house homeless people in private accommodation”.³⁰³

²⁹⁸ Peucker, M. (2009), Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009. Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009, [p. 49].

²⁹⁹ See also: [www.suedost-ev.de/roma_horizonte/flyer_roma-horizonte_maerz_2012_web.pdf].

³⁰⁰ See also: [www.suedost-ev.de/roma_horizonte/roma_horizonte].

³⁰¹ see also Chapter on Health and Poverty

³⁰² Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES.

³⁰³ Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES.

5 Health

Only little information about the health situation of Roma is available in Germany.³⁰⁴ No official statistics regarding life expectancy, infant mortality rate or specific health issues exist. Data is mainly provided by unofficial qualitative research and NGO reports. In general, every person with health insurance has access to health care and prevention services. Thus, there are no Roma-specific legal instruments. Depending on the legal status of the person, access to healthcare may be limited and this is explained in further detail below.³⁰⁵

a. Health status/limitations in daily activities/disability

In 2012, the Senator for Labour, Women and Integration in Berlin has stated that health care provision is a serious issue for Roma.³⁰⁶ According to an interview conducted for a study by the Open Society Foundation in 2002, heart disease, asthma and rheumatism seem to be specific health problems among Roma in Hamburg.³⁰⁷ At regularly conducted consultations on health issues in Frankfurt, data shows that migrant Roma often have to deal with obesity and associated health problems, such as metabolism disorder and hypertension.³⁰⁸ Yet, a study from 2011 concludes, that “health differs greatly between different Roma groups and depends on one’s social and economic status”³⁰⁹.

Although no official information on the health situation of Roma migrants is available, it is likely that **Roma migrants** are dealing with the same health issues as most migrants. Therefore, the following abstract presents findings in the field of health and migration in Germany. According to the report ‘Migration and Health’ (*Migration und Gesundheit*) published by the Konrad-Adenauer Foundation in 2009, a migration background cannot be considered a determining variable causing illness or higher risk of morbidity. Rather the socio-economic status of people with a migration background influences their state of health. Comparatively, migrants often belong to a socially disadvantaged segment of the population.³¹⁰ Due to lower social status, particular migrant groups deal with health issues resulting from physically and psychologically stressful work and living situations. Furthermore, migrants show a higher risk of psycho-social burden caused by traumatic events in the country of origin (for example torture) or the migration process.³¹¹ In contrast, migrants are less prone to cardiovascular

³⁰⁴ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels, European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens` Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 178].

³⁰⁵ European Commission, Directorate-General for Justice (2012), *National Roma Integration Strategies: a first step in the implementation of the EU Framework*, [p. 31].

³⁰⁶ Anker, J. and Fahrur, J. (2012), ‘Roma – Gesundheitsversorgung wird in Berlin zum Problem’, in *Berliner Morgenpost*, 17 July 2012.

³⁰⁷ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [pp. 141-224].

³⁰⁸ Interview with Expert A, Public Health Department Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

³⁰⁹ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens` Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 178].

³¹⁰ [Germany,] Federal Commissioner for Migration, Refugees and Integration (*Beauftragte der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration*) (2010), 8. *Bericht der Beauftragten der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration über die Lage der Ausländerinnen und Ausländer in Deutschland*, [pp. 342-343].

³¹¹ [Germany,] Federal Commissioner for Migration, Refugees and Integration (*Beauftragte der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration*) (2010), 8. *Bericht der Beauftragten der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration über die Lage der Ausländerinnen und Ausländer in Deutschland*, [p. 339].

diseases than Germans. However, especially older migrants show a comparatively worse state of health and higher need for care.³¹²

According to data from the German Microcensus the morbidity rate has generally increased among all migrant groups in Germany between 2005 and 2009. During this period, the rate increased by 18% for persons with a migration background and by 19% for foreigners, whereas the rate for persons without a migration background only increased by 15%. While the morbidity rate for the whole population with a migration background (12.1%) is lower than the morbidity rate of the German population without a migration background (14.5%), the population with a migration background has a higher morbidity rate among the middle and higher age groups.³¹³

A study on Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian **children from Kosovo in Germany** confirms that not only adults but also children deal with depression, anxiety disorders and other illnesses, which experts consider psychosomatic problems. These health issues are caused by traumata from war experiences, displacement or flight as well as uncertain life situation and future perspectives.³¹⁴ These assertions are in accordance with an expert's statement on Roma from Kosovo and Serbia living in Germany. Common symptoms of these kinds of posttraumatic stress disorders are depression, sleep disorders, headaches and tiredness.³¹⁵ In some cases, fathers, who were unable to meet the requirements of everyday life and to provide for their families, were affected by alcoholism and addiction to gambling.³¹⁶ Other health problems reported by families include heart disorders, respiratory illnesses and diabetes. Some social workers working with refugee issues observed that many Roma and Ashkali beneficiaries age prematurely. Limited access to healthcare for refugees further deteriorates the health of Roma refugees and asylum seekers.³¹⁷

Studies show that **children with a migration background** suffer less from asthma or hay fever, but show more dental problems compared to children without a migration background due to the comparatively low use of precautionary measures.³¹⁸ The problem of caries among migrant Roma children was confirmed by a physician offering free medical consultation for Roma.³¹⁹ The physician reported that they also often suffer from obesity and associated health issues due to malnutrition.³²⁰ Another health issue for **Roma refugee children** with precarious

³¹² [Germany.] Federal Commissioner for Migration, Refugees and Integration (*Beauftragte der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration*) (2010), 8. *Bericht der Beauftragten der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration über die Lage der Ausländerinnen und Ausländer in Deutschland*, [pp. 338-339, 342].

³¹³ Engels, D., Köller, R., Koopmans, R., Höhne, J. (2011), Zweiter Integrationsindikatorenbericht erstellt für die Beauftragte der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration, Köln/Berlin, [p. 121-123]; Germany, Federal Commissioner for Migration, Refugees and Integration (*Beauftragte der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration*) (2010), 8. *Bericht der Beauftragten der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration über die Lage der Ausländerinnen und Ausländer in Deutschland*, [p. 340].

³¹⁴ Knaus, V. and Widmann, P. (2010), *Integration unter Vorbehalt: Zur Situation von Kindern kosovarischer Roma, Ashkali und Ägypter in Deutschland und nach ihrer Rückführung in den Kosovo*, Köln: Deutsches Komitee für UNICEF e.V., [p. 12, 49].

³¹⁵ Interview with Expert C, Asklepios Fachklinikum Göttingen, Göttingen, 24 August 2012.

³¹⁶ Knaus, V. and Widmann, P. (2010), *Integration unter Vorbehalt: Zur Situation von Kindern kosovarischer Roma, Ashkali und Ägypter in Deutschland und nach ihrer Rückführung in den Kosovo*, Köln: Deutsches Komitee für UNICEF e.V., [p. 33].

³¹⁷ Knaus, V. and Widmann, P. (2010), *Integration unter Vorbehalt: Zur Situation von Kindern kosovarischer Roma, Ashkali und Ägypter in Deutschland und nach ihrer Rückführung in den Kosovo*, Köln: Deutsches Komitee für UNICEF e.V., [p. 49].

³¹⁸ [Germany.] Federal Commissioner for Migration, Refugees and Integration (*Beauftragte der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration*) (2010), 8. *Bericht der Beauftragten der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration über die Lage der Ausländerinnen und Ausländer in Deutschland*, [pp. 338, 342].

³¹⁹ Interview with Expert A, Public Health Department Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

residence status is the uncertainty about their future, which causes psychological and physiological stress.³²¹

Another issue mentioned in field research (2012) in the district Neukölln of Berlin is the lacking **vaccination certificates**, especially amongst children. In order to reduce and eliminate certain infectious diseases it would be necessary to vaccinate all migrant children. The municipality does not have sufficient resources to provide the necessary vaccinations.³²² The insufficient vaccination of migrant Roma children is also emphasised by an expert in this field.³²³

b. Unmet needs in the area of health

Based on expert opinions, there seem to be some **unmet needs** among Roma migrants as among migrants in general. One example is the lack of information about medical institutions and medical entitlements. A report from 2011 highlighted that Roma often have little knowledge about their legal entitlement to benefits. Moreover, many Roma are not aware of the importance of preventive health examinations.³²⁴ One expert remarked that restrictions and barriers in health care provisions are evident in the healthcare system but also on parts of the medical personal.³²⁵

Despite the formal equal access to health care, other factors may have an impact on the health of German Sinti and Roma as well as migrant Roma, such as inadequate housing. In certain settlements Roma may be exposed to health hazards due to pollution and contamination of housing locations.³²⁶ Considering that Roma families often have traditional concepts of family in which women take care of the household it is fair to assume that women are particularly affected by poor housing conditions, especially if they are exposed to environmental hazards. This may particularly be the case with the few non-sedentary Roma who live on caravan sites, but may also be an issue for asylum seekers and refugees who live in inadequate

³²⁰ Interview with Expert A, Public Health Department Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

³²¹ Knaus, V. and Widmann, P. (2010), *Integration unter Vorbehalt: Zur Situation von Kindern kosovarischer Roma, Ashkali und Ägypter in Deutschland und nach ihrer Rückführung in den Kosovo*, Köln: Deutsches Komitee für UNICEF e.V., [pp. 12, 49].

³²² [Germany,] *Bezirksamt Neukölln von Berlin – Abteilung Bildung, Schule, Kultur und Sport* (2012), 2. *Roma-Statusbericht: Entwicklung der Zuzüge von EU-Unionsbürger aus Südosteuropa: Berlin – Neukölln*, Berlin, [p. 10].

³²³ Interview with Expert A, Public Health Department Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

³²⁴ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels, European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 178]; Interview with Expert C, Asklepios Fachklinikum Göttingen, Göttingen, 24 August 2012; Interview with Expert A, Public Health Department Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

³²⁵ Interview with Expert C, Asklepios Fachklinikum Göttingen, Göttingen, 24 August 2012.

³²⁶ ERRC (European Roma Rights Center) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), [pp. 4-5, 30], available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf].

accommodation.³²⁷ The negative health impact of poor housing was also mentioned during an interview with an expert.³²⁸

A 2004 report on the situation of Roma women in Germany states that despite inadequate housing, a lack of cultural sensitivity by medical personnel may impede access of Roma women to health care. The same report indicates that Roma in Germany are suspicious of public health facilities and fear ill-treatment by medical personnel.³²⁹ A general distrust towards health care services could particularly be observed among Roma women.³³⁰ Roma's suspicion stems mainly from experiences prior to and during World War II when medical research and experiments on German Sinti and Roma was conducted. Authorities have not implemented any measures to re-establish trust in the German health care system.³³¹ An expert confirms that, for Roma, distrust towards healthcare providers and personnel still represents a serious obstacle in access to medical care. As a consequence, some Roma patients drop out of treatment.³³² This may lead to a situation where hospitals reject patients on grounds of non-compliance.³³³

According to the report mentioned above and to an interviewee, the lack of trust in medical personnel and public health facilities often determine family members to refuse leaving patients alone in hospital. Frequently, Roma who are accompanied to medical institutions by several family members irritate medical personnel or public authorities. This sometimes turns into conflict between the medical personnel and Roma families and results in reluctance of Roma patients to access public health facilities. It may also lead to refusal of treatment.³³⁴

³²⁷ ERRC (European Roma Rights Center) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), [p. 30], available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf];

Faraco, C. (2006), 'Country Report Germany', in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [pp. 18 – 29].

³²⁸ Interview with Expert C, Asklepios Fachklinikum Göttingen, Göttingen, 24 August 2012.

³²⁹ ERRC (European Roma Rights Center) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf].

³³⁰ ERRC (European Roma Rights Center) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf].

³³¹ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), 'The Situation of Roma in Germany', in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [pp. 141-224].

³³² Interview with Expert C, Asklepios Fachklinikum Göttingen, Göttingen, 24 August 2012; Interview with Expert A, Public Health Department Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

³³³ Interview with Expert A, Public Health Department Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

³³⁴ ERRC (European Roma Rights Center) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), [p. 27-28], available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf].

Interview with Expert B, Förderverein Roma e.V., Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012;

Interview with Expert C, Asklepios Fachklinikum Göttingen, Göttingen, 24 August 2012;

Interview with Expert A, Public Health Department Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

A presentation on the access of Roma families to health care during a workshop in 2010 highlights additional factors which determine access to health care which include: different handling of illness, fear of stigmatisation and fear that a person's illegal residence status might be discovered.³³⁵

c. Medical insurance coverage

In Germany, **health insurance coverage** is included in the social insurance system, which is the main institution for social security.³³⁶ Every person living or residing in Germany is obliged to have public or private health insurance. Third country nationals who have a permanent residence permit or a temporary residence permit extending twelve months and who do not need to prove income according to the Residence Act³³⁷ are covered by public health insurance. Foreigners who need to prove income as a precondition for a residential status have to purchase health insurance coverage without support from public resources. Consequently, the obligation to obtain health insurance is not related to citizenship. Foreign Roma residing in Germany are subject to compulsory insurance. Depending on the legal status of a person, he or she either needs to prove an existing health insurance coverage or is covered by statutory health insurance.³³⁸ Migrants with a precarious or without legal residence status are not covered by the health insurance system. However, they are entitled to emergency medical care according to the Asylum Seekers Benefits Act (*AsylbLG*). If further medical treatment is necessary, this must be authorised by the social security office (*Sozialamt*).³³⁹ Another option to get medical treatment without health insurance is to use services provided by civil society organisations, for example, the Maltese Migrants Medicine.³⁴⁰

Generally speaking, Roma migrants face the same limitations or restrictions in accessing health care as other migrants. Due to a requirement to prove that they had insurance in their countries of origin, Roma migrants who cannot prove this or were not previously insured faced obstacles entering the German insurance system.³⁴¹ According to a survey on Roma from Bulgaria and Romania residing in a district of Berlin it appears that many of them do not have health insurance.³⁴² For migrants from Bulgaria and Romania health care can be provided by the Bulgarian or Romanian state unless a person possesses an EU work permit and is employed, or receives social benefits from the Employment Agency in addition to income. The Bulgarian or Romanian health insurance institution can issue a European Health Insurance Card (EHIC) to

³³⁵ AspE e.V. (Ambulante sozialpädagogische Erziehungshilfe) (2010), *Dokumentation der Fachtagung „Roma im Kontext“: Roma-Familien in Kinder- und Jugendhilfe Gesundheits- und Bildungsbereich*, Berlin, 6 October 2010, [p. 91].

