

Contribution to the Focus chapter of the Fundamental Rights Report 2022: Social rights and equality in light of the recovery from the COVID- 19 pandemic.

**Poland
January 2022**

Contractor: Helsinki Foundation for Human Rights

Authors: Maciej Kalisz, Filip Bakierski

DISCLAIMER: This document was commissioned under contract as background material for comparative analysis by the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA) for the project '*Social rights and equality in light of the recovery from the COVID-19 pandemic*'. The information and views contained in the document do not necessarily reflect the views or the official position of the FRA. The document is made publicly available for transparency and information purposes only and does not constitute legal advice or legal opinion.

Contents

1	Measures implemented to foster social rights and equal treatment in the recovery from the pandemic	3
1.a.	3
1.b.	5
1.c.	8
2	Tools or mechanisms to monitor the effectiveness of national schemes to foster social rights and equal treatment in the recovery from the pandemic.....	12

1 Measures implemented to foster social rights and equal treatment in the recovery from the pandemic

1.a.

Name of the measure in English	Support for co-financing programmes for childcare facilities intended for children aged 0-3 within the framework of the MALUCH+ programme
Name of the measure in the national language(s)	Wsparcie programów dofinansowania miejsc opieki nad dziećmi w wieku 0-3 lat w ramach programu MALUCH+
Reference document for the measure <i>Include an url, where available</i>	Document of the Polish National Recovery Plan (<i>Krajowy Plan Odbudowy i Zwiększania Odporności</i>), pp. 151-152. https://www.gov.pl/attachment/2572ae63-c981-4ea9-a734-689c429985cf
Social rights covered by the measure <i>Delete as appropriate</i> <i>Multiple answers possible, but preference should be given to measures that apply to one discrete right</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Right to education (Article 14) - Equality between women and men (Article 23) - Right to social security and social assistance (Article 34)
Population group(s) covered by the measure <i>Delete as appropriate</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Children aged 0-3, including children with disabilities and children requiring special assistance - Parents - Caretakers

<p><i>Multiple answers possible, but preference should be given to measures that apply to discrete population groups</i></p>	
<p>Summary description of how the measure applies to the population group(s)</p>	<p>The MALUCH + programme was initiated by the Ministry of Family and Social Policy in 2011. By this programme, local government units as well as private entities may obtain funds from the Ministry to create childcare places for children up to 3 years of age. Each year, the Ministry awards funds to entities that meet certain criteria.</p> <p>Due to the pandemic, the government decided to extend the existing scope of the MALUCH + programme by allocating EU funds for this purpose.</p> <p>The measure addresses two main problems pertaining to childcare facilities (including kindergartens, children’s clubs and daytime caretakers): the lack of such facilities in almost 60% local communities in Poland (as of 2019) and high fees for using them. Its activities will comprise co-financing the costs of creating or adjusting places in which daytime childcare should take place.</p> <p>The measure aims at providing free childcare for children aged 0-3, which should enable their parents to take up a job without a necessity of incurring additional expenses (namely, the fee for placing their children in private facilities). The measure’s second expected result is the improvement of professional activity of women since in Poland it is traditionally expected from mothers to take care of their children in their youngest years, which often forces women to quit their jobs or prevents them from seeking employment.</p>
<p>Summary description of how the measure will impact (positively or negatively) social rights and equal treatment in the recovery</p>	<p>Thanks to being provided with free childcare in public facilities, parents who cannot afford placing their children in a private facility will not be obliged to quit their jobs in order to take care of their children during the working day. This measure is also intended to facilitate the return to the labour market for those parents who have lost their jobs as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic.</p>

	Moreover, the measure also aims at improving the professional skills of the personnel involved in childcare. According to the plan, such employees are to be trained in the field of sensory integration, speech therapy, psychological support of the children, rehabilitation and first aid.
Summary description of the extent to which the measure foresees the provision of enabling social services	This measure does not foresee integrated public service provision or integrated private service provision.
Entity or organisation responsible to implement the measure	The Ministry of Family and Social Policy
Duration of the measure	Q1 2021 – Q2 2026
Budget allocated to implement the measure	EUR 381.000.000,00 PLN 1.741.170.000,00
Summary description of how any foreseen impact assessment of the measure will be carried out	There is no specific information in the National Recovery Plan with regard to carrying out a foreseen impact assessment of this measure. This measure will be assessed in line with the general rules foreseen for the other measures, e.g. by conducting the audit described in Part II of the report.

1.b.