³³⁶ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels, European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 166].

³³⁷ See article 5 (1) No. 1 *AufenthG*.

³³⁸ [Germany,] Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Innern*) (2011a), *Report from the Federal Republic of Germany to the European Commission – An EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020: Integrated packages of measures to promote the integration and participation of Sinti and Roma in Germany*, [pp. 44-45], Razum, O. et al (2008), [p. 108].

³³⁹ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels: European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 178].

³⁴⁰ [Germany,] *Bezirksamt Neukölln von Berlin – Abteilung Bildung, Schule, Kultur und Sport* (2012), 2. *Roma-Statusbericht: Entwicklung der Zuzüge von EU-Unionsbürger aus Südosteuropa: Berlin – Neukölln*, Berlin, [p. 10].

³⁴¹ Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES, [p. 9].

³⁴² Amaro Drom e.V., *Zielgruppenspezifische Unterstützungsbedarfe der Roma-Communities im Flughafenkiez: Auswertung der aktivierenden Befragung unter Bewohnergruppen mit Roma-Hintergrund und der Expertengespräche mit Bildungs- und Nachbarschaftseinrichtungen in den Quartiersmanagementgebieten Flughafenstraße und Donaustraße Nord*, Berlin, [p. 6].

persons who are insured according to the national insurance schemes and which makes it possible for emergency treatment costs to be reimbursed. However, there is still much confusion about how to deal with this card amongst both hospitals and patients.³⁴³

d. Circumstances around giving birth

There is different data on the level of information on **pregnancy and maternal healthcare**. Some Roma women seem to be quite aware of the need for and access to healthcare during pregnancy and in the post-natal period, others lack information on this issue. This may be further exacerbated by the fact that topics such as pregnancy and sex are taboo subjects in some more traditional families.³⁴⁴ Reportedly, although the level of knowledge about pregnancy and health among migrant Roma seems to be more limited compared to the majority population, the interviewed expert expressed the opinion that no differences are visible concerning breastfeeding and child care in general.³⁴⁵

Pregnant women without a legal residence permit may receive the status of a ‘tolerated’ person for humanitarian reasons according to the Residence Act³⁴⁶. This means, that during the maternity protection period, which lasts from six weeks before birth to eight weeks after birth, the mother and the child cannot be deported. The status of ‘tolerated’ person further grants the mother social benefits according to the Asylum Seekers Benefits Act³⁴⁷ which includes maternal care and obstetrics.³⁴⁸ The association ‘Malteser Migrant Medicine’ could observe that more pregnant women from Bulgaria and Romania need to be treated at present.³⁴⁹

e. Experiences and perceptions of racial/ethnic discrimination

Experiences of **racial and ethnic discrimination** have been mentioned on various occasions. An opinion poll of Roma and Sinti civil society organisations on the situation of German Sinti and Roma as well as Sinti and Roma migrants was conducted recently, as already mentioned in the chapter on employment, and which can provide some insights into experiences and perceptions of discrimination. Half of the 26 respondents did not have an opinion on discrimination in the area of healthcare. Most of the respondents who had an opinion in this respect, assume that German Sinti and Roma have equal access to healthcare. In contrast, more than half of the respondents share the opinion that Roma migrants do not have equal access to healthcare. With regard to preventive health care, a little more than half of the respondents think that German Sinti and Roma have equal access and a little less than half of the respondents believe that migrant Roma enjoy equal access.³⁵⁰ The respondents stated that Roma avoid mentioning their ethnic origin because they experienced that ‘stereotyping’ puts them at

³⁴³ [Germany,] *Bezirksamt Neukölln von Berlin – Abteilung Bildung, Schule, Kultur und Sport* (2012), 2. *Roma-Statusbericht: Entwicklung der Zuzüge von EU-Unionsbürger aus Südosteuropa: Berlin – Neukölln*, Berlin, [p. 10].

³⁴⁴ ERRC (European Roma Rights Center) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), [p. 32], available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf].

³⁴⁵ Interview with Expert A, Public Health Department Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

³⁴⁶ See article 60a *AufenthG*.

³⁴⁷ See article 4 (2) *AsylbLG*.

³⁴⁸ Jenssen, J. and Misbach, E. (2009), *Gesundheitsversorgung Illegalisierter: Integration in die Regelversorgung statt Entwicklung weiterer Parallelsysteme*, Heinrich Böll Stiftung.

³⁴⁹ Loerzer, S. (2012), Einwanderer aus Rumänien und Bulgarien: Wenn die Armut sichtbar wird, in *Süddeutsche Zeitung*, 11 August 2012.

³⁵⁰ Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012, [p. 3, 11].

disadvantage in almost all areas of life.³⁵¹ Experts in the health care field reported about Roma who experienced discrimination due to Roma-sounding names and appearances. It was also reported that some Roma cannot get a doctor's appointment because they are rejected by doctors' practices. Reservations by doctors' practices towards Roma are sometimes openly expressed or excuses are given in order to avoid making appointments. Thus, a prejudiced and discriminatory attitude towards Roma patients seems to be a serious issue.³⁵²

Regarding **Germany's health policy**, it is worth mentioning that one main objective of the "National Action Plan Integration", recently presented by the Federal Government, is to improve access to preventative and health promotion programmes, health care facilities and services and employment in the health care sector for migrants.³⁵³ In addition, many governmental and non-governmental initiatives have been implemented in order to promote respect towards different cultures in the area of health care in the past years, and most of them were implemented at the local and regional level. For instance, in 2010, the annual conference of the independent German Ethics Council was entitled "Migration and Health – Cultural Diversity as a Challenge for Medical Care". The conference sought to provide answers to questions in the area of migrant health care by providing scientific and practical lectures on medical, legal and ethical issues. Roma migrants have not been mentioned in particular.³⁵⁴

Germany has no concrete goals and does not implement additional measures to improve the health situation of Roma. General policy measures are implemented within the general framework to reduce the gap in the health sector.³⁵⁵ As provisions in the public health system are mostly the responsibility of the *Länder*, one can assume they differ among regions.³⁵⁶

Formal and informal barriers deter Roma from seeking medical care. To reduce these barriers, different non-governmental institutions are offering support to German Sinti and Roma as well as migrant Roma so they are able to access their entitlements. In several *Länder*, specific advice centres for Roma have been established. These are partly funded by the *Länder* themselves, which is the case in Hamburg, North-Rhine Westphalia, Lower Saxony and Bavaria, or with funds from the ESF. These centres provide consultations and assistance with visits to authorities, filling in forms and obtaining relevant documents.³⁵⁷

³⁵¹ Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012, [p. 5].

³⁵² Interview with Expert C, Asklepios Fachklinikum Göttingen, Göttingen, 24 August 2012; Interview with Expert A, Public Health Department Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

³⁵³ [Germany,] Federal Government (*Bundesregierung*) (2011c), *Nationaler Aktionsplan Integration*, Berlin, [pp. 166-169].

³⁵⁴ [www.ethikrat.org/veranstaltungen/jahrestagungen/migration-und-gesundheit].

³⁵⁵ European Commission, Directorate-General for Justice (2012), [p. 10].

³⁵⁶ Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels, European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.), [p. 178].

³⁵⁷ [Germany,] Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Innern*) (2011a), *Report from the Federal Republic of Germany to the European Commission – An EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020: Integrated packages of measures to promote the integration and participation of Sinti and Roma in Germany*, [p. 46].

Major projects or initiatives

“Mobile Contact Point for European Migrant Workers and Roma – Conflict Intervention against Anti-Gypsyism”

The project “Mobile Contact Point for European Migrant Workers and Roma – Conflict Intervention against Anti-Gypsyism” was launched in Berlin in early 2010. The project is funded until the end of 2012 by the Berlin Senate’s Department for Work, Integration and Social Affairs (*Senatsverwaltung für Integration, Arbeit und Soziales des Landes Berlin*), and the European Regional Development Fund. The target group are Roma migrant workers from EU countries, particularly from Romania and Bulgaria. The two NGOs Amaro Drom³⁵⁸ (“Our way” in Romani) and südost Europa Kultur e.V.³⁵⁹ are in charge of the project. The functions and activities of the project are divided between the two NGOs. While Amaro Drom focuses on an advice centre in the district Neukölln, südost Europa Kultur focuses on outreach and social work, mainly in the districts Mitte, Friedrichshain-Kreuzberg, Tempelhof-Schöneberg, Spandau and Lichtenberg.

The project is tailored towards the needs of the Roma and aims at encouraging the self-help potential of Roma migrants by offering and raising awareness of already existing services. The mobilisation of self-help mechanisms is supported by making the target group aware of their rights, helping to maintain stable living conditions and becoming independent from social benefits. At the same time, the project aims at raising intercultural awareness and reducing prejudices towards Roma in Berlin’s public institutions.³⁶⁰

Within the project, Amaro Drom also offers counselling on health issues. Counselling is offered in Romani, Romanian, Bulgarian and if necessary in Serbo-Croatian, Bosnian, Polish and Hungarian. Furthermore, the translators can accompany the participants to authorities and other advice centres.³⁶¹ Regarding access to health care, the project provides information for non-insured persons. It also offers a list of Romanian and Bulgarian-speaking doctors, some of whom provide free treatment. The contact point informs about the EHIC and related requirements to access the German health insurance system, such as proof of prior insurance in the country of origin. Therefore, the contact point cooperates with Romanian and Bulgarian embassies and the European network ‘ternype’ for young Roma.³⁶²

³⁵⁸ See also: [www.amarodrom.de].

³⁵⁹ See also: [www.suedost-ev.de].

³⁶⁰ Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES, [p. 3, 5].

³⁶¹ See also: [www.amarodrom.de].

³⁶² Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES, [p. 10].

6 Poverty/Economic situation

a. Households at risk-of-poverty

Due to the lack of official data on Roma, it is not possible to present an overall picture of the economic situation of Roma in Germany. No major representative survey on the social situation of German Sinti and Roma has been conducted recently. Some families achieved prosperity which can be compared to the wealth of the German middle class. These Roma are settled in the labour market, in education and within society. Still, based on a number of studies at the local level, there are indications that a significant part of German Sinti and Roma lives in a precarious social situation.³⁶³ Evidence of poverty among Roma and challenges regarding their financial situation can be observed. Reports by civil society actors constitute an important source for the assessment of the economic situation of Roma in Germany.

The **economic situation of migrant Roma** can be viewed in the context of the general situation of migrants in Germany. This means that the economic situation is reflected in social segregation in different areas of life.³⁶⁴ Disadvantaged neighbourhoods are often caused by social segregation rather than ethnic segregation.³⁶⁵ In a report by a German NGO it is assumed that Roma are among the poorest immigrants in Germany.³⁶⁶

In general, the data of the German Microcensus reveals that the at-risk-of-poverty rate, which is broken down by migrant background, slightly decreased between 2005 and 2010. Among the group of persons with a migration background the rate decreased by 7%, while the rate of the total population only decreased by 2%. Yet, with 26.2% in 2010, the at-risk-of-poverty rate for persons with a migration background was still significantly higher than that of persons without a migration background, with a rate of 14.5%. The at-risk-of-poverty rate of the foreign population was even higher, at 31.7%.³⁶⁷

b. Income/expenditure

Precarious **income-expenditure** ratio can be illustrated with the finding of a study on Roma refugees from Kosovo after they were entitled to take up employment. Many Roma from Kosovo work within the low-wage sector and take up more than one job. Still, the income is hardly enough for the family's livelihood, especially in households with numerous children. On the one hand, this situation is caused by long periods of restrictions in the access to the labour market after entering Germany. On the other hand, many refugees are under pressure to earn the family's livelihood and thus often cannot take part in further professional education programmes.³⁶⁸ Civil society actors report that so-called 'false' self-employed persons from

³⁶³ Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin: UNICEF Deutschland, [p. 5-6].

³⁶⁴ [Germany,] Germany, Federal Commissioner for Migration, Refugees and Integration (*Beauftragte der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration*) (2010), *8. Bericht der Beauftragten der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration über die Lage der Ausländerinnen und Ausländer in Deutschland*, [p. 84].