Name of the measure in English	Investments related to the modernisation and retrofitting of teaching facilities in connection with increasing the admission limits for medical studies
---------------------------------------	---

Name of the measure in the national language(s)	Inwestycje związane z modernizacją i doposażeniem obiektów dydaktycznych w związku ze zwiększeniem limitów przyjęć na studia medyczne
Reference document for the measure <i>Include an url, where available</i>	Document of the Polish National Recovery Plan (<i>Krajowy Plan Odbudowy i Zwiększania Odporności</i>), pp. 280-285. https://www.gov.pl/attachment/2572ae63-c981-4ea9-a734-689c429985cf
Social rights covered by the measure <i>Delete as appropriate</i> <i>Multiple answers possible, but preference should be given to measures that apply to one discrete right</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Right to education (Article 14) - Right of access to preventive health care and to benefit from medical treatment (Article 35)
Population group(s) covered by the measure <i>Delete as appropriate</i> <i>Multiple answers possible, but preference should be given to measures that apply to discrete population groups</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Students - Patients - Staff of medical universities
Summary description of how the measure applies to the population group(s)	Between 2016 and 2020 the admission limits at medical universities were being gradually raised, which eventually resulted in reaching the upper ceiling of their possibilities. The growing need for medical workers requires development of teaching and clinical potential of medical universities, also considering the specificity of teaching process in times of the pandemic (in particular, the practical classes).

	<p>As a result of the implemented measure, the number of students of medical universities will be increased (it is planned to increase the admission limit by 1000 persons annually). This measure will also provide a number of privileges for people interested in taking up medical studies, such as:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. provision of student loans on preferential terms, 2. co-financing of education at private universities, 3. scholarships, 4. mentoring programmes. <p>There are also special solutions provided in this measure for the academic staff of medical universities. It is assumed that medical university staff will be trained in the field of soft skills; a new incentive system is also to be introduced.</p> <p>Finally, the availability of health care will be significantly improved - in particular, the latency time for medical care is to be shortened, what is actually the main problem of the Polish health service system.</p>
<p>Summary description of how the measure will impact (positively or negatively) social rights and equal treatment in the recovery</p>	<p>The overarching goal of this measure is to increase the availability of health care. The pandemic has highlighted significant shortages in medical personnel. Due to the abovementioned deficiencies, there were numerous so-called excess deaths during the pandemic. One of the reasons for the low number of students of medical universities is the high cost of their education.</p> <p>This measure also aims at adapting medical education to the limitations caused by the COVID-19 pandemic. In this regard, remote education of medical students is acutely problematic. For this reason, it is of utter importance to implement a new comprehensive didactic offer based on a digital platform, allowing the organisation of the didactic process with the use of digital technologies.</p> <p>In order to achieve the abovementioned goals, it is also necessary to properly train the staff of medical universities.</p>

Summary description of the extent to which the measure foresees the provision of enabling social services	This measure does not foresee integrated public service provision or integrated private service provision.
Entity or organisation responsible to implement the measure	- The Ministry of Health - Medical universities
Duration of the measure	Q2 2021 – Q3 2026
Budget allocated to implement the measure	EUR 700.000.000,00 PLN 3.199.000.000,00
Summary description of how any foreseen impact assessment of the measure will be carried out	At the end of the financial support programme intended for students, a special analysis will be carried out. The results of this analysis will be crucial for the decision on the continuation of this support. There is no more specific information in the National Recovery Plan about carrying out a foreseen impact assessment of this measure. This measure will be assessed in line with the general rules foreseen for the other measures, e.g. by conducting the audit described in Part II of the report.

1.c.

Name of the measure in English	Equalisation of the equipment of schools in portable multimedia devices
---------------------------------------	---

Name of the measure in the national language(s)	Wyrównanie poziomu wyposażenia szkół w przenośne urządzenia multimedialne
Reference document for the measure <i>Include an url, where available</i>	Document of the Polish National Recovery Plan (<i>Krajowy Plan Odbudowy i Zwiększania Odporności</i>), pp. 228-232. https://www.gov.pl/attachment/2572ae63-c981-4ea9-a734-689c429985cf
Social rights covered by the measure <i>Delete as appropriate</i> <i>Multiple answers possible, but preference should be given to measures that apply to one discrete right</i>	- Right to education (Article 14)
Population group(s) covered by the measure <i>Delete as appropriate</i> <i>Multiple answers possible, but preference should be given to measures that apply to discrete population groups</i>	- Children and youth
Summary description of how the measure applies to the population group(s)	The main objective of this measure is providing support for digitalization of education process by equipping schools with modern multimedia devices (e.g. laptops) for students' and teachers' personal use.