³⁶⁵ Friedrichs, J. (2008), 'Ethnische Segregation', in: Kalter, F. (ed.), *Migration und Integration*, Wiesbaden: VS Verlag, [p. 390, 392, 404].

³⁶⁶ Amaro Drom e.V., *Zielgruppenspezifische Unterstützungsbedarfe der Roma-Communities im Flughafenkiez: Auswertung der aktivierenden Befragung unter Bewohnergruppen mit Roma-Hintergrund und der Expertengespräche mit Bildungs- und Nachbarschaftseinrichtungen in den Quartiersmanagementgebieten Flughafenstraße und Donaustraße Nord*, Berlin, [p. 4].

³⁶⁷ Engels, D., Köller, R., Koopmans, R., Höhne, J. (2011), *Zweiter Integrationsindikatorenbericht erstellt für die Beauftragte der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration*, Köln/Berlin, [p. 86].

³⁶⁸ Knaus, V. and Widmann, P. (2010), *Integration unter Vorbehalt: Zur Situation von Kindern kosovarischer Roma, Ashkali und Ägypter in Deutschland und nach ihrer Rückführung in den Kosovo*, Köln: Deutsches Komitee für UNICEF e.V., [pp. 32-33].

Bulgaria and Romania probably earn around 400 and 600 Euro per month, which is hardly enough to cover basic needs.³⁶⁹

c. Financial situation/social transfers/debts/borrowing

Some studies mention that German Sinti and Roma as well as migrant Roma seem to be overrepresented among recipients of **social welfare**.³⁷⁰ A report from 2010 on Roma from Kosovo indicates that many families who are about to be deported depend on social welfare. Some families have received social welfare for years. Low levels of education, a lack of professional qualifications and missing qualification certificates were mentioned as reasons for the dependence on social welfare and the inability to access the labour market.³⁷¹

In general, migrants do not face limitations or restrictions in accessing the social protection system and its benefits. Foreigners may receive social support under certain circumstances according to the Social Code XII.³⁷² This does not apply to people whose only purpose is to search for employment or who came to Germany to receive social benefits.³⁷³ In general, the German law does not allow legalising irregular immigrants in order to ensure access to social protection and care.³⁷⁴

Roma asylum seekers, and other asylum seekers, whose status is still being reviewed, as well as so-called 'tolerated' persons, only receive basic social protection to cover their basic needs. Benefits include items as well as money, but are overall around 20% lower than social benefits given to other categories of people.³⁷⁵ The funds of the Asylum Seekers Benefits Act (*Asylbewerberleistungsgesetz, AsylbLG*) are too low to cover basic needs. This was confirmed by the Federal Constitutional Court in July 2012.³⁷⁶ For instance, there are not enough funds to enable children to fully participate in activities which are normal for their peers. Sometimes parents cannot afford to send their children on school trips, contributing to the isolation of those children.³⁷⁷ Persons with a 'tolerated' status are not eligible for child benefits. On average, Roma families have more children than the majority population. Hence, this regulation worsens

³⁶⁹ Loerzer, S. (2012), Einwanderer aus Rumänien und Bulgarien: Wenn die Armut sichtbar wird, in *Süddeutsche Zeitung*, 11 August 2012.

³⁷⁰ ERRC (European Roma Rights Center) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), [p. 26], available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf].

³⁷¹ Knaus, V. and Widmann, P. (2010), *Integration unter Vorbehalt: Zur Situation von Kindern kosovarischer Roma, Ashkali und Ägypter in Deutschland und nach ihrer Rückführung in den Kosovo*, Köln: Deutsches Komitee für UNICEF e.V., [p. 32].

³⁷² See article 23 *SGB XII*.

³⁷³ ECRI (2009), pp. 37-38; Germany, Commissioner of the Berlin Senate for Integration and Migration (*Beauftragter des Senats von Berlin für Integration und Migration*) (2012), *Roma und europäische Wanderarbeitnehmerinnen und -arbeitnehmer: Rechtsgrundlagen zu Aufenthalt und Bildung sowie Kontaktstellen*, Berlin, Senatsverwaltung für Arbeit, Integration und Frauen, [p. 6].

³⁷⁴ Aumüller, J. and Bretl, C. (2008), *Lokale Gesellschaften und Flüchtlinge: Förderung von sozialer Integration – Die kommunale Integration von Flüchtlingen in Deutschland*, Berlin: Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung, [p. 10-11].

³⁷⁵ ECRI (European Commission against Racism and Intolerance) (2009), ECRI Report on Germany – fourth monitoring cycle, No. CRI(2009)19, [pp. 37-38].

³⁷⁶ [Germany,] Federal Constitutional Court (*Bundesverfassungsgericht, BVerfG*) (2012), 1 BvL 10/10 from 18 July 2012, Section-No. (1 - 140).

³⁷⁷ Knaus, V. and Widmann, P. (2010), *Integration unter Vorbehalt: Zur Situation von Kindern kosovarischer Roma, Ashkali und Ägypter in Deutschland und nach ihrer Rückführung in den Kosovo*, Köln: Deutsches Komitee für UNICEF e.V., [p. 48].

the socio-economic situation of ‘tolerated’ Roma families.³⁷⁸ Asylum seekers and tolerated refugees have the worst social status among immigrants.³⁷⁹

If people, including Roma, are recognized as refugees or are entitled to political asylum, they receive a temporary residence permit. With this status, refugees are eligible for all social rights available to German citizens. This means, that persons with temporary residence receive support according to Social Code II (*SGB II.*) or Social Code XII (*SGB XII.*).³⁸⁰

In the following sections, various **indicators for the financial situation**, derived from different reports, will be presented which allow a conclusion on poverty of Roma in Germany. An NGO report focusing on Romanian and Bulgarian Roma in Berlin indicates that they often take credit loans from private persons, companies or institutions to afford daily needs. These include costs for school materials or costs for medical treatment in case family members are not insured. The income is usually not sufficient to cover these costs.³⁸¹

Another issue contributing to the poor economic situation of Roma migrants is linked to the German health insurance regulation. The German health insurance system demands retrospective payments of health insurance contributions from the first day of registration in Germany, even if the person did not require medical treatment. As a consequence, people entering the health insurance system suddenly have to deal with high debts. For self-employed people, the financial burden linked to health insurance is even higher because self-employed people have to cover insurance fees with their own means whereas employed persons share the insurance fees with their employer.³⁸²

Other indications for poverty among some Roma from Bulgaria and Romania can be deduced from empirical findings of a survey conducted in a district of Berlin. Children collecting returnable bottles to financially support their families as well as Roma from Romania selling newspapers were mentioned. Others try to earn a little bit of money with street performances. Begging was also mentioned as a source of income. Another issue that was mentioned in the same survey is the necessity for some Roma migrants to send money back to family members in their countries of origin.³⁸³

Another field report about the situation of Roma in the district Neukölln of Berlin after the accession of Bulgaria and Romania to the EU observes that many Bulgarian and Romanian people already have high **debts**. This can be caused by different factors as some need to pay

³⁷⁸ Grienig, G. (2010), *Roma in Deutschland*, Berlin: Berlin-Institut für Bevölkerung und Entwicklung, [p. 3].

³⁷⁹ Aumüller, J. and Bretl, C. (2008), *Lokale Gesellschaften und Flüchtlinge: Förderung von sozialer Integration – Die kommunale Integration von Flüchtlingen in Deutschland*, Berlin: Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung, [p. 10-11].

³⁸⁰ Aumüller, J. and Bretl, C. (2008), *Lokale Gesellschaften und Flüchtlinge: Förderung von sozialer Integration – Die kommunale Integration von Flüchtlingen in Deutschland*, Berlin: Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung, [p. 10-11].

³⁸¹ Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES, [p. 7].

³⁸² Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES, [p. 9].

³⁸³ Amaro Drom e.V., *Zielgruppenspezifische Unterstützungsbedarfe der Roma-Communities im Flughafenkiez: Auswertung der aktivierenden Befragung unter Bewohnergruppen mit Roma-Hintergrund und der Expertengespräche mit Bildungs- und Nachbarschaftseinrichtungen in den Quartiersmanagementgebieten Flughafenstraße und Donaustraße Nord*, Berlin, [p. 25].

health insurance retrospectively, as mentioned above, or they need to pay high electricity bills if the landlord does not provide sufficient heating oil.³⁸⁴

Although no statistical data or representative qualitative research has been conducted for a long time, reports and small surveys provide insight into the economic situation of Roma in Germany. It seems that poverty represents an issue amongst all groups of Roma in Germany. To combat poverty, initiatives and projects mainly focus on an improvement of the employment and education situation of Roma. Some civil society organisations offer consultations on issues like debt or how to access social benefits.

Major projects or initiatives

Mobile Contact Point for European Migrant Workers and Roma – Conflict Intervention against Anti-Gypsyism

One promising initiative, mentioned already in the chapter on health, is the project “Mobile Contact Point for European Migrant Workers and Roma – Conflict Intervention against Anti-Gypsyism”. Amaro Drom offers counselling on how to improve the economic situation of many migrants. Counselling is offered in Romani, Romanian, Bulgarian and if necessary in Serbo-Croatian, Bosnian, Polish and Hungarian. Furthermore, the translators offer to accompany the participants to authorities and other advice centres.³⁸⁵ With regard to the economic situation, the mobile contact point supports clients in communicating with creditors and finding solutions to pay off debts. In addition, the advice centre of Amaro Drom provides information on how to claim social benefits and what documents to prepare.³⁸⁶

³⁸⁴ [Germany,] *Bezirksamt Neukölln von Berlin – Abteilung Bildung, Schule, Kultur und Sport* (2012), 2. *Roma-Statusbericht: Entwicklung der Zuzüge von EU-Unionsbürger aus Südosteuropa: Berlin – Neukölln*, Berlin, [p. 7-8].

³⁸⁵ See also: [www.amarodrom.de/].

³⁸⁶ Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES, [p. 7-8].

7 Active citizenship/Rights awareness

a. Awareness of the existence of representative Roma organisations, other civil society organisations, anti-discrimination legislation and equality bodies

Civil society organisations, including Sinti and Roma organisations have played an important role in raising awareness of racism, discrimination and intolerance and in ensuring a dialogue between the German Government with regard to these issues.³⁸⁷ Further, Sinti and Roma organisations “have played a crucial role in the development of greater public awareness of the persecution of their communities, in obtaining recognition as a national minority, and in winning compensation for Romani victims of the Holocaust.”³⁸⁸

In Germany, various regional and national representative Sinti and Roma organisations exist.³⁸⁹ Under the coordination of the Central Council of German Sinti and Roma (*Zentralrat der Sinti und Roma*), which is located in Heidelberg, headed by Romani Rose and funded by the Federal Government, there are regional Sinti and Roma organisations within State Associations.³⁹⁰ Nine Sinti organisations and one Lowara tribe have formed the Alliance of German Sinti.³⁹¹ Furthermore, a number of other independent organisations exist, for instance, the Association of German Sinti of Lower Saxony and the Rom and Cinti Union in Hamburg.³⁹² According to a report, the organisations differ in terms of promoting different concepts of the Sinti and Roma minority.³⁹³ While the Central Council of German Sinti and Roma and their regional organisations promote the concept of a German national minority, many independent Roma organisations put forward “the concept of a transnational minority, assert minority rights for all resident Roma regardless of legal status (...).”³⁹⁴

There is no substantial information available on the level of awareness regarding the existence of representative Roma organisations. However, according to a representative of the Central Council of German Sinti and Roma (*Zentralrat der Sinti und Roma*), it may be assumed that German Sinti and Roma are aware of representative Roma organisations, as well as other civil society organisations.³⁹⁵

With regard to awareness of the existence of anti-discrimination legislation and equality bodies, study results indicate that generally there is a rather low level of awareness among Germany’s population in general.³⁹⁶ This general result may be transferable to Sinti and Roma as well. The

³⁸⁷ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

³⁸⁸ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

³⁸⁹ See Annex 5

³⁹⁰ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].;

[Germany,] [<http://zentralrat.sintiundroma.de/content/index.php?navID=24&tID=13&aID=0>].

³⁹¹ [Germany,] Federal Ministry of Interior (*Bundesministerium des Inneren*) (2010), *Nationale Minderheiten in Deutschland*, Berlin.

³⁹² Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

³⁹³ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

³⁹⁴ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

³⁹⁵ Interview: representative Zentralrat Sinti and Roma

³⁹⁶ [Germany,] Federal Anti-Discrimination Agency (*Antidiskriminierungsstelle des Bundes, ADS*) (2008), *Research Project: Discrimination in everyday life: Perceptions of discrimination and anti-discrimination policy in our society*, Heidelberg, [p. 108].

Federal Anti-Discrimination Agency (*Antidiskriminierungsstelle des Bundes, ADS*), Germany's first nationwide statutory anti-discrimination body, is challenged with a low awareness level of the existence of an anti-discrimination agency in general. Moreover, according to the results of the *Eurobarometer*, "only 44% of the respondents would contact the ADS if they are affected by discrimination."³⁹⁷ Furthermore, the ADS is regarded with suspicion by many persons concerned due to low levels of trust in governmental organisations. Results of a survey indicate that more than half of the interviewed Sinti and Roma feels intimidated, mistreated or discriminated when visiting authorities.³⁹⁸

b. Participation in elections and political representation

Data on the participation of Roma in European, national, regional and local elections or their representation in governmental, regional and local authorities (e.g. as ministers, parliamentarians, mayors, etc.) are not available. Passive as well as active participation in elections are restricted by citizenship at the local, national and EU level.

Roma are solely entitled to vote if they are in possession of German citizenship.³⁹⁹ This applies to German Sinti and Roma as an ethnic minority as well as naturalised migrants. Roma refugees and Roma with a foreign citizenship are not entitled to participate in elections, neither in local, national nor in European elections except for Roma EU citizens living in Germany who do have the right to vote in local and European elections.

Official data on the number of Roma who are eligible to vote are not available. Sinti and Roma organisations estimate that 60-70% of Roma are eligible to vote.⁴⁰⁰ With regard to the extent of participation in elections, most Sinti and Roma organisations believe that there is a relatively high proportion of Roma participating in political life.⁴⁰¹ In contrast, a report from 2004 stated that in particular many German Sinti and Roma women do not exercise their right to vote. Presumably, this is due to the lack of education and distrust towards politicians.⁴⁰²

With regard to active participation in elections, regulations are similar to passive participation in elections. Thus, Roma are only entitled to stand for elections if they are in possession of German citizenship. EU-citizens are allowed to stand in local elections.⁴⁰³ According to the Ministry of the Interior, Roma are not found in areas of active citizenship such as (local) political commissions or parties in any of the *Länder*.⁴⁰⁴ A report indicates "that there are no known Sinti or Roma representatives in either the Federal or state legislatures, although it

³⁹⁷ European Commission (2009), *Discrimination in the EU in 2009*, Special Eurobarometer 317, Brussels: European Commission, [p. 40].

³⁹⁸ Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg: I-Verb.de und RomnoKher.

³⁹⁹ [Germany,] Art 28 (1) Basic Law (*GG*)

⁴⁰⁰ Knudsen, M., Robel, Y. and T. Adam (2005), *Politische Partizipation von Sinti und Roma in der Bundesrepublik Deutschland*, Hamburg, [p. 3].

⁴⁰¹ Knudsen, M., Robel, Y. and T. Adam (2005), *Politische Partizipation von Sinti und Roma in der Bundesrepublik Deutschland*, Hamburg, [p. 13].

⁴⁰² ERRC (European Roma Rights Centre) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), [p. 19], available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf].

⁴⁰³ [Germany,] Basic Law, article 28 (1) and article 38;
European Communities (2010), article 22.

⁴⁰⁴ [Germany,] Federal Ministry of the Interior (Bundesministerium des Inneren) (2011), [p. 55].

asserts that a number of Sinti have been elected to municipal/parish councils. No Sinti or Roma are known to hold executive or judiciary offices”.⁴⁰⁵

Sinti and Roma organisations point out “that the level of participation in public life reached by Roma men has improved in the last years” and that Roma men “reportedly succeeded in being elected or employed at least in lower levels of local administration”.⁴⁰⁶ Yet, there are “no reports of Roma women in any official bodies of the state.”⁴⁰⁷

Nevertheless, ethnic origin is not recorded among political representatives, neither among members of parties nor among candidates, so no substantial statement can be made about the number of political Sinti and Roma representatives.

Yet, national minorities are granted specific rights that consider their special status and allow certain forms of political representation. In late 2004, leading organisations of the four national minorities founded the *Minderheitenrat* (Minority Council). The Minority Council initiated a parliamentary working group on minority issues to be set up. Moreover, an independent Secretary for Minority Issues has been appointed in the Office of the Federal Commissioner for Minorities. These developments have led to an enhanced political impact on the part of the national minorities.⁴⁰⁸

c. Participation and representation in non-governmental organisations

The participation of Roma in civil society organisations appears to be very active, as pointed out in a report from 2004. This is also confirmed by a representative of the Central Council of Sinti and Roma.⁴⁰⁹

Although there is a general assumption that Roma women have limited participation in the political life in Germany, they are highly involved in civil society organisations.⁴¹⁰ Roma women generally seek participation in NGOs, activities in primary schools, or tasks they can combine with domestic work.⁴¹¹

⁴⁰⁵ Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), ‘The Situation of Roma in Germany’, in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, [p. 141-224].

⁴⁰⁶ Faraco, C. (2006), ‘Country Report Germany’, in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [p. 18 – 29].

⁴⁰⁷ Faraco, C. (2006), ‘Country Report Germany’, in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels: European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, [p. 18 – 29].

⁴⁰⁸ Peucker, M. (2009), *Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009*, [p. 36]; Germany, Basic Law, article 28.

⁴⁰⁹ Interview with representative of the Central Council of Sinti and Roma.

⁴¹⁰ ERRC (European Roma Rights Centre) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Programme) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), [p. 4], available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf].

⁴¹¹ ERRC (European Roma Rights Centre) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Programme) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), [p. 4], available at: [www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf].

d. Awareness and use of complaints procedures

With the *AGG* entering into effect in August 2006, the independent body dealing with discrimination (*Antidiskriminierungsstelle des Bundes, ADS*) was established. The *ADS* covers all grounds of discrimination and deals with complaints regarding discrimination. Among other duties, the *ADS* is in charge of receiving complaints and providing support to victims of discrimination. Further, the *ADS* acts as a mediator between the accused perpetrator and the complainant in order to find an amicable solution. Yet, the *ADS* has no investigative powers and no mandate to assist the victim in legal procedures.

In addition, the two states of Hamburg and Berlin have recently installed a statutory anti-discrimination body. While the Hamburg state body (*Arbeitsstelle Vielfalt*) is also concerned with handling complaints and providing support to victims of discrimination (with a similar mandate as the *ADS* at the federal level), the Berlin *LADS* has successfully set up a Berlin-wide network of (mainly non-governmental) organisations specialised in dealing with discrimination complaints and offering professional support to complainants. In addition to the three government agencies, a number of non-governmental organisations have established anti-discrimination offices.⁴¹² For instance, the *Antidiskriminierungsverband Deutschland* (anti-discrimination association Germany, *advd*) was founded in 2007 by several non-governmental anti-discrimination organisations as an umbrella association. The *advd* focuses on empowering and supporting those who have experienced discrimination and works on unveiling and rectifying mechanisms of structural discrimination.

As stated above, there is a rather low level of awareness among the population living in Germany regarding the existence of anti-discrimination legislation and equality bodies. Particularly, a lack of information about the *ADS*'s function in anti-discrimination counselling can be observed. There are indications that there are many persons who would not contact the *ADS* if they are affected by discrimination because of low trust levels towards governmental organisations.

e. Experiences and perceptions of racial/ethnic discrimination

The previously mentioned anti-discrimination agencies record and process complaints or allegations of human rights violations, as well as racism and/or discrimination in education, housing, employment, healthcare, etc, especially with regard to ethnic discrimination. Yet, they do not specify ethnic origin and thus, do not record incidents signalled by Roma separately.

⁴¹² Peucker, M. and Lechner, C. (2010), *Machbarkeitsstudie: Standardisierte Datenerhebung zum Nachweis von Diskriminierung!? – Bestandsaufnahme und Ausblick*, Berlin, Antidiskriminierungsstelle des Bundes [p. 25].

Annexes

1. Bibliography

- Abdikeeva, A. (2002), *Germany's Policies towards Sinti and Roma: Living Apartheid?*, online ERRC report, available at: www.errc.org/cikk.php?cikk=777#12.
- Amaro Drom e.V., *Zielgruppenspezifische Unterstützungsbedarfe der Roma-Communities im Flughafenkiez: Auswertung der aktivierenden Befragung unter Bewohnergruppen mit Roma-Hintergrund und der Expertengespräche mit Bildungs- und Nachbarschaftseinrichtungen in den Quartiersmanagementgebieten Flughafenstraße und Donaustraße Nord*, Berlin.
- Anker, J. and Fahrur, J. (2012), 'Roma – Gesundheitsversorgung wird in Berlin zum Problem', in *Berliner Morgenpost*, 17 July 2012.
- Antidiskriminierungsnetzwerk Berlin des Türkischen Bundes in Berlin-Brandenburg (eds.) (2007), *Sinti und Roma - Bürger/-innen unseres Landes*, Berlin, Concept Verlag & Werbeagentur GmbH.
- Arbeitsgruppe Roma und Sinti, im Rahmen des Nationalen Thematischen Netzwerks Asyl in der europäischen Gemeinschaftsinitiative EQUAL (ed.) (2007), *Zugang zur Arbeitsmarkt für Roma und Sinti*, available at: www.equal-asyl.de/fileadmin/dokumente/arbeitsmarkt_fuer_sinti_und_fuer_roma.pdf.
- AspE e.V. (Ambulante sozialpädagogische Erziehungshilfe) (2010), *Dokumentation der Fachtagung „Roma im Kontext“: Roma-Familien in Kinder- und Jugendhilfe Gesundheits- und Bildungsbereich*, Berlin, 6 October 2010.
- Aumüller, J. and Bretl, C. (2008), *Lokale Gesellschaften und Flüchtlinge: Förderung von sozialer Integration – Die kommunale Integration von Flüchtlingen in Deutschland*, Berlin, Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung.
- Bachmann, L., Büsing, W., Kammerer, J., Yazar, S. (2007), *Roma und der Arbeitsmarkt: Berufs- und Bildungsförderung für Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Berlin, Ed. Parabolis.
- Bakar, R., Hofert, A., Kraake, A., Leucht, C., Lorenz, M., Niederer, S., Stroux, M. (2007), *Zugang zum Arbeitsmarkt für Roma und für Sinti: Informationen zur beruflichen Integration von Roma und Sinti in Deutschland*, Hamburg, Arbeitsgruppe Roma und Sinti im Rahmen des Nationalen Thematischen Netzwerks Asyl in der europäischen Gemeinschaftsinitiative EQUAL.
- Bartlett, W., Benini, R., Gordon, C. (2011), *Measures to promote the situation of Roma EU citizens in the European Union*, Brussels, European Parliament – Policy Department C: Citizens` Rights and Constitutional Affairs (ed.).
- Becker, K.E. (Hg.) (2011), *Minderheiten in Deutschland*. Worms, Worms-Verlag.
- Bender-Jarju, S. and Torres Mendes, C. (2007), 'Bildungsarbeit mit geflüchteten Frauen', in: EQUAL Entwicklungspartnerschaft FLUCHTort Hamburg (ed.), *Lernen trotz Trauma: Möglichkeiten der beruflichen Qualifizierung von kriegs- und fluchtraumatisierten Frauen*, Hamburg, pp. 36-43.

- Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung (2006), *Economic Aspects of the Condition of Roma Women*, Brussels, European Parliament.
- Berlin- Institut (2010), *Geschätzte Anzahl der Roma in europäischen Ländern*, available at: <http://de.statista.com/statistik/daten/studie/164659/umfrage/roma-in-europa/>.
- Central Council of German Sinti and Roma (2006), *Realising Equal Treatment: EU Directive for the Improvement of the Situation of the Roma and Sinti Minorities in Europe*, available at: <http://zentralrat.sintiundroma.de/content/downloads/stellungnahmen/equaltreatment11.06.pdf>.
- Council of Europe (1999), *Housing, urban planning and poverty: problems faced by Roma / Gypsy communities with particular reference to central and eastern Europe*, available at: [www.coe.int/T/DG3/RomaTravellers/documentation/housing/Housingreport\(99\)1M.acura_en.asp](http://www.coe.int/T/DG3/RomaTravellers/documentation/housing/Housingreport(99)1M.acura_en.asp).
- Council of Europe (2007) *Report by the Commissioner for Human Rights Mr. Thomas Hammarberg on his Visit to Germany 9-11 and 15-20 October 2006*, p. 29, available at: <https://wcd.coe.int/ViewDoc.jsp?id=1162763&Site=COE&BackColorInternet=DBDCF2&BackColorIntranet=FDC864&BackColorLogged=FDC864>
- ECRI (European Commission against Racism and Intolerance) (2009), *ECRI Report on Germany – fourth monitoring cycle*, No. CRI(2009)19.
- Engels, D., Köller, R., Koopmans, R., Höhne, J. (2011), *Zweiter Integrationsindikatorenbericht erstellt für die Beauftragte der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration*, Köln/Berlin.
- ERRC (European Roma Rights Center) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), *Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Open Society Institute (OSI), available at: www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf.
- European Commission, Directorate-General for Justice (2012), *National Roma Integration Strategies: a first step in the implementation of the EU Framework*.
- European Commission (2008), *Discrimination in the European Union: Perception, Experiences and Attitudes*, Special Eurobarometer 296, available at: http://ec.europa.eu/public_opinion/archives/ebs/ebs_296_en.pdf.
- European Commission (2009), *Discrimination in the EU in 2009*, Special Eurobarometer 317, Brussels: European Commission.
- European Communities (2010), *Consolidated version of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (Konsolidierte Fassung des Vertrags über die Arbeitsweise der Europäischen Union, AEUV)*, OJ C 83.
- European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia (EUMC) (2006), *Roma and Travellers in public education: An overview of the situation in the EU Member States*, Vienna, EUMC.