	<p>The availability of modern multimedia equipment in Polish schools is at a very different level. The situation is similar with regard to digital literacy of teachers employed in these schools.</p> <p>Taking the abovementioned into consideration, it is necessary to align the level of access to digital equipment in education system, in particular by facilitating students' access to new technologies. These inequalities have been significantly emphasized by the introduction of remote education in times of the COVID-19 pandemic.</p>
<p>Summary description of how the measure will impact (positively or negatively) social rights and equal treatment in the recovery</p>	<p>As mentioned above, the availability of modern multimedia equipment in Polish schools is at a very different level. In particular, schools in smaller towns have problems with access to new technologies - this leads to an unequal access to education. As a result of this measure, the access to new technologies in schools is to be unified in order to minimise these inequalities. The remote learning caused by the pandemic has highlighted inequalities in access to education due to the lack of multimedia equipment in schools. The anticipated continuation of remote learning makes it necessary to immediately provide schools with modern equipment in order to minimize the gaps in access to education.</p> <p>This measure is to be nationwide. Its beneficiaries will be schools and other educational institutions.</p> <p>This measure also aims at adapting the conditions of conducting classes in schools to remote learning enforced by the pandemic. It is worth noting that students will be allowed to rent the multimedia equipment delivered to schools for the purposes of remote learning.</p>
<p>Summary description of the extent to which the measure foresees the provision of enabling social services</p>	<p>This measure does not foresee integrated public service provision or integrated private service provision.</p>
<p>Entity or organisation responsible to implement the measure</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Chancellery of the Prime Minister - The Ministry of Education and Science - Digital Poland – Centre of Projects (<i>Centrum Projektów Polska Cyfrowa</i>)

	- NASK National Research Institute (Naukowa i Akademicka Sieć Komputerowa - Państwowy Instytut Badawczy)
Duration of the measure	Q3 2021 – Q2 2026
Budget allocated to implement the measure	EUR 550.000.000,00 PLN 2.513.000.000,00
Summary description of how any foreseen impact assessment of the measure will be carried out	<p>This programme has two main measurable objectives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the number of students per computer in primary and secondary schools should be decreased from 10 to 9; - the percentage of teachers with access to an office laptop should be increased from 20% to 90%. <p>Upon completion of the measure, an analysis of the achievement of the abovementioned objectives will be carried out.</p> <p>There is no more specific information in the National Recovery Plan about carrying out a foreseen impact assessment of this measure. This measure will be assessed in line with the general rules foreseen for the other measures, e.g. by conducting the audit described in Part II of the report.</p>

2 Tools or mechanisms to monitor the effectiveness of national schemes to foster social rights and equal treatment in the recovery from the pandemic

Name of the monitoring tool or mechanism in English	Audit of the National Recovery Plan
Name of the monitoring tool or mechanism in the national language(s)	Audyt Krajowego Planu Odbudowy
Reference document for the monitoring tool or mechanism <i>Include an url, where available</i>	Document of the Polish National Recovery Plan (<i>Krajowy Plan Odbudowy i Zwiększania Odporności</i>) – pp. 483-485. https://www.gov.pl/attachment/2572ae63-c981-4ea9-a734-689c429985cf

<p>Organisation(s) involved in the monitoring tool or mechanism</p> <p><i>Delete as appropriate</i></p> <p><i>Multiple answers possible</i></p>	<p>National authorities:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Head of the National Treasury Administration (<i>Szef Krajowej Administracji Skarbowej</i>), 2. Heads of the Tax Administration Chambers (<i>Dyrektorzy Izb Administracji Skarbowej</i>), 3. Public Funds Audit Department at the Ministry of Finance (Departament Audytu Środków Publicznych w Ministerstwie Finansów)
<p>Summary description of how these organisation(s) are involved in the monitoring tool or mechanism</p>	<p>The abovementioned authorities are independent of the units participating in the implementation of the National Recovery Plan. There are no extraordinary mechanisms dedicated to control spending of the National Recovery Plan funds. These authorities will carry out the audit in accordance with the provisions of the Act on the National Treasury Administration (<i>Ustawa o Krajowej Administracji Skarbowej</i>). As the government has emphasized, these authorities have been controlling the spending of public funds effectively for many years. Thus, they already have the experience necessary to carry out tasks related to the control of investments and financial reforms with National Recovery Plan.</p> <p>The National Recovery Plan does not foresee any particular role for other actors, e.g. the Ombudsperson or NGOs, within the audit process.</p>
<p>Summary description of the functioning of the tool or mechanism used to monitor the effectiveness of schemes adopted to foster social rights and equal treatment in the recovery</p>	<p>The audit will be conducted on the basis of an audit strategy approved by the Head of the National Treasury Administration. The audit strategy will be prepared within 3 months of the approval of the National Recovery Plan – it will be reviewed annually and updated if necessary. The frequency of audits will be adjusted to the system of submitting payment claims to the European Commission. The strategy will be the basis for adopting detailed audit programmes.</p> <p>The strategy will define the most important assumptions of the audit, in particular:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • scope of the audit, • status of the entities responsible for the audit, • audit methodology, evaluation criteria and risk factors, <p>Two types of audit are envisaged:</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • audit of investments or reforms - the purpose of this mechanism is to verify the achievement of the declared milestones and goals, • system audit (including IT system security audit) - the purpose of this tool is to obtain rational assurance that the system functions effectively, prevents, detects and corrects errors and irregularities. <p>Employees of organizational units of the National Treasury Administration, performing the tasks of the Head of the National Treasury Administration in the field of the National Recovery Plan audit, will have access to data collected in the IT systems used to support the National Recovery Plan.</p>
<p>Summary description of the obligations, standards and benchmarks against which the effectiveness will be evaluated</p>	<p>The audit will be carried out in accordance with international auditing standards. These pertain in particular to standards issued by the Institute of Internal Auditors and the International Federation of Accountants.</p> <p>The audit of the National Recovery Plan will be performed out on the terms applicable to audits of national operational programmes, pursuant to the provisions of the Act on the National Treasury Administration.</p>
<p>Summary description of what the tool or mechanism foresees when non-compliance with obligations and standards is identified, with a particular emphasis on enforcement and remedial action</p>	<p>In the event of the disclosure of non-compliance with obligations and standards provided for this mechanisms, the relevant provisions of the Act on the National Treasury Administration will be applied. The abovementioned authorities will prepare a report on each audit carried out as a part of the expenditure of the National Recovery Plan funds control. Within 14 days from the delivery of the report, each inspected entity is authorized to raise its justified objections.</p> <p>The report with audit documentation may be also submitted to:</p>