- Faraco, C. (2006), 'Country Report Germany', in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (*Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung*) (ed.), *Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women*, Brussels, European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, pp. 18 – 29.
- Frese, J. (2011). *Sinti und Schule. Woran Bildungskarrieren scheitern*, Marburg, Tectum Verlag.
- Frick, J. R., Grabka, M. M., Groh-Samberg, O., Hertel, F. R., Tucci, I. (2009), *Alterssicherung von Personen mit Migrationshintergrund*, Berlin, Deutsches Institut für Wirtschaftsforschung.
- Friedrichs, J. (2008), 'Ethnische Segregation', in: Kalter, F. (ed.), *Migration und Integration*, Wiesbaden, VS Verlag.
- Germany, Asylum Procedure Act (*Asylverfahrensgesetz, AsylVerfG*), 26 June 1992.
- Germany, Asylum seekers Benefits Act (*Asylbewerberleistungsgesetz, AsylbLG*), 30 June 1993.
- Germany, Basic Law of the Federal Republic of Germany (*Grundgesetz für die Bundesrepublik Deutschland, GG*), 23 May 1949.
- Germany, *Bezirksamt Neukölln von Berlin – Abteilung Bildung, Schule, Kultur und Sport* (2012), 2. *Roma-Statusbericht: Entwicklung der Zuzüge von EU-Unionsbürger aus Südosteuropa: Berlin – Neukölln*, Berlin.
- Germany, Commissioner of the Berlin Senate for Integration and Migration (*Beauftragter des Senats von Berlin für Integration und Migration*) (2012), *Roma und europäische Wanderarbeitnehmerinnen und -arbeitnehmer: Rechtsgrundlagen zu Aufenthalt und Bildung sowie Kontaktstellen*, Berlin, Senatsverwaltung für Arbeit, Integration und Frauen.
- Germany, Federal Anti-Discrimination Agency (*Antidiskriminierungsstelle des Bundes, ADS*) (2008), *Research Project: Discrimination in everyday life: Perceptions of discrimination and anti-discrimination policy in our society*, Heidelberg.
- Germany, Federal Commissioner for Migration, Refugees and Integration (*Beauftragte der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration*) (2010), 8. *Bericht der Beauftragten der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration über die Lage der Ausländerinnen und Ausländer in Deutschland*.
- Germany, Federal Constitutional Court (*Bundesverfassungsgericht, BVerfG*) (2012), 1 BvL 10/10 from 18 July 2012, Section-No. (1 - 140).
- Germany, Federal Government (*Bundesregierung*) (2011a), 'Antwort der Bundesregierung auf die Große Anfrage der Abgeordneten Volker Beck (Köln), Tom Koenigs, Manuel Sarrazin, weiterer Abgeordneter und der Fraktion BÜNDNIS 90/DIE GRÜNEN – Drucksache 17/5536 – Zur Situation von Roma in der Europäischen Union und in den (potentiellen) EU-Beitrittskandidatenstaaten', Printed matter 17/7131, 22 September 2011.
- Germany, Federal Government (*Bundesregierung*) (2011b), 'Antwort der Bundesregierung auf die Kleine Anfrage der Abgeordneten Volker Beck (Köln), Tom Koenigs, Marieluise Beck (Bremen), weiterer Abgeordneter und der Fraktion BÜNDNIS 90/DIE GRÜNEN – Drucksache 17/6582 – Verabschiedung einer

- nationalen Strategie zur Integration der Roma', Printed matter 17/6698, 28 July 2011.
- Germany, Federal Government (*Bundesregierung*) (2011c), *Nationaler Aktionsplan Integration*, Berlin.
- Germany, Federal Ministry of Education and Research (*Bundesministerium für Bildung und Forschung, BMBF*) (ed.) (2012), *Schulische Anerkennung*, available at: www.anerkennung-in-deutschland.de/html/de/204.php.
- Germany, Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Inneren*) (2004), *Nationale Minderheiten in Deutschland*, Berlin.
- Germany, Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Inneren*) (2010), *Nationale Minderheiten in Deutschland*, Berlin.
- Germany, Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Inneren*) (2011), *EU-Rahmen für nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020 – Integrierte Maßnahmenpakete zur Integration und Teilhabe der Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Berlin, Bundesministerium des Inneren.
- Germany, Federal Ministry of the Interior (*Bundesministerium des Innern*) (2011a), *Report from the Federal Republic of Germany to the European Commission – An EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020: Integrated packages of measures to promote the integration and participation of Sinti and Roma in Germany*.
- Germany, Federal Ministry for Migration and Refugees (*Bundesministerium für Migration und Flüchtlinge, BAMF*) (2012), EU-Bürger: Anspruch auf Teilnahme, 2 March 2012, available at: www.bamf.de/DE/Willkommen/DeutschLernen/Integrationskurse/TeilnahmeKosten/EUBu erger/eubuerger-node.html.
- Germany, Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2007), 'Beschlussempfehlung: Zur Situation von Roma in der Europäischen Union, in den EU-Beitrittsländern und im Kosovo', printed matter 16/5784, 20 June 2007.
- Germany, Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2011b), 'Antwort auf die Kleine Anfrage: Nationale Strategie zur Integration der Roma und Sinti in Deutschland', printed matter 17/6698, 28 June 2011.
- Germany, Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2011c), 'Kleine Anfrage: Nationale Strategie zur Integration der Roma und Sinti in Deutschland', printed matter 17/6012, 30 May 2011.
- Germany, Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2011d), 'Antrag: Die Integration der Sinti und Roma in Europa verbessern', printed matter 17/6090, 07 June 2011.
- Germany, Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2011e), 'Antwort der Bundesregierung auf die Kleine Anfrage: Verschärfte Abschiebung von Roma in den Kosovo', printed matter 17/8224, 19 December 2011.
- Germany, Federal Parliament (*Bundestag*) (2012), 'Beschränkungen der Reisefreiheit für Roma aus Serbien, Montenegro und Mazedonien infolge des EU-Visumregimes', printed matter 17/8747, 27 February 2012.
- Germany, Freedom of Movement Law (*Freizügigkeitsgesetz, FreizügG/EU*), 30 July 2004.

- Germany, General Administrative Regulations on Freedom of Movement Law (*Allgemeine Verwaltungsvorschrift zum Freizügigkeitsgesetz/EU, VV FreizügG/EU*), 26 October 2009.
- Germany, General Equal Treatment Act (*Allgemeines Gleichbehandlungsgesetz, AGG*), 14 August 2006.
- Germany, German Parliament (*Deutscher Bundestag*) (2010), ‘Tagesordnungspunkt 17’, plenary protocol 17/24, 25 March 2010.
- Germany, Housing Allowance Act (*Wohnraumförderungsgesetz, WoFG*), 13 September 2001.
- Germany, Residence Act (*Gesetz über den Aufenthalt, die Erwerbstätigkeit und die Integration von Ausländern im Bundesgebiet, AufenthG*), 20 July 2004.
- Germany, Social Code II. (*Sozialgesetzbuch, SGB II.*), 24 December 2003.
- Germany, Social Code III. (*Sozialgesetzbuch, SGB III.*), 24 March 1997.
- Germany, Social Code VI. (*Sozialgesetzbuch, SGB VI.*), 18 December 1989.
- Germany, Social Code XII. (*Sozialgesetzbuch, SGB XII.*), 27 December 2003.
- Germany, State Parliament of Baden-Württemberg (*Landtag von Baden-Württemberg*) (2011), ‘Anfrage und Stellungnahme: Situation der Sinti und Roma in Baden-Württemberg’, printed matter 15/472, 02 September 2011.
- Gesellschaft für bedrohte Völker (2002), *Basisfakten Sinti und Roma*, available at: www.barbara-l-eprt.de/roma.html.
- Grienig, G. (2010), *Roma in Deutschland*, Berlin, Berlin-Institut für Bevölkerung und Entwicklung.
- Heitmeyer, W. (ed.) (2012), *Deutsche Zustände: Folge 10*, Berlin.
- Hundsals, A. (1982), *Soziale Situation der Sinti in der Bundesrepublik Deutschland: Endbericht, Lebensverhältnisse deutscher Sinti unter besonderer Berücksichtigung der eigenen Aussagen und Meinungen der Betroffenen*, Stuttgart-Berlin-Cologne-Mainz, Kohlhammer.
- Jenssen, J. and Misbach, E. (2009), *Gesundheitsversorgung Illegalisierter: Integration in die Regelversorgung statt Entwicklung weiterer Parallelsysteme*, Heinrich Böll Stiftung.
- Jonuz, E. (2009), *Stigma Ethnizität. Wie zugewanderte Romafamilien der Ethnisierungsfalle begegnen*, Opladen, Budrich.
- Knaus, V. and Widmann, P. (2010), *Integration unter Vorbehalt: Zur Situation von Kindern kosovarischer Roma, Ashkali und Ägypter in Deutschland und nach ihrer Rückführung in den Kosovo*, Köln, Deutsches Komitee für UNICEF e.V.
- Knudsen, M., Robel, Y. and T. Adam (2005), *Politische Partizipation von Sinti und Roma in der Bundesrepublik Deutschland*, Hamburg.
- Koch, U. (2010), ‘Soziale Konstruktion und Diskriminierung von Sinti und Roma’, in: Hormel, U. and Scherr A. (eds.): *Diskriminierung: Grundlagen und Forschungsergebnisse*. VS Verlag, Wiesbaden, pp. 255-278.

- Kohls, M. (2011), *Morbidität und Mortalität von Migranten in Deutschland*, Nuremberg, Federal Ministry for Migration and Refugees (*Bundesministerium für Migration und Flüchtlinge*).
- Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), *Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020*, 12 March 2012.
- Kurtiši, S. (2007), 'Von Roma für Roma', in: Antidiskriminierungsnetzwerk Berlin des Türkischen Bundes in Berlin-Brandenburg (ed.), *Sinti und Roma - Bürger/-innen unseres Landes*, Berlin, Concept Verlag & Werbeagentur GmbH, pp. 23-25.
- Lange, K. (2004), 'Dreilinden öffnet wieder für Sinti and Roma', in *Berliner Morgenpost* online, 30 April 2004, available at: www.morgenpost.de/printarchiv/berlin/article397793/Dreilinden_oeffnet_wieder_fuer_Sinti_und_Roma.html.
- Link, J. (2011), *Schichttypische Benachteiligung im allgemeinen Bildungswesen: Ein Vergleich zwischen Kanada und Deutschland*. Wiesbaden, VS Verlag.
- Loerzer, S. (2012), Einwanderer aus Rumänien und Bulgarien: Wenn die Armut sichtbar wird, in *Süddeutsche Zeitung*, 11 August 2012.
- Lüken-Klaßen, D. and Meixner, S. (2004), *Roma in Public Education*, Bamberg, european forum for migration studies (efms).
- Mengersen, O. (2012), *Sinti und Roma in der Schule – die Meinung von Lehrerinnen und Lehrern*, in: Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (ed.), *Gleichberechtigte Teilhabe für Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Heidelberg.
- Migazin (2012), 'Bundesregierung verabschiedet Blaue Karte', 30 April 2012, available at: www.migazin.de/2012/04/30/bundesregierung-verabschiedet-blaue-karte/.
- Mihok, B. and Widmann, P. (2007), 'Die Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Fallbeispiele aus fünf Städten', in: Schlagintweit, R. and Rupprecht, R. (eds.): *Zwischen Integration und Isolation: Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland und Südosteuropa*, Berlin, Metropol Verlag, p. 22-23.
- Netzwerk "FLUCHTort Hamburg" (2006), 'Wege in die Erwerbsarbeit – Beratung und Qualifizierung für Roma-Frauen', in *Newsletter Netzwerk FLUCHTort Hamburg: Berufliche Qualifizierung für Flüchtlinge*, No. 1, March 2006.
- Nickel, R. (2006), 'Das Allgemeine Gleichbehandlungsgesetz: Einführung und Würdigung', available at: www.migration-boell.de/web/diversity/48_804.asp.
- Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), 'The Situation of Roma in Germany', in: OSI (ed.), *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection*, pp. 141-224.
- Parusel, B. (2010), *Europäische und nationale Formen der Schutzgewährung in Deutschland*, Nuremberg, BAMF.
- Peucker, M. (2009), *Racism, Xenophobia and Ethnic Discrimination in Germany – Update Report 2009*.
- Peucker, M., Bochmann, A., Heidmann, R. (2009), *RAXEN Thematic study: Housing conditions of Sinti and Roma*, Bamberg, European forum for migration studies (efms).

- Peucker, M. and Lechner, C. (2010), *Machbarkeitsstudie: Standardisierte Datenerhebung zum Nachweis von Diskriminierung!? – Bestandsaufnahme und Ausblick*, Berlin, Antidiskriminierungsstelle des Bundes.
- Planerladen (ed.) (2009), *Ungleichbehandlung von Migranten auf dem Wohnungsmarkt. Ergebnisse eines telefonischen „Paired Ethnic Testing“ bei regionalen Immobilienanzeigen*, Dortmund.
- Presse- und Informationsamt der Bundesregierung (2010), *Chancen durch Integration. Ratgeber für Familie*, 3rd ed., available at: www.bundesregierung.de/Content/DE/Publikation/IB/2008-07-17-chancen-durch-integration.pdf?__blob=publicationFile&v=4.
- Razum, O., Zeeb, H., Meesmann, U., Schenk, L., Bredehorst, M., Brzoska, P., Dercks, T., Glodny, S., Menkhaus, B., Salman, R., Saß, A., Ulrich, R. (2008), *Schwerpunktbericht der Gesundheitsberichterstattung des Bundes: Migration und Gesundheit*, Berlin, Robert Koch-Institut.
- Rolly, H. (2012), Ethnisierung der Bildungsbenachteiligung, in: Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (ed.), *Gleichberechtigte Teilhabe für Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Heidelberg.
- Rose, R. (2012), Gleichberechtigte Teilhabe für Sinti und Roma in Deutschland und in Europa nicht nur auf dem Papier, in: Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (ed.), *Gleichberechtigte Teilhabe für Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Heidelberg.
- Schäfer, M. and Heilmann, B. (2011), *Begegnung und Verständigung - Sinti und Roma in NRW – Schulische und schulbegleitende Förderung und Initiativen für Kinder aus Sinti- und Roma-Familien*, Arnsberg, Bezirksregierung Arnsberg.
- Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), *EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers*, EUROCITIES.
- Schmitz, J. (2012), ‘Routinemäßiges Tuberkulose-Screening von Immigranten: Eine sinnvolle und kosteneffiziente Strategie?’, *Pharmazie in unserer Zeit*, Vol. 41, No. 1, pp.76-78.
- Schraad-Tischer, D., Hellmann, T., Azahaf, N., Schwarz, R. (2011), *Nachhaltiges Regieren in der OECD – Wie zukunftsfähig ist Deutschland?: Sustainable Governance Indicators 2011*, Gütersloh, Bertelsmann Stiftung.
- Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*, Marburg, I-Verb.de und RomnoKher.
- Verband deutscher Sinti und Roma e.V. (2009), *Sinti und Roma in NRW*, available at: www.sintiundroma-nrw.de/surnrwzwei.htm.
- Weiß, G. (2004), *Mediatorinnentätigkeit in der Beratungsstelle Soziales/Arbeit vom 1. August 2003 bis 31. Juli 2004*, available at: www.sinti-roma-bawue.de/Mediatorenbericht.html.
- Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (2006), *Ergebnisse der Repräsentativumfrage des Zentralrats Deutscher Sinti und Roma über den Rassismus gegen Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*, Heidelberg, Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma, available at: <http://zentralrat.sintiundroma.de/content/downloads/stellungnahmen/UmfrageRassismus06.pdf>

Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (2012), *UNO-Menschenrechtsrat, 15.-18. März 2012 in Genf Side Event IMADR am 16. März 2012 – Stellungnahme*.

Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), *Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse*, Berlin, UNICEF Deutschland.

Interviews

Expert A: Dr. Petra Tiarks-Jungk, Public Health Department Frankfurt am Main (*Stadtgesundheitsamt Frankfurt am Main*), Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

Expert B: Silke Huopp, Förderverein Roma e.V., Frankfurt am Main, 3 August 2012.

Expert C: Veronika Wolf, Asklepios Fachklinikum Göttingen, Göttingen, 24 August 2012.

Expert E: Representative of the regional Department for the Assistance of Children and Youth of Immigrant Families/RAA, Cologne (Regionale Arbeitsstelle zur Förderung von Kindern und Jugendlichen aus Zuwanderfamilien), Köln, 2 October 2012.

Expert D: Representative of the Central Council of German Sinti and Roma, not yet authorised

2. Statistical tables

Table 1: German Sinti and Roma at primary school by age groups

	Attended primary school	not attended primary school	Total
14- 25 years	96	10	106
	90.6%	9.4%	100%
26 – 50 years	91	21	112
	81.3%	18.8%	100%
51 years and older	26	17	43
	60.5%	39.5%	100%
Total	213	48	261
	81.6%	18.4%	100%

Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*

Table 2: Attendance of German Sinti and Roma in different types of school by age groups

	General secondary school	Intermediate secondary school	Special school
14 – 25 years	83	13	13
	78.3%	12.3%	12.3%
26- 50 years	57	15	15
	50.9%	13.4%	13.4%
51 years and older	11	2	2
	25.6%	4.7%	4.7%
Total	151	30	30
	57.9%	11.5%	11.5%

Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*

Table 3: German Sinti and Roma at vocational training by age groups

	n.a.	yes	no	Total
14 – 25 years	29	23	54	106
	27.4%	21.7%	50.9%	100%
26- 50 years	2	20	90	112
	1.8%	17.9%	80.4%	100%
51 years and older	1	6	36	43
	2.3%	14%	83.7%	100%
Total	32	49	180	361
	12.3%	18.8%	69%	100%

Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*

Table 4: Experiences of discrimination among German Sinti and Roma by age groups

	n.a.	yes	no	Total
--	------	-----	----	-------

14 – 25 years	1	40	65	106
	0.9%	37.7%	61.3%	100%
26- 50 years	12	50	50	112
	10.7%	44.6%	44.6%	100%
51 years and older	13	19	11	43
	30.2%	44.2%	25.6%	100%
Total	26	109	126	261
	10%	41.8%	48.3%	100%

Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*

Table 5: Experiences of discrimination among German Sinti and Roma by school types

	n.a.	yes	no	Total
At primary school	5	102	106	213
	2.3%	47.9%	49.8%	100%
At general secondary school	3	66	82	151
	2%	43.7%	54.3%	100%
At intermediate secondary school	1	9	20	30
	3.3%	30%	66.7%	100%
At special schools	1	13	14	28
	3.6%	46.4%	50.0%	100.0%

Strauß, D. (2011), *Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht*

Table 6 Experiences of ethnic discrimination by German Sinti and Roma

	Experiences of ethnic discrimination
Discrimination at the workplace, by neighbours, or other places	Yes: 76% Rarely: 10.7% No: 13.2%
Discrimination when applying for a job	Yes: 44% No: 54%
Discrimination when applying for a flat	Yes: 54% No: 43%
Discrimination by authorities: Have the authorities registered your ethnic belonging	Yes: 45.9% Possibly, not sure: 31.7% No, never: 18.8%
Discrimination of (grant) children: sufficient support at school?	Yes: 30% No: 40% Don't know: 20%
Discrimination of (grant) children: unequal (less favourable) treatment at school	Yes: 40% No: 30% No response: 30%

Source: Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (2006) *Ergebnisse der Repräsentativumfrage des Zentralrats Deutscher Sinti und Roma über den Rassismus gegen Sinti und Roma in Deutschland*

3. Table of complaints

No data available.

4. Table of sources (reports and studies on Roma)

	Title, author, source	Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma; Strauß, D. (2011), Studie zur aktuellen Bildungssituation deutscher Sinti und Roma. Dokumentation und Forschungsbericht, Marburg, I-Verb.de und RomnoKher
	Source and type	Non-governmental report
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	
	<i>Employment</i>	
	<i>Health</i>	
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	275 interviews with Sinti and Roma of three generations
	Location	35 localities (cities and communities predominantly in Western part of Germany)
	Target population	Roma and Sinti in Germany
	Key findings	Strong experience of discrimination at schools; nearly half do not have school qualification; more engagement in 2 nd and 3 rd generation
	Methodology	Quantitative survey and narrative interviews
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	Non-representative survey, only German Sinti and Roma

	Title, author, source	Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland; Zentrum für Antisemitismusforschung der Technischen Universität Berlin (2007), Zur Lage von Kindern aus Roma-Familien in Deutschland: Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse, Berlin, UNICEF Deutschland.
	Source and type	Non-governmental report
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	✓
	<i>Employment</i>	
	<i>Health</i>	✓
	<i>Poverty</i>	✓
	<i>Migration</i>	✓
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	49 interviews with local actors, experts from schools, civil service, state + non-state institutions; documents from legislative and executive processes
	Location	Hamburg, Berlin, Münster, Frankfurt am Main, Köln
	Target population	Migrant Roma arriving after 1990, in particular Roma refugees
	Key findings	Access to education, housing and health service depends on residence permit status as well as on regulations implemented by each Federal State and local administration. Only 1/3 of all Roma refugees have a residence permit that allows integration. Due to disadvantaged housing situation, Roma children are exposed to stigmatization and social exclusion.
	Methodology	Qualitative: Guided interviews and document analysis
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	Non-representative survey, only migrant Roma (arriving after 1990), in particular Roma refugees, case studies in five cities

	Title, author, source	Roma in Deutschland; Grienig, G. (2010), Roma in Deutschland, Berlin, Berlin-Institut für Bevölkerung und Entwicklung.
	Source and type	Non-governmental report
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	
	<i>Employment</i>	✓
	<i>Health</i>	
	<i>Poverty</i>	✓
	<i>Migration</i>	✓
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	n. a.
	Location	Germany
	Target population	-
	Key findings	No reliable data on Roma population, only estimates possible. Vicious circle: Integration in education system is low → continuous poverty, unemployment → prejudices and discrimination., persistent stereotypes and ignorance in majority of population
	Methodology	-
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	-

	Title, author, source	Zugang zum Arbeitsmarkt für Roma und Sinti: Informationen zur beruflichen Integration von Roma und Sinti in Deutschland; Arbeitsgruppe Roma und Sinti, im Rahmen des Nationalen Thematischen Netzwerks Asyl in der europäischen Gemeinschaftsinitiative EQUAL (ed.) (2007), Zugang zur Arbeitsmarkt für Roma und Sinti, available at: www.equal-asyl.de/fileadmin/dokumente/arbeitsmarkt_fuer_sinti_und_fuer_roma.pdf
	Source and type	Governmental report, in cooperation with NGO
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	
	<i>Employment</i>	✓
	<i>Health</i>	
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	n. a.
	Location	Hamburg, Berlin, Frankfurt am Main, Aachen
	Target population	-
	Key findings	Overview of six projects concerning Sinti and Roma and their integration into the labour market. Results: Similar discrimination against Sinti and Roma despite considerable differences between both groups; success of a project depends, inter alia, on the adequate consideration of the participants` qualifications.
	Methodology	Analysis of EQUAL-projects in Germany
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	-

	Title, author, source	Roma in Public Education; Lüken-Klaßen, D. and Meixner, S. (2004), Roma in Public Education, Bamberg, european forum for migration studies (efms).
	Source and type	Non-governmental report

Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	
	<i>Employment</i>	
	<i>Health</i>	
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	Interviews with experts, results of small regional surveys
	Location	Germany
	Target population	Migrant Roma, German Sinti and Roma
	Key findings	Roma children disproportionately attend special needs schools; suffer from stereotypes in schools; high influence of social background on success in German schools in general (and Roma suffer from that disadvantage); no federal approach to educational needs due to the decentralised German education system.
	Methodology	Qualitative Interviews, analysis of studies and reports
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	

	Title, author, source	Ergebnisse der Repräsentativumfrage über den Rassismus gegen Sinti und Roma in Deutschland; Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (2006), Ergebnisse der Repräsentativumfrage des Zentralrats Deutscher Sinti und Roma über den Rassismus gegen Sinti und Roma in Deutschland, Heidelberg, Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma, available at: http://zentralrat.sintiundroma.de/content/downloads/stellungnahmen/UmfragungRassismus06.pdf
	Source and type	Non-governmental report
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	
	<i>Employment</i>	
	<i>Health</i>	
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	Survey with Roma or Sinti families of different generations, n=309
	Location	Germany
	Target population	German Sinti and Roma
	Key findings	Relative or absolute majority of respondents name discrimination in all mentioned areas (daily life, public administration, education, media coverage). In addition, 90.3% fear prejudices as a consequence of predominantly stereotypical media reports.
	Methodology	Quantitative analysis
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	Representative, only German Sinti and Roma

	Title, author, source	Roma und der Arbeitsmarkt: Berufs- und Bildungsförderung für Sinti und Roma in Deutschland; Bachmann, L., Büsing, W., Kammerer, J., Yazar, S. (2007), Roma und der Arbeitsmarkt: Berufs- und Bildungsförderung für Sinti und Roma in Deutschland, Berlin, Ed. Parabolis.
--	------------------------------	--

	Source and type	Non-governmental report
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	✓
	<i>Employment</i>	✓
	<i>Health</i>	
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	✓
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	✓
	Sample	32 interviews with experts; standardized interviews with 15 coaches and mediators; standardized interviews with 56 participants of support measures
	Location	Germany
	Target population	German Sinti and Roma, migrant Roma
	Key findings	Education: problems because of disadvantageous structures in education system, because of discrimination in schools and (in the case of migrants) because of residence status. Accordingly: lower integration in labour market than other social groups, plus discrimination in access to work. Housing: Clear segregation. Existing (national and international) anti-discrimination provisions have loopholes. Deep antiziganism prevented/prevents creation of support programmes in education and access to labour market for Roma.
	Methodology	Qualitative analysis
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	-

	Title, author, source	Diskriminierung von zugewanderten Roma im Bildungssystem; Antidiskriminierungsnetzwerk Berlin des Türkischen Bundes in Berlin-Brandenburg (eds.) (2007), Sinti und Roma - Bürger/-innen unseres Landes, Berlin, Concept Verlag & Werbeagentur GmbH.
	Source and type	Non-governmental report, government support/funding
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	
	<i>Employment</i>	
	<i>Health</i>	
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	✓
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	n. a.
	Location	Berlin
	Target population	Migrant Roma
	Key findings	Integration of the migrant Roma children in the education is dependent on the education of the parents, their migration history, and to the education situation in the home country.
	Methodology	Qualitative analysis
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	Only migrant Roma in Berlin