	<p>1) bodies or administrators of the budget and entities exercising supervision or control over the activities of the auditee;</p> <p>2) authorities of the European Union;</p> <p>3) authorities entitled on the basis of international agreements binding for the Republic of Poland;</p> <p>4) representatives of other countries in the scope of the implementation of joint programmes financed with funds from the budget of the European Union.</p> <p>Within 3 months from the date of delivery of the report, the inspected entity is obliged to notify the controlling authority about the way of using the information from the report or about the reasons for disregarding it.</p>
--	--

Name of the monitoring tool or mechanism in English	National Recovery Plan Monitoring Committee
Name of the monitoring tool or mechanism in the national language(s)	Komitet Monitorujący Krajowy Plan Odbudowy
Reference document for the monitoring tool or mechanism <i>Include an url, where available</i>	<p>Document of the Polish National Recovery Plan (<i>Krajowy Plan Odbudowy i Zwiększania Odporności</i>) – pp. 473-474.</p> <p>https://www.gov.pl/attachment/2572ae63-c981-4ea9-a734-689c429985cf</p>

<p>Organisation(s) involved in the monitoring tool or mechanism</p> <p><i>Delete as appropriate</i></p> <p><i>Multiple answers possible</i></p>	<p>The Committee will be composed of:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. institutions involved in the implementation of the NRP 2. representatives of the employers' unions 3. representatives of the nationwide NGOs 4. representatives of nationwide organizations of local government units <p>However, the NRP does not indicate exactly which entities will be involved in the Committee.</p>
<p>Summary description of how these organisation(s) are involved in the monitoring tool or mechanism</p>	<p>The powers of the Committee are defined in a very general terms. The NRP does not clarify the tasks of the Committee, nor specify whether it would be empowered to issue binding decisions.</p> <p>These organizations will be entitled to analyze the implementation of the NRP and 'issue recommendations' – these recommendations will not be binding. The Committee will be able to give opinions on the reports of individual units on the implementation of the NRP and submit them to the European Commission.</p> <p>Tasks and powers of the Committee are to be detailed on the basis of separate regulations; these regulations have not been issued yet.</p>
<p>Summary description of the functioning of the tool or mechanism used to monitor the effectiveness of schemes adopted to foster social rights and equal treatment in the recovery</p>	<p>The Committee will be particularly responsible for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • issuing opinions on reports on the implementation of the NRP and submitting them to the European Commission, • analyzing situations that affect the implementation of the NRP and indicating issues that require additional / extended analyzes or evaluations, • analyzing reports on the control of the implementation of reforms or investments, • issuing recommendations for institutions responsible for carrying out reforms or investments, in particular regarding the improvement of effectiveness in achieving their target values and milestones, including recommendations for corrective actions.

Summary description of the obligations, standards and benchmarks against which the effectiveness will be evaluated	<p>The evaluation standards have been defined in a general manner.</p> <p>The purpose of the Committee is to ensure that the EU funds will be 'spent properly'. The Committee will analyze the impact of implemented measures on the economy and its sectors, society and regional development. It has to ensure complementarity of interventions implemented under other funding sources, according to the thematic scope of the NRP.</p>
Summary description of what the tool or mechanism foresees when non-compliance with obligations and standards is identified, with a particular emphasis on enforcement and remedial action	<p>There are no such allowances provided for the Committee.</p>

Disclaimer:

The Polish NRP was approved by the Council of Ministers on April 30, 2021. However, as of the date of this report, the NRP has not yet been approved by the European Commission.