	Title, author, source	The situation of Roma in Germany; Open Society Institute (OSI) (2002), 'The Situation of Roma in Germany', in: OSI (ed.), Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Protection, pp. 141-224.
	Source and type	Non-governmental report
The	<i>Education</i>	✓

	<i>Housing</i>	✓
	<i>Employment</i>	✓
	<i>Health</i>	✓
	<i>Poverty</i>	✓
	<i>Migration</i>	✓
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	✓
	Sample	n. a.
	Location	Baden-Wuerttemberg, Bavaria, Berlin, Brandenburg, Hamburg, Hesse, Lower Saxony, Mecklenburg-West Pomerania, North Rhine-Westphalia, Rhineland-Palatinate, Saxony-Anhalt and Schleswig-Holstein.
	Target population	Migrant Roma, German Sinti and Roma
	Key findings	Roma children are over-represented in special needs schools. Roma conceal their ethnicity when applying for jobs. There is no comprehensive anti-discrimination legislation; selected anti-discrimination provisions cover some but not all forms of discrimination. Specific job creation measures remain inefficient. Roma migrants live primarily in council housing flats. Strong correlation between substandard housing conditions and higher rate of health problems among Sinti and Roma is presumed. Roma in Germany face prejudice, exclusion and discrimination in different areas, including amongst others access to public goods and services, the criminal justice system, as well as barriers to the full enjoyment of minority rights; no adequate government programme in place to address these issues.
	Methodology	Review of existing research, statistical data, and surveys on minority issues in conjunction with interviews carried out by country reporters.
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	-

	Title, author, source	Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission. EU-Rahmen für nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020 – Integrierte Maßnahmenpakete zur Integration und Teilhabe der Sinti und Roma in Deutschland; Germany, Federal Ministry of the Interior (Bundesministerium des Inneren) (2011), EU-Rahmen für nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020 – Integrierte Maßnahmenpakete zur Integration und Teilhabe der Sinti und Roma in Deutschland, Berlin, Bundesministerium des Inneren.
	Source and type	Governmental report
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	✓
	<i>Employment</i>	✓
	<i>Health</i>	✓
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	✓
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	n. a.
	Location	Germany
	Target population	German Sinti and Roma
	Key findings	Promotion of measures that shall be adopted as part of an integration project (education, employment, housing, health) for Roma and Sinti in Germany.
	Methodology	-
	Representativeness,	-

	transferability of findings	
--	------------------------------------	--

	Title, author, source	RAXEN National Focal Point - Thematic Study - Housing Conditions of Sinti and Roma; Peucker, M., Bochmann, A., Heidmann, R. (2009), RAXEN Thematic study: Housing conditions of Sinti and Roma, Bamberg, European forum for migration studies (efms).
	Source and type	Non-governmental report
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	
	<i>Housing</i>	✓
	<i>Employment</i>	
	<i>Health</i>	
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	✓
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	Six interviews: three with civil society and/or Sinti and Roma; two with representatives of authorities; and one additional interview with an expert at a research organisation, who also represents a Sinti and Roma organisation.
	Location	Germany
	Target population	Migrant Roma, German Sinti and Roma
	Key findings	Broad consensus: a pressing issue is to get access to adequate housing for large and disadvantaged families receiving social welfare. Aside from their often socially disadvantaged socioeconomic situation, ethnic discrimination against Sinti and Roma does exist on the housing market. Both segregated and de-segregated Sinti and Roma communities can be found in Germany.
	Methodology	Semi-standardised expert interviews, qualitative assessment of legal and policy framework
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	-

	Title, author, source	Economic aspects of the situation of Roma women (Study requested by the European Parliament's committee on Women's Rights and Gender Equality); Faraco, C. (2006), 'Country Report Germany', in: Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (Berliner Institut für Vergleichende Sozialforschung) (ed.), Economic aspects of the condition of Roma women, Brussels, European Parliament: Policy Department Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs, pp. 18 – 29.
	Source and type	Non-governmental report
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	✓
	<i>Employment</i>	✓
	<i>Health</i>	✓
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	✓
	Sample	n. a.
	Location	Germany
	Target population	Roma Women
	Key findings	Specific disadvantages of Roma women: higher infant mortality rate and lower life expectancy than majority population; suffer from

		illiteracy and discrimination in the educational system. Low integration into the labour market, predominately engaged in domestic tasks. Women suffer especially from generally bad housing conditions, since they stay at home more often (childcare and care of the elderly). Participation in the political or public sphere seems insignificant. No special programmes exist regarding the gender-specific needs of Roma women.
	Methodology	Analysis of research in the respective countries' literature; analysis of numerical data; expert interviews
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	Non-representative analysis, only Roma women

	Title, author, source	Shadow Report. Provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women. Commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany; ERRC (European Roma Rights Center) and EUMAP (EU Monitoring and Advocacy Program) (2004), Joint Shadow Report provided to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commenting on the fifth periodic report of the Federal Republic of Germany submitted under article 18 of the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, Open Society Institute (OSI), available at: www.soros.org/sites/default/files/roma_shadow_20040121.pdf .
	Source and type	Non-governmental report
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	✓
	<i>Employment</i>	✓
	<i>Health</i>	✓
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	✓
	Sample	Researcher met with Sinti and Roma women and representatives and other members of Sinti and Roma communities
	Location	Germany
	Target population	Roma women
	Key findings	Many Sinti and Roma women and girls in Germany are at present de facto excluded from a range of protections guaranteed by the UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, notably in the areas of education, employment, health and participation in public and political life. Residence status of 'toleration' is a significant obstacle to improvement of their situation.
	Methodology	Qualitative analysis; desk review of existing literature; ten-day field mission → interviews
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	Only Roma women

	Title, author, source	Stigma Ethnizität. Wie zugewanderte Romafamilien der Ethnisierungsfalle begegnen; Jonuz, E. (2009), Stigma Ethnizität. Wie zugewanderte Romafamilien der Ethnisierungsfalle begegnen, Opladen, Budrich.
	Source and type	Non-governmental report
The mati	<i>Education</i>	
	<i>Housing</i>	

	<i>Employment</i>	
	<i>Health</i>	
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	✓
	Sample	Nine case studies of individual Roma biographies, evenly distributed on three different generations
	Location	Germany
	Target population	Roma refugees, Roma guest worker families
	Key findings	Comparison of integration mechanisms and processes of Roma refugees and Roma guest worker families: Findings support the theory that integration problems come from majority society, and are not related to the groups' culture.
	Methodology	Qualitative analysis: narrative interviews, biographical research
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	Case studies, only Roma refugees, Roma guest worker families

	Title, author, source	Integration unter Vorbehalt: Zur Situation von Kindern kosovarischer Roma, Ashkali und Ägypter in Deutschland und nach ihrer Rückführung in den Kosovo; Knaus, V. and Widmann, P. (2010), Integration unter Vorbehalt: Zur Situation von Kindern kosovarischer Roma, Ashkali und Ägypter in Deutschland und nach ihrer Rückführung in den Kosovo, Köln, Deutsches Komitee für UNICEF e.V.
	Source and type	Non-governmental report
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	✓
	<i>Employment</i>	✓
	<i>Health</i>	✓
	<i>Poverty</i>	✓
	<i>Migration</i>	✓
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	Germany: 63 interviews with refugee families and volunteers of different organisations and institutions; Kosovo:60 expert interviews with authorities, ministries, vestrymen, international decision-makers and NGOs in Kosovo 40 semi-structured depth-interviews with affected families returning from Germany to Kosovo in the last years 173 interviews (among them 116 children with an age between 0 and 18 years)
	Location	Berlin, Münster, Gronau, Stuttgart, Magdeburg, Halle; Kosovo
	Target population	Tolerated Kosovan Roma, Ashali and Egyptian
	Key findings	The government does not focus on the well-being of children of tolerated refugees. The integration of children and young persons might be improved by changing the legal and financial situation. Deported children are less likely to be well integrated in Kosovo; they often drop out of school after deportation. Furthermore, deportation goes along with enormous costs for everyone.
	Methodology	Qualitative analysis, expert interviews, semi-structured interview, document analysis, basic research study
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	Non-representative analysis, only for children of Kosovan Roma, Ashali and Egyptian

	Title, author, source	Soziale Konstruktion und Diskriminierung von Sinti und Roma; Koch, U. (2010), 'Soziale Konstruktion und Diskriminierung von Sinti und Roma', in: Hormel, U. and Scherr A. (eds.): Diskriminierung: Grundlagen und Forschungsergebnisse. VS Verlag, Wiesbaden, pp. 255-278.
	Source and type	Non-governmental report
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	
	<i>Housing</i>	
	<i>Employment</i>	
	<i>Health</i>	
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	
	Location	
	Target population	
	Key findings	The article assesses the impact of the construction of the term "Roma and Sinti" on discriminatory attitudes and behaviour toward the minority group. The overall shared understanding of Roma and Sinti is affected by the ways the term of this minority group is constructed and filled with social content. Further, policy measures are affected by this understanding. Still, research on this topic is rare.
	Methodology	
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	

	Title, author, source	Monitoring - Report des Europäischen Zentrums für Antiziganismusforschung: Politische Partizipation von Sinti und Roma in der Bundesrepublik Deutschland; Knudsen, M., Robel, Y. and T. Adam (2005), Politische Partizipation von Sinti und Roma in der Bundesrepublik Deutschland, Hamburg.
	Source and type	Non-governmental report
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	
	<i>Housing</i>	
	<i>Employment</i>	
	<i>Health</i>	
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	✓
	Sample	85 questionnaires were distributed to political parties; 37 questionnaires to Sinti and Roma organisations
	Location	Germany
	Target population	German Sinti and Roma
	Key findings	Passive political participation of German Sinti and Roma are estimated relatively high whereas there is no data concerning the active political participation
	Methodology	Quantitative surveys and few narrative interviews
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	Non-representative survey, extreme low response rate

	Title, author, source	Roma-Statusbericht: Entwicklung der Zuzüge von EU-Unionsbürger aus Südosteuropa; Germany, Bezirksamt Neukölln von Berlin – Abteilung Bildung, Schule, Kultur und Sport (2012), 2. Roma-Statusbericht: Entwicklung der Zuzüge von EU-Unionsbürger aus Südosteuropa: Berlin – Neukölln, Berlin.
	Source and type	governmental
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	✓
	<i>Employment</i>	✓
	<i>Health</i>	✓
	<i>Poverty</i>	✓
	<i>Migration</i>	
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	-
	Location	Berlin - Neukölln
	Target population	Roma in Neukölln
	Key findings	38.7% of the population in Berlin Neukölln have a migration background. The proportion of pupils from Bulgaria and Romania increased since 2010. More teachers and mediators who command the language of migrant Roma and with knowledge about their culture are necessary in order to prepare them for regular education classes. Roma often live in rundown houses and have problems to find an apartment on the open housing market because of discrimination.
	Methodology	Administrative data on the local level, qualitative information provided by Roma organisations
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	Only local in a city district (Neu-Kölln) in Berlin, only migrant Roma newcomers from Bulgaria and Rumania

	Title, author, source	Deutsche Zustände Gruppenbezogene Menschenfeindlichkeit (GMF); Heitmeyer, W. (ed.) (2012), Deutsche Zustände: Folge 10, Berlin.
	Source and type	Non-governmental
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	
	<i>Housing</i>	
	<i>Employment</i>	
	<i>Health</i>	
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	23,000 respondents, 2,000 per year
	Location	Germany
	Target population	Migrants, minority, etc.
	Key findings	The result of the longitudinal survey Gruppenbezogene Menschenfeindlichkeit (Group-focussed Enmity; GMF) conducted by the Interdisciplinary Institute for Conflict and Violence Research (IKG, University of Bielefeld) show a persistently high level, but also a slightly decreasing trend of negative attitudes towards minorities and migrants. In 2011 40.1% of the interviewees ‘rather’ ‘fully’ agreed that they would have a problem with Sinti and Roma staying in their neighbourhood. 27.7% of the interviewees fully or rather support the statement that Sinti and Roma should be relegated out of city centres. 44.2% fully or rather agree that Sinti and Roma are prone to criminality.
	Methodology	Longitudinal survey, quantitative

	Representativeness, transferability of findings	Representative attitude survey
--	--	--------------------------------

	Title, author, source	Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma- Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020; Kollberg, B. and Strauß, D. (2012), Ergänzungsbericht von Vertreter/innen der Roma-Zivilgesellschaft und anderer Interessenträger und Expert/innen zum Bericht der Bundesrepublik Deutschland an die Europäische Kommission zum EU-Rahmen für Nationale Strategien zur Integration der Roma bis 2020, 12 March 2012.
	Source and type	Non-governmental
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	✓
	<i>Employment</i>	✓
	<i>Health</i>	✓
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	50 Roma representatives and organisation, experts on Roma and Sinti in Germany
	Location	Germany
	Target population	German Sinti and Roma, Roma migrants
	Key findings	Sinti and Roma do not have the same opportunities than other citizens. Programmes for education, employment, health and housing support for Sinti and Roma families are necessary.
	Methodology	Quantitative survey
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	-

	Title, author, source	EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers; Schmitt, A., Bytyci, H., Heine, W. (2011), EUROCITIES report: The Berlin mobile contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma from the perspective of the service providers, EUROCITIES.
	Source and type	Non-governmental
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	✓
	<i>Employment</i>	
	<i>Health</i>	✓
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	n.a.
	Location	Berlin - Neukölln
	Target population	Roma newcomers from Rumania and Bulgaria
	Key findings	The contact point for EU migrant workers and Roma represents one of the first steps by the Berlin Senate to acknowledge the new wave of Roma migrants in the city. The success of the Berlin contact point in outreach to and support of clients affirms the city of Berlin's approach

		to draw on civil society and community resources in service delivery.
	Methodology	Needs analysis, qualitative interviews with expert and clients interviews
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	Only local in a city district (Neu-Kölln) in Berlin, only migrant Roma newcomers from Bulgaria and Rumania

	Title, author, source	Sinti und Roma in der Schule – die Meinung von Lehrerinnen und Lehrern; Mengersen, O. (2012), Sinti und Roma in der Schule – die Meinung von Lehrerinnen und Lehrern, in: Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (ed.), Gleichberechtigte Teilhabe für Sinti und Roma in Deutschland, Heidelberg.
	Source and type	governmental
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	
	<i>Employment</i>	
	<i>Health</i>	
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	400 schools were contacted, 3200 questionnaires were distributed, 397 questionnaires returned
	Location	Germany
	Target population	German Sinti and Roma, migrant Roma
	Key findings	The topic ‘Sinti and Roma’ is not a major issue in German secondary schools. Pupils and teachers do not know much about the topic but show interest in the topic.
	Methodology	Quantitative survey, standardised questionnaire
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	Representative survey

	Title, author, source	Sinti und Schule. Woran Bildungskarrieren scheitern; Frese, J. (2011). Sinti und Schule. Woran Bildungskarrieren scheitern, Marburg, Tectum Verlag.
	Source and type	Non-governmental
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	✓
	<i>Housing</i>	
	<i>Employment</i>	
	<i>Health</i>	
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	52 interviews with 65 persons (35 teachers, 18 Sinti, 3 Roma, 9 others)
	Location	Bad Hersfeld, Germany
	Target population	German Sinti
	Key findings	Sinti are inadequately integrated in schools and in the society in Bad Hersfeld. Sinti have hardly any contact to Non-Sinti. To change school situation of Sinti, a change of their life situation is necessary.
	Methodology	Statistical analysis about school attendance rate, days of absences and school-leaving qualifications of Sinti visiting schools in Bad Hersfeld, qualitative interviews
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	Only on the local level

	findings	
--	-----------------	--

	Title, author, source	Minderheiten in Deutschland. Sinti und Roma als Bürger dieses Staates. Eine Minderheit zwischen politischer Anerkennung und alltäglicher Diskriminierung; Becker, K.E. (Hg.) (2011), Minderheiten in Deutschland. Worms, Worms-Verlag.
	Source and type	Non-governmental
Thematic area	<i>Education</i>	
	<i>Housing</i>	
	<i>Employment</i>	
	<i>Health</i>	
	<i>Poverty</i>	
	<i>Migration</i>	
	<i>Active citizenship</i>	
	Sample	
	Location	Germany
	Target population	
	Key findings	Sinti and Roma experience discrimination in Germany. They often do not disclose their identity because they fear that this may affect their opportunities at school and access to the labour market.
	Methodology	-
	Representativeness, transferability of findings	-

5. Roma networks

Type of Associations, Organisations, NGOs	Name of Organisation	Email/Website	Roma involvement	Main area of expertise
NGO	Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma (Central Council of German Sinti and Roma)	http://zentralrat.sintiundroma.de/	<i>Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma</i> is a Roma political organisation for the rights of Roma and Sinti in Germany. It brings together nine federal states associations and several regional organizations, as well as the Documentary and Cultural Centre of German Roma and Sinti.	Anti-discrimination Culture Political Participation
NGO	Verband deutscher Sinti und Roma – Landesverbände (Association of German Sinti and Roma – Federal States Associations)	www.sinti-roma-bayern.de ; www.sinti-roma-bawue.de ; www.vdsr-rlp.de ; www.sinti-roma-hessen.de ; www.sintiundroma-nrw.de ; www.sinti-roma-berlin.de	Aside from the <i>Zentralrat deutscher Sinti und Roma</i> on the federal level, respective member organisations of the <i>Zentralrat</i> exist at the level of the federal states (<i>Länder</i>): Such <i>Landesverbände</i> do <u>not</u> exist in Thuringia, Saxony, Saxony-Anhalt, Schleswig-Holstein, Mecklenburg-Vorpommern and Lower Saxony.	Anti-discrimination Culture Political Participation
Non-governmental	Documentation and Cultural Centre of German Sinti and Roma	www.sintiundroma.de/index/	The Centre works for the documentation and remembrance of the Roma persecution during the national-socialist time. It is part of the <i>Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma</i> .	Awareness Raising
NGO	Amaro Drom e.V	www.amarodrom.de/	Amaro Drom is a Roma youth organization.	Youth Education Culture
NGO	Förderverein Roma e.V. (Association of Roma e.V.)	www.foerderevereinroma.de/	Förderverein Roma is an association for Roma culture and awareness rising in Frankfurt am Main. The association aims to combat discrimination and to provide a platform for dialogue between Roma and Non-Roma	Education Culture Anti-discrimination
NGO	Rom e.V.	www.romev.de/	Rom e.V is an intercultural association in Köln, which is engaged in promoting basic rights of Roma. It further aims to combat racism and to support Roma culture..	Education Employment Healthcare Housing Culture Anti-discrimination Migration, etc.
NGO	Sinti Allianz Deutschland e. V. (<i>Sinti Alliance Germany</i>)	www.sintiallianz-deutschland.de/	Sinti Allianz Deutschland is an umbrella organisation for nine independent Sinti organisations as well as for the Lowara-Tribe. The Alliance tries to establish a lobby for the interests of tribes, clans and associations of German Sinti, who seek to maintain their traditional social and cultural order.	Anti-discrimination Culture Political Participation
NGO	Sinti Union Rheinland-Pfalz e.V. (<i>Sinti Union of Rhineland-Palatinate</i>)	www.sintiunionrheinaldpfalz.de/index.html	The Sinti Union Rheinland-Pfalz e.V. aims to maintain the culture of Sinti, to support a dialogue between Sinti and majority population and to engage themselves politically for the interests of Sinti.	Culture Political Participation
NGO	Verein der katholischen Roma e.V. (<i>Association of Catholic Roma</i>)	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
NGO	Verein zur Förderung von Kultur und Handwerk, Sinti-Werkstatt Landau e.V. (<i>Association for the Promotion of Culture and Craft, Sinti Workshop Landau</i>)	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
NGO	Niedersächsischer Verband Deutscher Sinti e.V. (<i>Association of Lower-Saxony</i>)	www.sinti-niedersachsen.de/nvds	The association provides legal and social counselling and supports beneficiaries in the realization of compensation claims concerning crimes from the national-socialist	Social Integration

	<i>for German Sinti)</i>	-ueber-uns	past.	Anti-discrimination
NGO	Verein Projekt Roma Center Göttingen e.V. (<i>Association Project Roma Center Göttingen</i>)		The association supports the cultural, social and humanitarian activities of Roma and other refugees from the former Yugoslavia.	Culture Social Youth Integration Religion
NGO	Roma Elternverein Berlin (REB) – „Bashe Rroma“ e.V. (<i>Roma Parents' Association Berlin – „Bashe Rroma“</i>)	Bashe.rroma@gmx.de	n.a.	Education
NGO	Südost Europa Kultur e.V. in Berlin (<i>Association for South-East Europe Culture in Berlin</i>)	www.suedost-ev.de	The association connects psycho-social work with cultural activities and social commitment. Main areas of interest are integration through consultation, education and employment.	Integration Education Support Consultation
NGO	Subway e.V. – Straßensozialarbeit für junge Roma (<i>Association Subway- Street worker for young Roma</i>)	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
NGO	Internationale Liga für Menschenrechte e.V. – Sinti und Roma Ausschuss (<i>International League for Human Rights – Committee for Roma and Sinti</i>)	www.ilmr.de	Ilmr fights against institutional and structural racism and discrimination within state and society.	Political Participation Culture Anti-discrimination
NGO	Romano Drom Verein zur Vertretung der Interessen der in Sachsen-Anhalt lebenden Roma e.V.	romanodrom@hotmail.de	The association sees itself as a lobby for the Roma living in Saxony-Anhalt. They aim to maintain the culture and language of Roma.	Culture Political Participation
NGO	Roma-Union Frankfurt/Main e.V. (<i>Roma Union Frankfurt/Main</i>)	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
NGO	„Amari Bacht“ e.V. – Roma-Sinti Beratungs- und Informationsbüro (<i>Association „Amari Bacht“ – Roma-Sinti Consultation and Information Office</i>)	Roma-sinti-amari-bacht@arcor.de	n.a.	Consultation
NGO	Roma und Cinti Union e.V.	n. a.	n. a.	n. a.
NGO	Katholische Seelsorge für Roma, Sinti & verwandte Gruppen (<i>Catholic Pastoral Care for Roma, Sinti and related Groups</i>)	www.ksfrs.de/	The association focuses on pastoral care for Roma and Sinti..	Pastoral care Culture Consultation Help in emergency situations Education and training
NGO	Roma-Union Grenzland e.V. (Aachen)	Ru-grnzland@euroment.com	n.a.	n.a.
NGO	Roma Registrierungs- und Dokumentationszentrum e.V.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
NGO	Projektbüro zur Förderung von Roma-Initiativen e.V. (<i>Project Office for the Support of Roma Initiatives</i>)	hheusspro@aol.com	n.a.	n.a.
NGO	Göttinger Beratungsstelle für Sinti und Roma e.V. (<i>Counselling Centre for Sinti and Roma in Göttingen</i>)	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
NGO	Romane Aglonipe – Roma aus Niedersachsen e.V.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
NGO	Philharmonischer Verein der Sinti und	www.foerderevereinro	The association promotes the musical heritage of Sinti and Roma.	Culture

	Roma e.V. Frankfurt am Main (<i>Philharmonic Association of Sinti and Roma in Frankfurt am Main</i>)	ma.de/philharm/faltblatt.htm		Music
Non-governmental	Rroma Aether Klub Theater	www.rromaakt.de/	The theatre carries out different events relating to Roma issues. For example, plays, readings, concerts and exhibitions.	Culture
Non-governmental	Theater TKO Köln		The theatre deals with current topics of the society. One main focus of the theatre is the Roma topic.	Culture
Non-governmental	Arbeitskreis der Roma-Lehrer und – Sozialarbeiter (<i>Working Group Roma Teachers and Social Workers</i>)	b.kruehler@t-online.de	The working group is a focal contact point for people working with Sinti and Roma.	Education Culture Awareness rising
Non-governmental	RomNews Network	http://romnews.com/	The RomNews Network provides links concerning Roma.	Information Networking
University institution	Pädagogisches Büro nationaler Minderheiten: Sinti und Roma (<i>Pedagogical Office for national Minorities: Sinti and Roma</i>)	www.staff.uni-marburg.de/~sewering/	The pedagogical office provides information for teachers about the history and present of Sinti and Roma. It aims to decrease the lack of knowledge and stereotypes about Roma and Sinti in the long term..	Education Culture Awareness rising
Research institute	Europäisches Zentrum für Antiziganismusforschung (<i>European Centre for Antiziganism Research</i>)	www.ezaf.org	The scientific institution analyses anti-ziganistic attitudes and behaviour.	Culture Research
Institute	Institut für Lehrerfortbildung – Pädagogik mit Roma und Sinti (<i>Institute for Teacher Training – Pedagogy with Roma and Sinti</i>)	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Governmental	Städtischer Sozialdienst für Sinti und Roma Düsseldorf (<i>Social Municipal Service for Sinti and Roma in Düsseldorf</i>)	Ru-dolf.kosthorst@stadt.duesseldorf.de	n.a.	n.a.
Governmental	Landeskirchenamt – Arbeitskreis Sinti und Roma (<i>Regional Church Office – Working Group Sinti and Roma</i>)	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
NGO	KAROLA Internationaler Treffpunkt für Frauen und Mädchens e.V. (<i>KAROLA Association: International Meeting Place for Women and Girls</i>)	www.karola-hamburg.de/cms/	Karola is a women association for culture located in Hamburg. The organization provides consultations and learning programmes for women with migration backgrounds and for Roma women in particular.	Women Culture Migration Education Employment Housing
NGO	Gesellschaft für bedrohte Völker in Göttingen (<i>Society for Threatened Peoples in Göttingen</i>)	www.gfbv.de	The association stands for human rights all over the world and helps threatened minorities.	Human Rights Culture Minority issues
NGO	Antirassistisch-Interkulturelles Informationszentrum Berlin e.V. (ARiC) (Anti-racist – Intercultural Information Centre)	www.aric.de/	The association works for equal treatment of minority groups and against discrimination. The aim is to support the intercultural dialogue.	Culture Consulting Networking Information
NGO	Regionale Arbeitsstellen für Bildung, Integration und Demokratie (RAA) Berlin e.V. (<i>Regional Office for Education, Integration and Democracy in Berlin</i>)	www.raa-berlin.de	RAA is an association that provides consultation, training and education for beneficiaries. It further supports integration of minorities, like Roma.	Education Integration

